

1 **Exploring the role of the private sector in tuberculosis detection and management in Lima,**
2 **Peru: a mixed-methods patient pathway analysis**

3
4 Christoph Wipfel¹, Sheyla Farroñay², Hannah N. Gilbert¹, Ana Karina Millones², Diana Acosta²,
5 Isabel Torres², Judith Jimenez², Leonid Lecca^{1,2}, Courtney M. Yuen^{1,3*}

- 6
7 1. Department of Global Health and Social Medicine, Harvard Medical School, Boston,
8 MA, USA
9 2. Socios En Salud Sucursal Perú, Lima, Perú
10 3. Division of Global Health Equity, Brigham and Women's Hospital, Boston, MA, USA

11
12 *Corresponding author:

13 Courtney M. Yuen

14 Courtney_Yuen@hms.harvard.edu

15

16 **ABSTRACT**

17 In Latin America, little is known about the involvement of private healthcare providers in
18 TB detection and management. We sought to gain a better understanding of current and potential
19 roles of the private sector in delivering TB services in Peru. We conducted a mixed-methods
20 study in Lima, Peru. The quantitative component comprised a patient pathway analysis assessing
21 the alignment of TB services with patient care-seeking behavior. The qualitative component
22 comprised in-depth interviews with 18 private healthcare providers and 5 key informants. We
23 estimated that 77% of patients initially sought care at a facility with TB diagnostic capacity and
24 59% at a facility with TB treatment capacity. The lack of TB services at initial care-seeking
25 location was driven by the 41% of patients estimated to seek care first at a private facility.
26 Among private facilities, 43% offered smear microscopy, 13% offered radiography, and none
27 provided TB treatment. Among public sector facilities, 100% offered smear microscopy, 26%
28 offered radiography, and 99% provided TB treatment. Interviews revealed that private providers
29 believed that they offered shorter wait times and a quicker diagnosis, but they struggled with a
30 lack of follow-up systems and communication barriers with the public sector. While expressing
31 willingness to collaborate with public sector programs for diagnosis and referral, private
32 providers had limited interest in treating TB. This study highlights the role of private providers in
33 Peru as an entry point for TB care. Public-private collaboration is necessary to harness the
34 potential of the private sector as an ally for early diagnosis.

35 INTRODUCTION

36 Tuberculosis (TB) has once again surpassed COVID-19 to reclaim its position as the
37 world's deadliest infectious disease, responsible for approximately 1.6 million deaths in 2021.¹
38 Nearly one-third of all people with TB may not receive an accurate diagnosis and suitable care.¹
39 Limited access to healthcare services and insufficient means of detecting cases contribute to
40 delayed or missed diagnoses.² To ensure timely diagnosis for all patients, TB services must be
41 accessible where people with TB seek care.

42 Patient pathway analyses (PPA) from multiple countries revealed that a sizable portion of
43 people with TB seek care first in the private sector.³⁻⁷ After this initial care-seeking, many people
44 with TB visit multiple facilities, moving between private and public sectors, before receiving a
45 TB diagnosis.⁸⁻¹⁰ Despite the importance of the private sector in the pathway to diagnosis for
46 many people with TB, many national TB programs engage less with private providers than the
47 public healthcare system. Some PPA studies have revealed a lack of basic information on TB
48 diagnostic service availability in the private sector, as government regulatory agencies do not
49 comprehensively cover private facilities.^{3, 7, 11} Yet in Asia and Africa, engaging the private sector
50 has consistently been shown to increase TB case detection and improve treatment outcomes, and
51 various models for partnership exist.¹²

52 Despite private healthcare providers playing an increasingly significant role in healthcare
53 delivery in Latin American nations, the literature on the involvement of private healthcare
54 providers in TB detection and management for this region is limited. Studies from Mexico,
55 Nicaragua, and Peru have shown that substantial proportions of people with TB initially seek
56 care in private sector facilities.¹³⁻¹⁵ A study from Brazil found that a relatively small, albeit
57 growing, percentage of TB diagnostic tests were performed in the private sector.¹⁶ However,

58 among the 78 studies included in a systematic review of public-private partnership models for
59 TB,¹² only one originated from Latin America, and it focused on the involvement of private
60 pharmacies rather than private health facilities.¹⁷ We sought to gain a better understanding of
61 current and potential roles of the private sector in TB diagnosis and management in Peru. We
62 therefore carried out a mixed-methods study, combining the first TB PPA in a Latin American
63 country with a qualitative examination of private sector providers' perspective on their role in
64 TB care.

65

66 **MATERIALS AND METHODS**

67 We used a convergent mixed methods design. The quantitative component comprised a
68 PPA.¹⁸ Qualitative data was collected to elaborate, clarify and explain the quantitative results by
69 exploring the role of private healthcare providers in TB care. While the PPA encompasses all
70 sectors of the healthcare system, the qualitative data focus specifically on the private sector
71 because public sector TB services are in general better understood.^{15, 19, 20} Data were collected
72 between May and October 2022.

