

1 **Reduction in maternal mortality ratio varies by district in Sidama Regional State,**
2 **southern Ethiopia: Estimates by cross-sectional studies using the sisterhood**
3 **method and a household survey of pregnancy and birth outcomes**

4
5 **Variations in reduction of maternal mortality ratio in Sidama Regional State,**
6 **southern Ethiopia**

7 Authors

8 Aschenaki Zerihun Kea^{1, 2*}, Bernt Lindtjorn^{1, 2}, Achamyesh Gebretsadik¹, Sven

9 Gudmund Hinderaker²

10

11 Affiliations

12 ¹ School of Public Health, College of Medicine and Health Sciences, Hawassa University,
13 Hawassa, Ethiopia

14 ² Centre for International Health, University of Bergen, Bergen, Norway

15 *Corresponding author

16 Email: aschenakizer@yahoo.com (AZK)

17

1

18 **Abstract**

19 **Introduction**

20 Maternal mortality studies conducted at national level do not provide subnational and local
21 estimates useful for program planning and monitoring maternal mortality at lower
22 administrative level. The aim of this study was to estimate life time risk (LTR) of maternal death
23 and maternal mortality ratio (MMR), assess variations and reduction in MMR in Sidama
24 Regional State, southern Ethiopia.

25 **Methods**

26 This is cross-sectional study employed the sisterhood method as part of larger household
27 maternal mortality survey that used a 5-year recall of pregnancy and birth outcomes. We
28 visited 8880 households and interviewed 17444 respondents 15-49 years age. We assessed
29 reduction in MMR using the sisterhood method (main focus of this paper) and a household
30 survey of pregnancy and birth outcomes.

31 **Result**

32 We analysed 17374 (99.6%) respondents; 8884 (51.1%) men and 8490 (48.9%) women. The
33 17,374 respondents reported 64,387 maternal sisters who had reached reproductive age.
34 Among these, 2,402 (3.7%) sisters had died; 776 (32.3%) were pregnancy related deaths. The
35 LTR of maternal death was 3.2% and MMR was 623 (95% CI: 573-658) per 100000 live births
36 (LB), with reference to year 2010. The remote district (Aroresa) had a MMR of 1210 (95% CI:
37 1027-1318) per 100,000 LB. Assessment of MMR reduction using the two maternal mortality

38 estimation methods showed that the MMR in Sidama Regional State declined over the past
39 years. Significant reduction in MMR was observed in districts located near the regional centre.
40 However, no reduction was observed in districts located distant to the regional centre.

41 **Conclusion**

42 The high MMR with district level variations and lack of mortality reduction in districts located
43 distant to the centre highlights the need for instituting interventions tailored to the local
44 context to save mothers and accelerate reduction in MMR.

45 **Introduction**

46 The government of Ethiopia has been implementing interventions aiming to reduce maternal
47 mortality since the commencement of the Millennium Development Goal (MDG) [1], and the
48 maternal deaths in the country fell by 61% during the MDG period. Despite these
49 achievements, in 2017, there were an estimated 14000 maternal deaths with corresponding
50 maternal mortality ratio (MMR) 401 per 100,000 live births (LB).

51 Currently, maternal deaths are not routinely tracked using vital registration in Ethiopia [2, 3]. In
52 certain areas, maternal deaths are tracked through studies conducted at special settings like
53 demographic surveillance sites [4] and hospitals [5]. The data used for monitoring maternal
54 mortality in the country largely comes from Demographic and Health Surveys (DHS) [6] and UN
55 agency studies [7] conducted periodically at national level. However, studies conducted at
56 national level do not provide data on magnitude and variations of maternal deaths at district

57 level. Hence, at lower administrative level in Ethiopia, it is difficult to understand the magnitude
58 and variations of maternal deaths and ensure reduction of MMR.

59 A recent population based household survey conducted in Sidama Regional State identified a
60 high MMR with district level variations. The overall MMR of the region, reported by this study
61 was 419 (95% CI: 260-577) per 100,000 LB, but Aroresa district (the remote district) had a MMR
62 1142 (95% CI: 693-1591) deaths per 100,000 LB [8].

63 We carried out a population based household survey employing the indirect sisterhood method
64 to measure maternal mortality in Sidama Regional State, southern Ethiopia. The indirect
65 sisterhood method was part of larger maternal mortality survey aimed at measuring maternal
66 mortality in Sidama Regional State using a retrospective 5-year recall period of pregnancy [8].

67 The larger study also included measuring physical access to skilled delivery using Geographic
68 Information System. The 5-year pregnancy and birth outcome household survey helps to
69 understand the magnitude of and district level variations in maternal mortality for recent years,
70 whereas the indirect sisterhood method of this paper is used to understand past maternal
71 mortality level and variations in the region and in districts included in the study.