73

74 **Study setting**

75 Lima, the capital of Peru, is divided into four administrative regions that are each
76 overseen by a regional health authority of the Ministry of Health. This study was conducted in
77 the North Lima region, which comprises nine districts and a population of ~2.5 million. Peru's
78 public healthcare sector mainly comprises the Ministry of Health (MINSa) system, which serves
79 people with government insurance provided to those who lack other forms of insurance, and the
80 EsSalud system, which is affiliated with the Ministry of Labor, and which serves people with

81 employer-funded social insurance. The private sector provides services to people who pay out-
82 of-pocket or who possess private insurance. The Ministry of Health establishes national
83 healthcare standards, but it does not actively supervise EsSalud or the private sector.

84

85 **Patient Pathway Analysis (PPA)**

86 The study's quantitative component comprised a PPA, a standardized approach to
87 evaluate the alignment between care-seeking behavior and the TB services.¹⁸ Data on healthcare-
88 seeking behavior among people with TB was drawn from a previous study from Lima.¹⁵ Because
89 no information on TB service availability in the private sector was available, we conducted brief
90 surveys with providers working in private healthcare facilities about the availability of
91 radiography, smear microscopy, and TB treatment. For feasibility, we limited the surveys to
92 Carabayllo, one district of North Lima, and extrapolated the results to the other districts. We
93 obtained data on TB service availability in Ministry of Health facilities from the regional health
94 authority (DIRIS Lima Norte) and in the EsSalud network from their public websites. We used
95 World Health Organization TB incidence estimates for 2021¹ and data on 2021 TB notifications
96 and treatment outcomes for the 2019 and 2020 treatment cohorts from the National TB Program
97 portal;²¹ these data were only available at the national level, so we assumed that they applied to
98 North Lima.

99 To estimate the number of private sector facilities where a person with TB could seek
100 care, we obtained a list of all registered private healthcare facilities in North Lima from the
101 National Health Regulatory and Supervisory Agency (SUSALUD). We filtered the list to
102 categories that include general medical attention, then excluded those that provided only
103 specialist care (e.g. dental, psychological, ophthalmological). We visited the remaining

104 registered facilities in Carabayllo and determined how many were functioning. We used the ratio
105 of functioning to registered facilities to estimate the total number of functioning private facilities
106 in North Lima.

107 We categorized Ministry of Health facilities into primary care centers and hospitals. We
108 considered EsSalud and private sector facilities each as a single category because distinctions
109 between different types of facilities were not as standardized. Within each category, we
110 estimated *diagnostic coverage* of smear microscopy and radiography, defined as the proportions
111 of facilities with these capabilities; rapid molecular testing is not widespread in Peru. Combining
112 the published data on initial care seeking location with diagnostic coverage for each facility
113 category, we estimated the percentage of people with TB who had *diagnostic access at initial*
114 *care seeking*, defined as first seeking care at a facility offering either smear microscopy or
115 radiography. We used a similar approach to estimate *treatment coverage* (the proportion of
116 health facilities that TB treatment) and *treatment access at initial care seeking* (the proportion of
117 people who first sought care at a facility offering TB treatment). We estimated *notification*
118 *location* (the proportion of people with TB who were diagnosed and notified, by sector) by
119 combining national-level TB notification data with WHO's 2021 total TB incidence estimates.
120 We estimated *treatment outcome* (the proportion of people with TB who were successfully
121 treated) by applying treatment success rates for sensitive- and drug-resistant TB to the
122 corresponding notification numbers, and applying this overall treatment success rate to the
123 WHO's 2021 total TB incidence estimates.

124

125 **Qualitative data collection and analysis**

126 We recruited for interviews key informants who were knowledgeable about policies that
127 affect TB services in the private sector and healthcare providers working in the private sector in
128 North Lima. We used existing professional connections of the study team to recruit key
129 informants, which included representatives of the DIRIS Lima Norte, national-level Ministry of
130 Health, SUSALUD, and Socios En Salud, a non-profit non-government organization (NGO)
131 active in the field of TB care. We recruited private sector providers from among those who
132 completed the PPA survey. We purposively sampled an equal number of participants who
133 reported having diagnosed TB within the past year and those who had not. Because our PPA
134 survey sample had a limited number of providers who had diagnosed TB, we employed snowball
135 sampling to reach our initial target for interviews, requesting interviewees to refer other
136 information-rich private health providers practicing in North Lima for participation. In total, we
137 conducted 22 interviews involving 23 participants: 5 key informants, 12 private providers who
138 were a subset of the survey sample, and 6 additional private providers identified through
139 snowball sampling. Eight interview participants were female and 15 were male. All but two of
140 the private providers were medical doctors (one was a nurse, and one was a midwife). Ten
141 survey participants were not interested in being recruited for interviews, and no recruited
142 interview participants declined.

143 We conducted interviews using semi-structured interview guides (Supplementary File).
144 Interviews were conducted in Spanish by trained Peruvian nurse technicians (SF, DA, IT)
145 working for the NGO Socios En Salud, all of whom had experience in qualitative research. The
146 interviewers did not previously know the participants, except for one key informant who worked
147 for Socios En Salud in a different department. Interviews lasted 30–90 minutes. Three interviews
148 were conducted via videoconference and the rest in person. All interviews were audio recorded,

149 and a note-taker was present during each interview (either one of the other interviewers or CW, a
150 medical doctor).