72 The indirect sisterhood method has been validated and used in different settings [9-12]. Our
73 specific objectives in this study using the indirect sisterhood method were 1) to estimate life
74 time risk (LTR) of maternal death and corresponding MMR; 2) to assess variations in maternal
75 mortality estimates based on characteristics of the respondents; 3) to assess reduction in MMR
76 in Sidama Regional State over the past year by using MMR of the sisterhood method (main

77 focus of this paper) with results from the 5-year recall of pregnancy and birth outcome
78 household survey.

79 **Methods**

80 **Study design and setting**

81 We carried out a cross sectional study employing the sisterhood method (main focus of this
82 paper) as part of larger maternal mortality household survey that used a retrospective 5-year
83 recall of pregnancy and birth outcomes [8]. The study was conducted in Sidama Regional State,
84 Southern Ethiopia. Six districts (Aleta Chuko, Aleta Wondo, Aroresa, Daela, Hawassa Zuriya and
85 Wondogenet) of Sidama Regional State were included in the study. The study was conducted
86 from July 2019 to May 2020. Sidama Regional State is one of 11 regional states in the country,
87 and its capital Hawassa is located 273 km south of Addis Ababa. The population of the region
88 projected for 2020 was 4.3 million people. Administratively, the region is divided into 30 rural
89 districts (*woredas*), 6 town administrations and 536 rural *kebeles* (the smallest administrative
90 structure with an average population of 5000 people). Under the *kebele*, there are local
91 structure known as *limatbudin* (local administrative unit consisting of 40-50 neighbouring
92 households in average).

93 **The sisterhood method**

94 The sisterhood method utilizes information obtained from adult men and women about the
95 deaths of their sisters born to the same mother, and who were in reproductive age. The
96 sisterhood method uses the proportions of adult sisters dying during pregnancy, childbirth, or

97 the puerperium reported by adults during a census or survey. In this way, a cohort of women in
98 reproductive age at risk of pregnancy related death is created [12, 13]. The LTR of maternal
99 death is estimated from sister unit of risk exposure to maternal mortality. MMR is
100 approximated using total fertility rate (TFR) of the study area [12, 13]. The MMR estimate from
101 the indirect sisterhood method in average refers to 10-12 years prior to data collection and
102 even can extends to 35 years when the respondents are older [12].The sisterhood method is
103 acclaimed for simplicity, minimal time and inexpensiveness. However, it's not appropriates for
104 monitoring short term progress [14].

105 **Study population and sampling techniques**

106 Men and women aged 15-49 years in Sidama Regional State were source population of the
107 study, and men and women of same age and residing in sampled households were the study
108 population.

109 The detailed sampling techniques of the study has been described elsewhere [8]. Below, we
110 summarize the sampling technique of the sisterhood method conducted as part of a larger
111 maternal mortality household survey. Multistage cluster sampling techniques was employed to
112 identify the study participants. At first stage, we randomly selected six districts from the region.
113 At second stage, we selected 40 *kebeles* from the six districts proportional to the size of *kebeles*
114 in the districts. Thirdly, from each *kebele*, we sampled 6 *limatbudin* and finally selected 37
115 households from each *limatbudin*. Men and women 15-49 years age residing in the sampled
116 households were eligible for the sisterhood interview. When two or more men or women born

117 to the same mother were found in the same household, one of them was selected by a lottery
118 method to avoid multiple counting of the same sisters.

119 **Variables**

120 Life time risk of maternal deaths and MMR; maternal deaths per 100,000 LB were the outcome
121 measures of the study. We also collected characteristics of the respondents, like sex, age and
122 educational level to assess their association with the outcome measures of interest.

123 **Data source and measurement**

124 We carried out an interview with 17444 participants and analysed the data of 17374
125 participants; 8884 (51.1%) men and 8490 (48.9%) women 15-49 years age. The participants
126 were residents of the 8880 households of the survey [8]. The data was collected by diploma
127 level teachers recruited from each *kebele* who were familiar with the culture and language of
128 the study area. The data collectors conducted an interview with men and women 15-49 years
129 using interviewer administered questionnaire. Participants were asked the following four
130 standard questions used in indirect sisterhood method [12]. 1) How many sisters (born to the
131 same mother) have you ever had who reached 15 years? 2) How many of these sisters who
132 ever-reached 15 years are alive now? 3) How many of these sisters who ever-reached 15 years
133 are dead? 4) How many of these dead sisters died while they were pregnant, or during
134 childbirth, or during the six weeks after the end of pregnancy?

135 The first question addresses the number of sisters who were at risk of pregnancy related deaths
136 while the fourth question identifies the actual number of pregnancy related deaths.

137 Interviewers were observant to ensure the sum of question 2 and 3 equals to question 1 as a

138 quality assurance of numbers. The period of six weeks after the end of pregnancy in question 4
139 was approximated 2 months after the end of pregnancy.