151 Interview transcripts were created using artificial-intelligence-assisted software
152 (HappyScribe, Barcelona). Transcripts were checked and corrected by SF and CW. CW
153 translated the transcripts into English; SF provided knowledge about the local context to ensure
154 accurate translation. We employed a content analysis approach to data analysis.²² CW open-
155 coded a subset of high-quality transcripts, discussed the results with HNG (a medical
156 anthropologist) and CMY (an epidemiologist), and developed a final codebook with 34 codes.
157 CW coded the entire dataset using Dedoose v9.0.17 (SocioCultural Research Consultants LLC,
158 Los Angeles, CA). CW, HNG, and CMY analyzed the coded data using an inductive approach,
159 generating a preliminary set of descriptive categories, which were refined through iterative
160 examination. LL helped with interpretation.

161 We integrated quantitative and qualitative results by overlaying the qualitative insights
162 onto the PPA indicators using a joint display technique.²³ This approach allowed us to
163 understand how the private sector might serve as a facilitator or barrier to TB care at different
164 points along the patient pathway.

165

166 **Ethical considerations**

167 This study received approval from the Socios En Salud Institutional Research Ethics
168 Committee and was exempted by the Harvard Medical School Institutional Review Board. We
169 obtained verbal consent from survey respondents and written consent from interview
170 participants.

171

172 **RESULTS**

173 Figure 1 shows the quantitative PPA results and qualitative themes structured around the
174 main components of the patient pathway. Tables 1-3 show supporting quotes for qualitative
175 themes corresponding to components I through IV of the patient pathway illustrated in Figure 1.

176

177 **I. First contact with healthcare facility**

178 In North Lima in 2022, there were 1,687 registered private health facilities, of which we
179 estimated that 859 provided general medical services. In the district of Carabayllo, we were able
180 to find 26 functioning private facilities, compared to the 45 registered. Applying a similar ratio
181 throughout North Lima yielded an estimated 496 functioning private facilities. Public health
182 facilities in North Lima with general medical services included 100 Ministry of Health primary
183 care centers, 3 Ministry of Health hospitals, and 9 EsSalud facilities. A previous study from
184 Lima found that 41% of people with TB first sought care in the private sector, 31% at Ministry
185 of Health primary care centers, 26% at Ministry of Health hospitals, and 2% at EsSalud
186 facilities.¹⁵

187

188 *A. Lack of awareness of TB symptoms*

189 Private healthcare providers perceived that although the general population is aware that
190 treatment for TB is provided in public programs, people may not recognize their symptoms as
191 indicative of TB and therefore initially seek care in a private facility, which may be the nearest or
192 most convenient facility.

193

194 *B. Shorter wait times and quicker diagnosis*

195 Private healthcare providers viewed shorter wait times for appointments and during
196 healthcare visits, as well as being able to obtain diagnostic results faster as both reasons why
197 patients seek care in the private sector and the strength of their services. By providing patients
198 with earlier appointments, quicker test results, and more thorough consultations, private
199 providers believed that they could make a TB diagnosis sooner and thereby reduce delays to
200 treatment initiation compared to the public sector.

201

202 **II. Diagnostic process**

203 Providers from 23 of the 26 (88%) private facilities in Carabayllo agreed to take the
204 survey on TB service availability. Smear microscopy was offered in 43% of the surveyed private
205 facilities and 100% of Ministry of Health primary care centers, hospitals, and EsSalud facilities.
206 Radiography was offered at 13% of private facilities, 17% of Ministry of Health primary care
207 centers, and 100% of Ministry of Health hospitals and EsSalud facilities.

208

209 *A. Diagnostic procedures depend on patients' economic means*

210 Private providers believed that one of the strengths of the private sector is the ability to
211 arrive at a faster diagnosis in part because of the availability of more advanced technologies.
212 Collaborations with private laboratories and more advanced diagnostic technologies such as
213 MRI, CT scans, and GeneXpert in better-equipped facilities can promote faster diagnosis.
214 However, the accessibility of these services is dependent on the patient's financial means, as they
215 typically pay out-of-pocket. A key informant from an NGO mentioned that certain private
216 facilities may bypass basic tests like smear microscopy and immediately proceed with more
217 advanced, and sometimes unnecessary, tests.

218

219 *B. Impact of insurance type on diagnosis*

220 While some private providers indicated that patients' insurance status did not affect the
221 quality or type of services they received since services were all paid for out-of-pocket, others
222 noted significant disparities in diagnostic services depending on insurance coverage and the
223 patient's economic means. These providers explained that they tended to offer their patients with
224 private insurance more advanced and expensive tests, while those without insurance or with state
225 insurance were more likely to be offered basic and cheaper tests.

226

227 *C. Thorough consultation for a better diagnosis*

228 The majority of private providers interviewed exhibited familiarity with the clinical
229 indicators that raise suspicion of active TB. They noted that combining these with a thorough
230 social history – including details such as socioeconomic status, living conditions, and social
231 contacts – considerably aids the diagnostic process.

232

233 *D. Lack of TB training in the private sector*

234 However, private healthcare facilities do not provide any training for their staff on TB,
235 and there are no external training programs available for private providers. As a result, private
236 providers' knowledge of TB is largely based on their prior medical training in academic
237 institutions or their experience working in the public sector. Some private providers reported
238 engaging in self-training out of personal interest.

239

240 **III. Reaching a diagnosis**

241 Overall, we estimate that 77% of people with TB initially sought care at a facility with
242 TB diagnostic capacity (sputum smear microscopy or radiography). The lack of TB services at
243 the initial care-seeking location was driven by the people who initially went to a private facility,
244 since all public health facilities offered at least smear microscopy. Of the surveyed private
245 providers, 35% reported that they had diagnosed at least one person with TB in the past year.

246

247 *A. Role of private sector in early TB detection*

248 Private providers agreed that the private sector's main role lies in the early detection and
249 diagnosis of TB as opposed to treatment. They perceived the availability of resources, speed of
250 diagnosis, and access to cutting-edge technologies as strengths of the private sector. A key
251 informant from the Ministry of Health agreed that there was value in the private sector's
252 contribution to early TB detection and expressed a general openness to expand the role of the
253 private sector in this capacity. Some providers proposed expanding the private sector's early
254 detection potential with more widespread use of advanced diagnostic tests, such as GeneXpert,
255 or by implementing a screening program that would test every patient with respiratory symptoms
256 for TB.

257

258 *B. Duplication of diagnostic tests*

259 Some private providers described having diagnosed patients with TB and referred them to
260 the public sector, only to have the diagnostic test results rejected by the public sector and
261 repeated, causing distress to the patient. The Ministry of Health's key informant explained that
262 this stems from a lack of oversight and validation of private laboratories, which are not

263 supervised or monitored as part of the public network, leading to lower levels of confidence in
264 their results.

265

266 **IV. Treatment initiation**

267 None of the private providers offered treatment for TB, while treatment was available at
268 all Ministry of Health facilities and 89% of the EsSalud facilities. Thus, we estimate that 59% of
269 people with TB had access to treatment services at their initial care location.

270

271 *A. Referral for treatment*

272 There was a clear consensus that the private sector does not provide TB treatment, with
273 interviewees citing legal prohibitions, medication inaccessibility, and the belief that the public
274 program is performing well. While many private providers asserted that the private sector's
275 responsibility ends with referral of people with TB to the public sector, some suggested that they
276 should have the option of providing initial treatment after diagnosis until the patient reaches the
277 public sector to avoid delay in starting treatment.

278

279 *B. Passive follow-up and lack of communication between sectors*

280 Upon referral to the public sector, the responsibility for treatment often shifts to patients
281 themselves. For most private providers, the referral process is viewed as a handover to the public
282 program, with the expectation that the patient will receive appropriate treatment. There are no
283 standardized systems for sharing patient information from the private to the public sector after a
284 patient is diagnosed with TB and referred, or to inform the referring private facility that a patient
285 has arrived and initiated treatment in the public facility. Private providers expressed the desire

286 for better feedback from the Ministry of Health system about the status of referred patients. A
287 digital platform for sharing patient information exists for public facilities, but private facilities
288 are currently excluded. During the COVID-19 pandemic, this system was made accessible to
289 private facilities for the purposes of sharing vaccine-related data with the public sector, which
290 raised the question of why something similar could not be achieved for TB.

291

292 *C. Regulatory TB policies*

293 Private healthcare providers believed that regulatory policies prohibit the private sector
294 from treating TB patients, although they did not generally know the details of the policies.
295 However, the NGO key informant mentioned that regulatory policies provide for a mechanism
296 that could allow private facilities to enter into an agreement with the Ministry of Health to treat
297 drug-sensitive TB. However, the private facility would have to fulfill strict requirements at their
298 own cost, including specialized staff, provisions for contact tracing, follow-ups, supplemental
299 services, and biosafety. No private facility had entered into such an agreement at the time of this
300 study. High levels of bureaucracy and few financial incentives were mentioned as possible
301 reasons for the low levels of interest in this mechanism.

302

303 *D. Resource limitations*

304 Many private providers felt it would be difficult for their facilities to deliver quality TB
305 care, given the diverse services required to address patients' needs. Specialist staff like
306 pulmonologists, nutritionists, and psychologists are often not part of the regular staff of private
307 facilities, and it can be financially challenging to retain them on standby. In addition, a lack of

308 adequate space and biosafety infrastructure were mentioned as possible limitations for the
309 provision of treatment in the private sector.

310

311 **V. Treatment completion and outcome**

312 At the national level, the WHO estimated 44,000 cases in 2021. A total of 26,437 cases
313 were reported (60% of estimated incidence): 71% by Ministry of Health facilities, 20% by
314 EsSalud facilities, and 9% by other government sectors, such as penitentiaries, the military, and
315 the police²¹. No cases were reported by the private sector. Among people who initiated
316 treatment, 84% were treated successfully. Thus, an estimated 50% of all people with TB were
317 treated successfully given that 40% were not diagnosed.