140 **Data quality control**

141 We adapted the standard sisterhood questions to local context [12]. The questionnaire was
142 prepared in English, translated into local language (*Sidaamu Afoo*) and back translated to
143 English by another individual to check its consistency. Before actual data collection, the
144 questionnaire was pretested in one district not included in the study.

145 The data collectors and supervisors were trained by the principal investigator. The training was
146 part of the larger survey training in which one day was scheduled for the sisterhood. The
147 training content included discussion on the content and aim of each question, interview
148 techniques and role plays. The data collectors were supervised by two public health officers
149 recruited from each district who were also familiar with the culture and language of the study
150 setting. The supervisors followed the data collectors, checked consistency and completeness of
151 the questionnaire. When eligible respondents were absent during initial visit, the data
152 collectors revisited the households the next day.

153 The data was double entered using EpiData software (EpiData Association 2000-2021,
154 Denmark). Consistency of the two entries was checked and discrepancies validated from the
155 hard copies of the questionnaire.

156 **Sample size determination**

157 Hanley and colleagues suggested that, in settings where the MMR within the range of 500 per
158 100,000 LB, the death of 385 sisters with (\pm 10% margin of error) will be reported from
159 interviews of 13000 adult respondents aged 15-49 [13]. According to the 2016 EDHS report,
160 the MMR of Ethiopia was 412/100,000 LB [6]. Adding 10% non-responses, we decided to
161 interview 14,300 respondents. The number of households planned for the larger maternal
162 mortality household survey was 8880. We assumed that, surveying the 8880 household would
163 be sufficient to get the desired sample of adult respondents for the sisterhood study.

164 **Statistical analysis**

165 Stata 15 were used for data analysis. Before LTR and MMR computation, two adjustments
166 were made [12]. The first adjustment was made to the younger age group. The respondents in
167 younger age group (15-19 and 20-24) would have sisters who have not yet reached age 15.
168 Hence, we created hypothetical number of sisters that would have been reported by the young
169 age group. To get this number, we calculated the average number of sisters reported by older
170 age group (25-49) and multiplied by the initial number of sisters reported by the younger age
171 group. The average number of sisters reported by age group 25-49 was 2.77 (37072/13401).
172 Therefore, the number of sisters reported by age group 15-19 was 1475 and multiplied by 2.77
173 it equals to 4086; and same for age group 20-24 (8386 sisters x 2.77=23229).

174 The second adjustment was made to get sisters exposed to full lifetime risk exposure [12]. As
175 we interviewed participants aged below 50, we did not have information about full lifetime risk
176 of all their sisters. Hence, we multiplied the sister unit of risk exposure of each age group with

177 the adjustment factor in order to get “complete” sister units of risk exposure. The adjustment
178 factor was a number calculated for risk exposure of different age group in developing
179 countries which is independent of a particular country [12].

180 Descriptive statistics with means and percentages were computed to describe participants’
181 characteristics. The LTR for maternal death was obtained by dividing the total number of
182 maternal deaths reported by the estimated total number of sisters exposed (LTR= (Total
183 number of maternal deaths)/ (Total sister units of risk exposure). We used total fertility rate
184 (TFR) of rural population of Ethiopia 5.2 [6] to estimate MMR from the LTR. (MMR = (1-[(1- LTR)
185 1/TFR] x 100,000), using formulas specified by Hanley et al. [13].

186 The corresponding time period to which our estimate refers was computed using the following
187 formula: $T = \frac{\sum(T(i) * B(i))}{\sum B(i)}$, where T = the point time location of the global estimate, T(i) = the
188 time location of the estimate for each age group and B(i) = the exposing units of each age group
189 [12]. We carried out stratified analysis based on respondents’ sex, age, and location to see the
190 association with the outcome measure.

191 Finally, we assessed differences and reduction in MMR in Sidama Regional State and in the
192 districts included in this study using the two maternal mortality estimations methods: the
193 sisterhood method and the 5-year recall of pregnancy and birth outcome household survey [8].
194 The reference period for the sisterhood method MMR estimation was 2010 whereas the
195 reference period for 5-year recall of pregnancy and child birth outcome MMR estimation was
196 from July 2014-June 2019.

197 **Ethical approval**

198 We obtained the ethical approval for this study from institutional review board (IRB/015/11) of
199 Hawassa University College of Medicine and Health Sciences and Regional Ethical Committee of
200 Western Norway (2018/2389/REK vest). We got support letter from the Sidama Regional Health
201 Bureau (formerly known Sidama Zone Health Department), and from the district health offices
202 and *kebeles*. Informed (thumb print and signed) consent was obtained from the respondents.
203 We removed the identifiers of the respondents during data entry and analysis.

204 **Result**

205 Table 1 shows the background characteristics of the respondents. We conducted an interview
206 with 17,444 men and women 15-49 years of age residing in 8880 households. Seventy (0.4%)
207 respondents had incomplete information and were excluded from the analysis. There was no
208 reported death of sisters from the 70 respondents with incomplete information. The final
209 analysis included 17,374 (99.6%) respondents: 8,884 (51.1%) men and 8,490 (48.9%) women.
210 The mean age of the respondents was 29.3 years (SD=6.8), 20.5% had no formal education and
211 15.2% had attended high school or higher education.