318

319 **DISCUSSION**

320 Our study highlights the role of the private sector in the diagnosis of TB in North Lima,
321 Peru, and the need for enhanced public-private collaboration. Private facilities greatly outnumber
322 public facilities in this setting, and many people with TB use the private sector despite having to
323 pay out-of-pocket.¹⁵ However, the limited availability of TB diagnostic services in the private
324 sector meant that around a quarter of people with TB are estimated to have initially sought care
325 at locations without TB diagnostic services. While the private providers we interviewed believed
326 that they could offer shorter wait times and a quicker diagnosis, they placed the responsibility for
327 treatment on the public sector, citing human resource and space limitations, as well as current
328 regulatory policies. However, private providers struggled with a lack of standardized systems for
329 following up people referred into the public sector.

330 Our findings highlight the potential benefits of closer collaboration between private
331 providers and the Peruvian national TB program to improve TB detection. While studies from
332 other settings have generally documented willingness of private providers to engage with the
333 national TB program,²⁴ some studies have documented low motivation and even resistance to
334 transferring patients to public sector facilities.^{25, 26} Providers in our study were comfortable with
335 referring TB patients to the public sector for treatment and did not make a clear call for treatment
336 in the private sector. Thus, public-private partnership efforts in Peru should focus on strategies to
337 improve TB diagnosis in the private sector and facilitate efficient referral to the public sector.

338 While our qualitative findings depicted a generally positive outlook concerning TB
339 diagnosis in the private sector with private providers believing they were performing well, our
340 quantitative results indicated that most private facilities lacked TB diagnostic capabilities, and a
341 minority of surveyed private providers had diagnosed a case of TB in the past year. In part, this
342 inconsistency is likely attributable to the characteristics of our interview sample: providers who
343 agreed to interviews were predominantly from facilities with diagnostic capacities, and we
344 purposively sampled providers such that half had diagnosed TB recently. Even so, the
345 interviewed providers who had not recently diagnosed TB did not highlight challenges or
346 limitations to TB diagnosis in the private sector. This suggests either that they were unaware of
347 these limitations, or that social desirability bias prevented them from discussing these issues.
348 Studies of the quality of private sector TB diagnostic services in Asian and African countries
349 have found wide variation in quality within settings, and have documented low TB testing rates
350 even for people with typical TB symptoms.²⁷ It is likely that such variation in quality exists in
351 Peru and other Latin American countries as well, and that diagnoses are being missed in the
352 private sector.

353 The main barrier that hinders effective cooperation between the private and public sectors
354 in Peru is the lack of communication and information sharing. Effective strategies for public-
355 private partnership include the national TB program providing technical support to private
356 providers and establishing formal collaborative relationships with defined expectations.¹² In
357 Peru, the Ministry of Health could help harness the potential of the private sector by providing
358 training for private providers and formally recognizing private facilities that offer high-quality
359 diagnostic services so that public facilities can accept their diagnostic test results without
360 repeating them. Successful public-private partnerships have also highlighted the importance of
361 formal feedback mechanisms that inform private providers about what happens to their patients
362 who have been referred to the public sector for treatment.^{28, 29} In Peru, a simple way to formalize
363 the referral process would be to give private providers a standardized paper referral form that
364 would be recognized by public facilities. Granting them access to the electronic system through
365 which public facilities to refer and monitor patients would enable both referral and feedback
366 between sectors.

367 One strength of our study is the use of in-depth interviews with private healthcare
368 providers in combination with a PPA. This approach provides insight into what happens when
369 people with TB seek care in the private sector, which was poorly understood in our setting, as in
370 other Latin American countries. There are several limitations to our research. Firstly, because the
371 list of private facilities was not updated to reflect closures and data were not available on TB
372 services in the private sector, we collected data by directly identifying facilities and conducting
373 surveys of TB service availability. This was only feasible to do for a single district. Carabayllo is
374 one of the larger but less urbanized districts of North Lima, so extrapolating the findings from
375 this district to others may underestimate service availability in the private sector in North Lima.

376 Additionally, we relied on healthcare-seeking data from a prior study of people with TB in
377 Lima,¹⁵ which included only people being treated within the Ministry of Health system. People
378 treated in the EsSalud system are more likely to have utilized EsSalud facilities as well as private
379 facilities due to existing insurance partnerships. Given that EsSalud facilities have TB services
380 and private facilities may or may not, it is unclear how including these individuals would change
381 the results of the PPA, although the magnitude of any changes would likely be small since only
382 20% of people with TB are treated in the EsSalud system.²¹

383 In conclusion, our study highlights the role private providers play as an entry point of
384 care for a sizable portion of people with TB, even in a country where treatment is restricted to
385 the public sector. Improving linkages between the private and public sectors by establishing a
386 formal referral system and improving communication between sectors could lead to higher case
387 detection rates and improved continuity and timeliness of care for people with TB. To harness
388 the potential of the private sector in TB diagnosis in Peru, it is necessary to begin a dialogue
389 between the public and private sectors in order to explore possible public-private partnership
390 models.

391

392

393 **Financial support:**

394 This work was supported by the National Institutes of Health (DP2MD015102); the Master of
395 Medical Sciences in Global Health Delivery program of Harvard Medical School Department of
396 Global Health and Social Medicine, with financial contributions from Harvard University and
397 the Ronda Stryker and William Johnston MMSc Fellowship in Global Health Delivery; and a
398 Summer Research Travel Grant from the David Rockefeller Center for Latin American Studies.

399

400 **Disclosures:** The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

401

402 **Authors:**

403 Christoph Wippel, Harvard Medical School, Boston, USA, Christoph_Wippel@hms.harvard.edu

404 Sheyla Farroñay, Socios En Salud Sucursal Perú, Lima, Peru, sfarronay_ses@pih.org

405 Hannah N. Gilbert, Harvard Medical School, Boston, USA, Hannah_Gilbert@hms.harvard.edu

406 Ana Karina Millones, Socios En Salud Sucursal Perú, Lima, Peru, amillones_ses@pih.org

407 Diana Acosta, Socios En Salud Sucursal Perú, Lima, Peru, dacosta_ses@pih.org

408 Isabel Torres, Socios En Salud Sucursal Perú, Lima, Peru, itorres_ses@pih.org

409 Judith Jimenez, Socios En Salud Sucursal Perú, Lima, Peru, jjimenez_ses@pih.org

410 Leonid Lecca, Socios En Salud Sucursal Perú, Lima, Peru, llecca_ses@pih.org

411 Courtney M. Yuen, Brigham and Women's Hospital, Boston, USA,

412 Courtney_Yuen@hms.harvard.edu

413

414

415

416 **Figure 1. Joint display of integrated results presented longitudinally across the patient**
 417 **pathway.** Quantitative results are stratified by sector, considering the private sector, the public
 418 system operated by the Ministry of Health (“MINSA”), and the public system operated by the
 419 Ministry of Labor (“EsSalud”). Notification data (*) were used from 2021, when case
 420 notifications had decreased by approximately 20% during the COVID-19 pandemic; therefore,
 421 the percentage of missed people with TB is higher than in prior years.
 422



423

424

425

426 **Table 1:** Quotes illustrating themes related to first contact with health facilities (step I in patient
427 pathway)
428

Theme	Quote
I-A. Unawareness of active TB symptoms in patients	<i>“I think that the main reason why a person would come to a private establishment with tuberculosis is to learn about their disease. They might confuse the symptoms and think that it is another respiratory problem and not TB, because most people know that TB is managed in public centers.” (Interview 10, Private provider who had diagnosed TB in the past year)</i>
I-B. Shorter wait times and quicker diagnosis	<i>“If there is suspicion [for TB], we request a sputum BK [smear microscopy] test. This BK test can be done privately or publicly at MINSA. Publicly, it's free, but the results take a month. [...] The patient arrives at the public sector with a diagnosis, and what does the TB program do? They start the treatment. You skipped the whole month or two months that the pulmonologist would have taken to get the x-rays at MINSA, the CT scan, and the BK test. That time was shortened, and you already have the diagnosis and can start treatment. (Interview 18, Private provider who had diagnosed TB in the past year)</i>

429
430
431

432 **Table 2:** Quotes illustrating themes related to the diagnostic process and reaching a diagnosis
 433 (steps II and III in patient pathway)
 434

Theme	Quote
II-A. Diagnostic procedures depend on patients' economic means	<i>"Normally in all private centers, we have more access to blood, ultrasound, and radiological tests, because the person who goes to a [private] clinic usually has the economic means to afford to afford it. So, we reach a diagnosis more easily because we ask for everything that is needed, they do all the tests, and the diagnosis is made quickly." (Interview 17, Private provider who had diagnosed TB in past year)</i>
	<i>"The cost of the consultation is low and they make the most money with the laboratory. For example, with [facility name], I know of many patients I have seen with TB that have gone through [facility name] and they all come with spirometry and many expensive tests as well. And they did not do a smear because it was very cheap." (Interview 1, Key informant from NGO)</i>
II-B. Impact of insurance type on diagnosis	<i>"If I were in a clinic that had everything, and the patient had an EPS [private insurance] that covers everything, I would order everything, from a sputum BK [smear microscopy] to a tomography scan. But we are talking about the poorest portion of the population, we have to think carefully about what we order for them because sometimes the patient does not have the means to pay for everything. [...] I take a good medical history and a physical exam, and if they have respiratory symptoms of a contagious disease such as tuberculosis, I order them to get a serial sputum BK – usually, because those are the cheapest, the sputum BK and a chest x-ray." (Interview 10, Private provider who had diagnosed TB in past year)</i>
II-C. Thorough consultation for a better diagnosis	<i>"Ideally, they [healthcare providers] take their time to take a good medical history for the patient. If they achieve this, it's already 80% – the diagnosis is 80% in the medical history. [...] They have to dig for things, and then they will find out what the problem is." (Interview 2, Private provider who had diagnosed TB in past year)</i>
II-D. Lack of TB training in the private sector	<i>"Here, in this establishment, I have not received any training, neither for diagnosis nor for management of TB. I have been practicing here in the country since [date] 2020. [...] Until now, I have not had any training here, at least not with respect to TB." (Interview 5, Private provider who had not diagnosed TB in past year)</i>
III-A. Role of private sector in early TB detection	<i>"Well, in our case as a country, as I mentioned, one of the main advantages that could be considered for their case is early detection. That is, the ability to detect or at least identify probable cases for quick referrals. I mean, in that they could contribute a lot." (Interview 22, Key informant from Ministry of Health)</i>
III-B. Duplication of diagnostic tests	<i>"There may be requests for sputum smear tests to private laboratories, but we do not know if they are truly capable of providing that type of test. [...] It has always been considered that if diagnoses are made in the private sector, they must be validated because if they are not evaluated by the [National Health Institute] that gives a certain guarantee, we will not have the confidence in</i>