212

213

214

215

216 **Table 1.** Characteristics of respondents of maternal mortality survey using the sisterhood
217 method, in Sidama Regional State, southern Ethiopia, 2020

Characterstics of respondents	Number of respondents	Percentage
District (Woreda)		
Aleta Chuko	3722	21.4
Aleta Wondo	3929	22.6
Aroresa	2530	14.6
Daela	990	5.7
Hawassa Zuriya	3925	22.6
Wondogenet	2278	13.1
Sex		
Men	8490	48.9
Women	8884	51.1
Educational level		
No formal education	3557	20.5
Grade 1-4	4397	25.3
Grade 5-8	6776	39.0
High school or above	2644	15.2
Age group		
15-19	706	4.1
20-24	3267	18.8
25-29	4892	28.1
30-34	4216	24.3
35-39	2530	14.6
40-44	1221	7.0
45-49	542	3.1

218
219 Table 2 shows maternal mortality estimates by 5 year age groups. The 17,374 respondents
220 reported a total of 64,387 maternal sisters who had reached 15 years or older, and on average
221 each respondent reported 3.7 sisters. Of the 64,387 reported sisters who had reached 15 years
222 or more, 2,402 (3.7%) sisters had died. From those who had died, 776 (32.3%) were pregnancy
223 related deaths. The total LTR of maternal death was 3.2% i.e. 1 in 31 women 15-49 years old
224 dies due to maternal cause. Using total fertility rate of 5.2, the estimated MMR for the study

225 area was 623 (95% CI: 573-658) per 100,000 LB. The approximate time reference for the MMR
 226 estimate was the year 2010, corresponding 10 years prior to data collection.

227 **Table 2.** Estimate of lifetime risk of maternal death using the sisterhood method
 228 referring to 2010, in Sidama Regional State, southern Ethiopia, 2020

Age group of respondents (years)	Number of respondents (N)	Sisters reached age >=15 (e)	Number of death from all cause (c)	Number of Pregnancy related death (r)	Adjustment factor (f)	Sister units of exposure (B)=ef	Lifetime risk (Q)=r/B
15-19	706	4086*	33	9	0.107	437	0.021
20-24	3267	23229*	269	77	0.206	4785	0.016
25-29	4892	13474	561	191	0.343	4622	0.041
30-34	4216	11867	706	227	0.503	5969	0.038
35-39	2530	7123	464	159	0.664	4730	0.034
40-44	1221	3289	258	73	0.802	2638	0.028
45-49	542	1319	111	40	0.9	1187	0.034
Total	17374	64387	2402	776		24368	0.032

Note: * The expected number of sisters reaching age 15 and above in the younger age groups (age 15-19 and age 20-24) was calculated by multiplying the average number of sisters reported among respondents aged 25-49 (which is 2.77) with the original number of sisters reported by respondents in younger age. The original number of reported sisters in age group 15-19 was 1475 while in age group 20-24 was 8386

229

230 To estimate MMR for the most recent period, we repeated the procedure in Table 2 stratifying
 231 the participants in three age group: 15-29, 30-39 and 40-49 (Table 3 A). The MMR among
 232 participants in the 15-29 age group was 545 (95% CI: 475-601) per 100, 000 LB, reflecting 7
 233 years before data collection. For respondents in the 30-39 age group, the MMR was 703 (624-
 234 760) per 100, 000 LB, reflecting a period 11 years before the study. For respondents 40 years or
 235 more, the MMR was 564 (455-660) per 100, 000 LB, reflecting a period 15 years before data
 236 collection.

237

238 **Table 3A.** Maternal mortality estimate and reference period by age group using the
239 sisterhood method, in Sidama Regional State, southern Ethiopia, 2020

Age group	15-29	30-39	40-49	Total
Respondents	8865	6746	1763	17374
Sisters 15y+	40789	18990	4608	64387
Sisters 15y+ died	863	1170	369	2402
Sisters 15y+ died maternal	277	386	113	776
Sisters exposed to risk	9844	10699	3825	24368
Lifetime risk	0.028	0.036	0.029	0.032
MMR*	545	703	564	623
95% CI for MMR	476-601	624-760	455-660	573-658
Estimated years back	7.4	10.6	15.3	10.2

Note: * Maternal mortality ratio per 100, 000 LB, CI: Confidence Interval

240
241 Table 3B shows the life time risk of maternal death and MMR stratified by male and female
242 respondents. There was no statistically significant difference among male and female
243 respondents.