	<i>knowing that those diagnoses are truly what they are.” (Interview 22, Key informant from Ministry of Health)</i>
--	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

435

436

437 **Table 3:** Quotes illustrating themes related to treatment initiation (step IV in patient pathway)
438

Theme	Quote
IV-A. Referral for treatment	<i>“Unfortunately, the private sector refers patients to the Ministry of Health system for treatment because they don't have the treatment regimens. It would be ideal to give the patient a week of treatment and instruct them to follow up at a nearby health center for monitoring, but that's not something that we are currently doing.” (Interview 20, Private provider who had diagnosed TB in the past year)</i>
IV-B. Passive follow-up and lack of communication between sectors	<i>“Patients usually reach out to me... and update me on the progress of the tests and results or if they have been cleared. So it is the opposite – patients reach out to me rather than me reaching out to them.” (Interview 13, Private provider who had not diagnosed TB in the past year)</i>
IV-C. Regulatory TB policies	<i>“I am not familiar with any regulations in the private sector for TB. What I do know is that all TB cases should be referred to the nearest Ministry of Health facility.” (Interview 18, Private provider who had diagnosed TB in the past year)</i>
	<i>“There are private facilities that, depending on the level of complexity, are definitely capable of treating tuberculosis [...] They should treat tuberculosis, they are prepared, they even have their pulmonologist, and they have their areas. That is why this should be only reserved for the [more complex] clinics, because now they have to comply with new regulations.” (Interview 3, Private provider who had not diagnosed TB in the past year)</i>
IV-D. Resource limitations	<i>“And seeing it from the point of a private provider, I think it would be a bit difficult, financially speaking [to have a pulmonologist on standby in case we need one]. So, I am seeing it from the perspective of how much that would cost me.” (Interview 11, Private provider who had not diagnosed TB in the past year)</i>

439

440

441 **REFERENCES**

- 442 1. World Health Organization, 2022. Global Tuberculosis Report 2022. Geneva: World
443 Health Organization.
- 444 2. Teo AKJ, Singh SR, Prem K, Hsu LY, Yi S, 2021. Duration and determinants of delayed
445 tuberculosis diagnosis and treatment in high-burden countries: a mixed-methods
446 systematic review and meta-analysis. *Respir Res* 22: 251.
- 447 3. Garfin C, Mantala M, Yadav R, Hanson CL, Osberg M, Hymoff A, Makayova J, 2017.
448 Using Patient Pathway Analysis to Design Patient-centered Referral Networks for
449 Diagnosis and Treatment of Tuberculosis: The Case of the Philippines. *J Infect Dis* 216:
450 S740-S747.
- 451 4. Fatima R, Haq MU, Yaqoob A, Mahmood N, Ahmad KL, Osberg M, Makayova J,
452 Hymoff A, Hanson C, 2017. Delivering Patient-Centered Care in a Fragile State: Using
453 Patient-Pathway Analysis to Understand Tuberculosis-Related Care Seeking in Pakistan.
454 *J Infect Dis* 216: S733-S739.
- 455 5. Masini E, Hanson C, Ogoro J, Brown J, Ngari F, Mingkwan P, Makayova J, Osberg M,
456 2017. Using Patient-Pathway Analysis to Inform a Differentiated Program Response to
457 Tuberculosis: The Case of Kenya. *J Infect Dis* 216: S714-S723.
- 458 6. Fekadu L, Hanson C, Osberg M, Makayova J, Mingkwan P, Chin D, 2017. Increasing
459 Access to Tuberculosis Services in Ethiopia: Findings From a Patient-Pathway Analysis.
460 *J Infect Dis* 216: S696-S701.
- 461 7. Surya A, et al., 2017. Quality Tuberculosis Care in Indonesia: Using Patient Pathway
462 Analysis to Optimize Public-Private Collaboration. *J Infect Dis* 216: S724-S732.