244

245

246

247

248

249

250 **Table 3B.** Maternal mortality estimate by sex of respondents, using the sisterhood
 251 method, in Sidama Regional State, southern Ethiopia, 2020

	Male	Female	Total
Respondents	8490	8884	17374
Sisters 15y+	26087	38485	64387
Sisters 15y+ died	1276	1126	2402
Sisters 15y+ died maternal	397	379	776
Sisters exposed to risk	12830	11574	24368
Lifetime risk	0.031	0.033	0.032
MMR*	604	643	623
95% CI for MMR	538-654	572-697	573-658

252 Note: * Maternal mortality ratio per 100,000 live birth, CI: Confidence Interval

253 Table 3C shows stratified analysis of maternal mortality estimates by the districts of
 254 respondents. The MMR in Aroresa district was significantly higher than all other study districts
 255 in the region; MMR: 1210 (95% CI: 1027-1318) per 100,000 LB.

256 **Table 3C.** Maternal mortality estimate by district of respondents using the sisterhood
 257 method, in Sidama Regional State, southern Ethiopia, 2020

	Aleta- Chuko	Aleta- Wondo	Aroresa	Daela	Hawassa Zuriya	Wondo- genet
Respondents	3722	3929	2530	990	3925	2278
Sisters 15y+	13602	17155	9924	4107	12557	6962
Sisters 15y+ died	595	478	502	171	441	215
Sisters 15y+ died maternal	136	128	236	48	161	67
Sisters exposed to risk	5432	5949	3848	1725	4446	2938
Lifetime risk	0.025	0.022	0.061	0.028	0.036	0.023
MMR* estimate	486	417	1210	541	707	442
95% CI for MMR	409 – 561	351 – 495	1027 – 1318	389 – 688	587 – 798	338 – 547

Note: * Maternal mortality ratio per 100, 000 LB, CI: Confidence Interval

258

259 Table 4 describes the estimated MMR by two different methods. The sisterhood method refers
 260 to around 10 years before the study and showed the overall MMR of 623/100,000 LB in Sidama
 261 Regional State. The survey with 5yr recall found 419/100,000 LB with slightly overlapping
 262 confidence intervals. Some districts had lower MMR in the survey of 5yr pregnancy recall than
 263 the sisterhood estimates reflecting 10 years back, whereas others like Aroresa had similar
 264 estimates in both.

265 **Table 4.** Estimates of maternal mortality ratio by two methods in Sidama Regional State,
 266 southern Ethiopia, 2020.

District	MMR using 5 year recall of pregnancy and birth outcome*			MMR using the indirect sisterhood method**				
	Live birth	Maternal death	MMR (95% CI)	Number of respondents	Pregnancy related deaths	Sister units exposed to risk	LTR	MMR (95% CI)
Aleta Chuko	2265	5	263 (58-467)	3722	136	5432	0.025	486 (409-561)
Aleta Wondo	2285	12	525 (207-842)	3929	128	5949	0.022	417 (351-495)
Aroresa	1694	21	1142 (693-1591)	2530	236	3848	0.061	1210 (1027-1318)
Daela	716	4	641 (77-1358)	990	48	1725	0.028	541 (389-688)
Hawassa- Zuriya	2237	2	114 (24-251)	3925	161	4446	0.036	707 (587-798)
Wondogenet	1405	4	258 (8-508)	2278	67	2938	0.023	442 (338-547)
Sidama Region	10602	48	419 (260-577)	17374	776	24338	0.032	623 (573-658)

Note: *Reference year: July 2014-June 2019, ** Reference year: 2010, Abbreviations: MMR: maternal mortality ratio per 100,000 live birth, LTR: life time risk for maternal death, CI: confidence interval

267

268

269

270 **Discussion**

271 **Principal findings**

272 By incorporating the sisterhood method in a household survey of pregnancy and birth
273 outcomes, we found a lifetime risk of maternal death of 3.2 %, with a corresponding MMR of
274 623 per 100,000 LB; the time reference was 2010. The remote district (Aroresa) had
275 significantly higher MMR. Sub analysis of MMR based on the respondents' age showed that
276 participants 15-29 years of age had a MMR; 545 per 100, 000 LB, reflecting 7 years before data
277 collection.

278 MMR estimated by a household survey that used a 5-year recall of pregnancy found an
279 estimated MMR of 419 per 100,000 LB and the sisterhood method referring to 10 years before
280 the study found 623 per 100,000 LB, slightly overlapping confidence intervals. Districts located
281 distant from the centre with poor infrastructure and inadequate skilled health personnel did
282 had similar MMR by both methods and seem to have persistently high MMR. Whereas,
283 districts located near to the centre with good infrastructure and adequate skilled health
284 personnel have lower estimated MMR by the 5-year recall than by the sisterhood method.

285 **Strengths and weaknesses of the study**

286 To the best of our knowledge, this is the first study describing maternal mortality estimates
287 employing the sisterhood method in Sidama Regional State, southern Ethiopia. The study was
288 conducted using large and representative sample of the region that demonstrated district level
289 variations. By assessing the MMR of the sisterhood method and the estimates from household

290 maternal mortality survey that used a 5-year pregnancy and birth outcomes [8], this study
291 identified variations in MMR reduction in different geographical areas of the region.

292 This study had some limitations similar to other studies employed the sisterhood method. The
293 maternal mortality estimates we reported refer a period around 10 years before data
294 collection; thus we were not able to show recent estimates using this method.

295 There might be over-reporting of deaths. Over reporting of deaths may arise due to inclusion of
296 deaths that occurred beyond six weeks of end of pregnancy or cases which were not related to
297 pregnancy. Multiple counting could also be the reason for over-estimation of maternal deaths
298 using the sisterhood method.

299 To minimize over-reporting, we used data collectors who were familiar with language and
300 culture of the study population. As a result of familiarity with local context, the data collectors
301 supported participants in identifying pregnancy state of deceased sisters and time of their
302 deaths. In addition, in households where more than one eligible participants born to the same
303 mother were found, we chose one of them by a lottery method which minimized multiple
304 counting. Despite our effort, there might be over-reporting in our study.

305 Underreporting could also be another limitation for this study. Deaths occurring at early stage
306 of pregnancy due to abortion or ectopic pregnancy and deaths of women not in marital union
307 might not be reported.

308 We did not have information on place of living for the sisters in the cohort. We used the
309 respondents' residences as proxy for the sisters' location. Some sisters might have moved to
310 other districts. Our study also lack information on age at death of respondents' sisters but used

311 respondents' age to observe recent deaths and show patterns of deaths across age groups. Age
312 of the respondents may not closely reflect the age of their sisters.

313 **Maternal mortality ratios and variations using the sisterhood method**

314 We found high MMR in the study area with time reference in 2010. Our result is significantly
315 higher than the findings of national DHS [6], which reported a MMR 412 per 100,000 LB (time
316 reference, 2009-2016). The DHS study uses the direct sisterhood method which included
317 detailed information on age at death, year of deaths and years since the death occurred which
318 contributed for precise maternal mortality estimates [15]. However, in our study, we used the
319 indirect sisterhood method in which such detailed information is not included. The inherent
320 weakness of the indirect sisterhood method lacking exact information on age at death, year of
321 death and years since the death occurred may overestimate the deaths[14].

322 The estimate from our study was also higher than a study from Kersa Health and Demographic
323 Surveillance Site (HDSS) [16], which estimated a MMR of 396 per 100,000 LB for the year 2010.
324 The variation could be explained by the differences of methods the two studies used for MMR
325 estimation, access to maternal health care and differences in documentation of maternal
326 deaths. The Kersa's study employed direct method of maternal mortality estimation, whereas
327 we used the indirect sisterhood method which might have caused over reporting of maternal
328 deaths [11]. Mothers in Kersa DHSS might have better access to health related information and
329 improved maternal health service utilization due to DHSS activities which in turn might have
330 contributed for reduction of maternal deaths in the area. In addition, in Kersa's DHSS there also

331 might be improved vital registration system that supported accurate documentation of
332 maternal deaths.

333 A study from Gamo-Gofa south-west Ethiopia, using the sisterhood method with a time
334 reference of 1998 found a MMR 1667 per 100,000 LB, which is higher than our study [11] but
335 carried out a decade before our study. The government has implemented many interventions
336 since that study to improve universal health coverage on maternal health services which might
337 have contributed for a reduction of maternal mortality in our area [1].

338 In our study, we found similar maternal mortality estimates both from men and women
339 respondents. This shows that the information obtained from men siblings is as valid as women
340 siblings in estimating maternal mortality using the indirect sisterhood method. This is in
341 agreement with report from south-west Ethiopia [11]. A study carried out using DHS data from
342 African countries also found similar findings [17].

343 This study found high maternal mortality estimates among the respondents in the 30-39 age
344 group; MMR: 703 per 100,000 LB compared to participants in 15-29 years of age. Our finding is
345 different from findings reported from Nigeria where they found the highest MMR among the
346 respondents in the 15-29 age group [10]. Though we did not have information on age of the
347 diseased sisters (only respondents), the difference in age at first marriage might have
348 contributed for the variations observed in two settings. In Ethiopia, the average age at first
349 marriage was reported to be 17 [6] while 13 years was reported from Mali [9].

350 Our study has also shown significant variations in MMR by districts of the respondents. This is in
351 agreement with the findings of study conducted in northern Nigeria and Mali [9, 10] where they

352 reported that maternal mortality differed by local government areas and villages respectively.
353 The areas with high maternal mortality in those studies were characterized by remoteness and
354 problematic access to health facilities. Previously, studies have used the place of the
355 respondents as a proxy location for the sisters of the respondents to describe the differences in
356 deaths based on the location of the respondents [9, 10].