- 463 8. Lestari BW, McAllister S, Hadisoemarto PF, Afifah N, Jani ID, Murray M, van Crevel R,
464 Hill PC, Alisjahbana B, 2020. Patient pathways and delays to diagnosis and treatment of
465 tuberculosis in an urban setting in Indonesia. *Lancet Reg Health West Pac* 5: 100059.
- 466 9. Yellappa V, Lefevre P, Battaglioli T, Devadasan N, Van der Stuyft P, 2017. Patients
467 pathways to tuberculosis diagnosis and treatment in a fragmented health system: a
468 qualitative study from a south Indian district. *BMC Public Health* 17: 635.
- 469 10. Ten Asbroek AH, Bijlsma MW, Malla P, Shrestha B, Delnoij DM, 2008. The road to
470 tuberculosis treatment in rural Nepal: A qualitative assessment of 26 journeys. *BMC*
471 *Health Serv Res* 8: 7.
- 472 11. Teo AKJ, et al., 2023. Where are the missing people affected by tuberculosis? A
473 programme review of patient-pathway and cascade of care to optimise tuberculosis case-
474 finding, treatment and prevention in Cambodia. *BMJ Glob Health* 8: e010994.
- 475 12. Lei X, Liu Q, Escobar E, Philogene J, Zhu H, Wang Y, Tang S, 2015. Public-private mix
476 for tuberculosis care and control: a systematic review. *Int J Infect Dis* 34: 20-32.
- 477 13. Salinas J, Calvillo S, Cayla J, Nedel FB, Martin M, Navarro A, 2012. Delays in the
478 diagnosis of pulmonary tuberculosis in Coahuila, Mexico. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 16:
479 1193-8.
- 480 14. Macq J, Solis A, Ibarra M, Martiny P, Dujardin B, 2004. The cost of medical care and
481 people's health-seeking behaviour before being suspected of tuberculosis in three local
482 health systems, Nicaragua. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 8: 1330-6.
- 483 15. Bonadonna LV, Saunders MJ, Zegarra R, Evans C, Alegria-Flores K, Guio H, 2017. Why
484 wait? The social determinants underlying tuberculosis diagnostic delay. *PLoS One* 12:
485 e0185018.

- 486 16. TB Diagnostics Market Analysis Consortium, 2014. Market assessment of tuberculosis
487 diagnostics in Brazil in 2012. PLoS One 9: e104105.
- 488 17. Lambert ML, Delgado R, Michaux G, Vols A, Speybroeck N, Van der Stuyft P, 2005.
489 Collaboration between private pharmacies and national tuberculosis programme: an
490 intervention in Bolivia. Trop Med Int Health 10: 246-50.
- 491 18. Hanson CL, Osberg M, Brown J, Durham G, Chin DP, 2017. Conducting Patient-
492 Pathway Analysis to Inform Programming of Tuberculosis Services: Methods. J Infect
493 Dis 216: S679-S685.
- 494 19. Chiang SS, Roche S, Contreras C, Alarcon V, Del Castillo H, Becerra MC, Lecca L,
495 2015. Barriers to the diagnosis of childhood tuberculosis: a qualitative study. Int J Tuberc
496 Lung Dis 19: 1144-52.
- 497 20. Minnery M, Contreras C, Perez R, Solorzano N, Tintaya K, Jimenez J, Soto S, Lecca L,
498 2013. A cross sectional study of knowledge and attitudes towards tuberculosis amongst
499 front-line tuberculosis personnel in high burden areas of Lima, Peru. PLoS One 8:
500 e75698.
- 501 21. Direccion de Prevencion y Control de la Tuberculosis, Sala Situacional DashBoard.
502 Available at: <http://www.tuberculosis.minsa.gob.pe/DashboardDPCTB/Dashboard.aspx>.
503 Accessed 25 May, 2023.
- 504 22. Hsieh HF, Shannon SE, 2005. Three approaches to qualitative content analysis. Qual
505 Health Res 15: 1277-88.
- 506 23. Guetterman TC, Fetters MD, Creswell JW, 2015. Integrating Quantitative and Qualitative
507 Results in Health Science Mixed Methods Research Through Joint Displays. Ann Fam
508 Med 13: 554-61.

- 509 24. Bell CA, Duncan G, Saini B, 2011. Knowledge, attitudes and practices of private sector
510 providers of tuberculosis care: a scoping review. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 15: 1005-17.
- 511 25. Pradipta IS, Idrus LR, Probandari A, Lestari BW, Diantini A, Alffenaar JC, Hak E, 2021.
512 Barriers and strategies to successful tuberculosis treatment in a high-burden tuberculosis
513 setting: a qualitative study from the patient's perspective. *BMC Public Health* 21: 1903.
- 514 26. Lonnoth K, Karlsson M, Lan NT, Buu TN, Dieu TT, 2003. Referring TB suspects from
515 private pharmacies to the National Tuberculosis Programme: experiences from two
516 districts in Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 7: 1147-53.
- 517 27. Stallworthy G, Dias HM, Pai M, 2020. Quality of tuberculosis care in the private health
518 sector. *J Clin Tuberc Other Mycobact Dis* 20: 100171.
- 519 28. Yellappa V, Battaglioli T, Gurum SK, Narayanan D, Van der Stuyft P, 2018. Involving
520 private practitioners in the Indian tuberculosis programme: a randomised trial. *Trop Med*
521 *Int Health* 23: 570-579.
- 522 29. Murthy KJ, Frieden TR, Yazdani A, Hreshikesh P, 2001. Public-private partnership in
523 tuberculosis control: experience in Hyderabad, India. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 5: 354-9.
524
525