357 The high MMR observed in Aroresa districts (the remote district) could be explained by poor
358 road facilities and difficult topography that might hamper access to health services. Aroresa
359 district is situated 181 km away from the regional centre [18]. The distance from the centre
360 may affect availability of services during emergency situation. Weak emergency obstetric care
361 compounded with lack of adequate and skilled personnel might have also contributed for the
362 high maternal mortality in the district. Low utilization rate of maternal health services could
363 also explain the high MMR in Aroresa district, and a paper from this area in 2018 reported
364 institutional delivery in 38% and use of contraceptives in 49% [18].

365 **Maternal mortality reduction in Sidama Regional State**

366 A study from India reported there existed regional and district level variations in maternal
367 mortality reduction across the country [19]. In our study of Hawassa Zuriya district (the central
368 district), the sisterhood study reflecting 10 years back gave a MMR of 707 and 5y recall gave
369 114 per 100.000 LB. The apparent reduction in MMR in this district could be attributed to
370 improved access to obstetric care during emergency situation as the district is located near to
371 the referral centre at the regional capital Hawassa [8] with good infrastructure and road facility.
372 Moreover, the district is characterized by having relatively high doctor to population ratio and

373 midwife to population ratio which might have improved access to skilled obstetric care [8]. An
374 Indonesian study demonstrated that investment in doctors and hospitals would significantly
375 reduce the MMR [20]. Contrary to Hawassa Zuriya district (the central district), in Aroresa
376 district (the remote district), the two studies found high MMR with no reduction of MMR over
377 the past years.

378 **Validity of maternal mortality measurements**

379 We incorporated the sisterhood questions to the ongoing maternal mortality household survey
380 that used a 5-year recall of pregnancy and birth outcomes to determine the MMR. We added 4
381 questions of the indirect sisterhood to the main study questionnaire and collected the data
382 from respondents residing in the same households sampled for the main study using the same
383 enumerators. There was no major cost and logistics incurred due to inclusion of the sisterhood
384 questions to the main household survey questionnaire. However, the main household study
385 incurred costs in terms of time, logistics and money. Despite the costs incurred, such studies
386 provide important information on magnitude and variations of MMR which is useful for
387 program planning, priority setting and resource allocation at lower administrative level.

388 We considered the size of the sample and sampling techniques while conducting the studies
389 using the two maternal mortality estimation methods in order to precisely estimate the MMR
390 in the region. Hence, large number of participants were included in both 5-year recall of
391 pregnancy and birth outcome household survey and the sisterhood study. In 5-year recall of
392 pregnancy and birth outcome household survey, we registered 10602 LB and 48 maternal
393 deaths in 8880 households visited. Our aim was to find 66 maternal deaths with MMR; 412

394 (95% CI: 324-524) per 100,000 LB. The MMR after the study was 419 (95% CI: 260-577) which is
395 within the 95% CI we anticipated initially [8]. For the sisterhood study, we had an interview
396 with 17444 siblings. This sample size was above the recommended 13,000 siblings for the
397 indirect sisterhood study in settings with similar magnitude of maternal mortality [13]. The
398 samples for both studies were selected using probability sampling and multistage cluster
399 sampling technique was employed to select the study participants.

400 The MMR we found using the sisterhood method was higher than the findings from other
401 studies in the same time reference [6]. Over-estimation of MMR from studies that used the
402 sisterhood method have been documented [11]. The MMR obtained from the household
403 survey was comparable with other national figures [6, 7].

404 Recall bias is a potential limitation both in the household survey study and the sisterhood study
405 as the conclusions of the studies were based on the information obtained from families
406 memorizing past events of maternal deaths. We believe that the recall bias is low in 5-year
407 recall of pregnancy and birth outcome study than the sisterhood as the deaths were occurred in
408 the recent years and the interviews were conducted with close relatives who lived together
409 with the deceased mother.

410 Under-estimation could also be another limitation for both studies. Stigma of pregnancies of
411 unmarried girls may lead to under-reporting. Maternal deaths occurring at early stage of
412 pregnancy due to abortion or ectopic pregnancy may be missed and regarded as non-maternal
413 deaths within the community.

414 **Policy and clinical implications**

415 Persistently high maternal mortality in districts found in remote area, far away from central city
416 with poor infrastructure and inadequate skilled health workers calls for the attention from the
417 government and the importance of instituting interventions tailored to the local context to
418 improve poor infrastructure and shortage of skilled health personnel in Sidama Region State.
419 Analysis of results from recent maternal mortality estimation using the 5-year recall of
420 pregnancy and birth outcome household survey with the sisterhood method suggests the
421 possibility of monitoring maternal mortality reduction at regional and district level using the
422 two estimation methods.

423 **Conclusion**

424 This study used two methods for estimating maternal deaths in Sidama, Ethiopia, one referring to last 5
425 years and the other 10 years back. The central districts have a lower MMR than before, but peripheral
426 districts still have high MMR. The Sidama Regional Health Bureau and respective district health
427 offices should implement interventions tailored to the local context to address variations and
428 accelerate reductions in MMR.

429 **Acknowledgements**

430 We are grateful to the participants of the study for their time and information. Our special
431 gratitude goes to Sidama Regional Health Bureau, respective district health offices and *kebele*
432 administrations in Ethiopia for their support and permission to conduct the study.

433 Authors' contributions

434 AZK, BL and SGH conceived and designed the experiments. AZK, BL and SGH performed the
435 experiments. AZK analysed the data. BL, AGT and SGH supervised and provided mentorship.
436 AZK drafted the article. All authors contributed to the writing, reviewed the article and
437 approved the final version of the manuscript.

438

439

440

441

442 References

- 443 1. Ayele AA, Tefera YG, East L. Ethiopia's commitment towards achieving sustainable development
444 goal on reduction of maternal mortality: There is a long way to go. *Women's Health*. 2021; 17.
445 doi: [10.1177/17455065211067073](https://doi.org/10.1177/17455065211067073) PMID: [34913391](https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/34913391/)
- 446 2. World Bank, World Health Organization. Global Civil Registration and Vital Statistics: Scaling up
447 Investment Plan 2015-2024. World Bank Group. 2014.
- 448 3. Abay ST, Gebre-Egziabher AG. Status and associated factors of birth registration in selected
449 districts of Tigray region, Ethiopia. *BMC Int Health Hum Rights*. 2020; 20 (20). doi:
450 [10.1186/s12914-020-00235-x](https://doi.org/10.1186/s12914-020-00235-x) PMID: [32727474](https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/32727474/)
- 451 4. Tesfaye G, Loxton D, Chojenta C, Assefa N, Smith R. Magnitude, trends and causes of maternal
452 mortality among reproductive aged women in Kersa health and demographic surveillance
453 system, eastern Ethiopia. *BMC Women's Health*. 2018; 18(198). doi: [10.1186/s12905-018-0690-](https://doi.org/10.1186/s12905-018-0690-1)
454 [1](https://doi.org/10.1186/s12905-018-0690-1) PMID: [30518368](https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/30518368/)
- 455 5. Legesse T, Abdulahi M, Dirar A. Trends and causes of maternal mortality in Jimma University
456 Specialized Hospital, southwest Ethiopia: a matched case-control study. *Int J Women's Health*.
457 2017;9: 307-313. doi: [10.2147/IJWH.S123455](https://doi.org/10.2147/IJWH.S123455) PMID: [28496370](https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/28496370/)
- 458 6. Central Statistical Agency Ethiopia: The DHS Program ICF Rockville Maryland, USA. Demographic
459 and Health Survey 2016 Final Report. 2017.
- 460 7. WHO, UNICEF, UNFPA, WORLD BANK, UNPD. Trends in Maternal Mortality: 2000-2017. WHO,
461 UNICEF, UNFPA, UNDP and The World Bank estimates. 2019.
- 462 8. Aschenaki Zerihun Kea, Bernt Lindtjorn, Achamyesh Gebretsadik, Hinderaker SG. Variation in
463 maternal mortality in Sidama Regional State, southern Ethiopia: A population based cross

- 464 sectional household survey. medRxiv 277635 [preprint] [posted 2022 July 14]. Available from:
465 <https://medrxiv.org/cgi/content/short/2022.07.14.22277635v1>
- 466 9. Aa I, Grove MA, Haugsja AH, Hinderaker SG. High maternal mortality estimated by the
467 sisterhood method in a rural area of Mali. BMC Pregnancy Childbirth. 2011; 11(56). doi:
468 [10.1186/1471-2393-11-56](https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2393-11-56) PMID: [21812951](https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/21812951/)
- 469 10. Sharma V, Brown W, Kainuwa MA, Leight J, Nyqvist MB. High maternal mortality in Jigawa State,
470 Northern Nigeria estimated using the sisterhood method. BMC Pregnancy Childbirth. 2017;
471 17(163). doi: [10.1186/s12884-017-1341-5](https://doi.org/10.1186/s12884-017-1341-5) PMID: [28577546](https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/28577546/)
- 472 11. Yaya Y, Lindtjorn B. High maternal mortality in rural south-west Ethiopia: estimate by using the
473 sisterhood method. BMC Pregnancy Childbirth. 2012; 12(136). doi: [10.1186/1471-2393-12-136](https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2393-12-136)
474 PMID: [23176124](https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/23176124/)
- 475 12. Graham W, Brass W, Snow RW. Estimating maternal mortality: the sisterhood method. Stud Fam
476 Plann.1989; 20(3):125-35. PMID: [2734809](https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/2734809/)
- 477 13. Hanley JA, Hagen CA, Shiferaw T. Confidence intervals and sample-size calculations for the
478 sisterhood method of estimating maternal mortality. Stud Fam Plann.1996; 27(4):220-227.
479 PMID: [8875734](https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/8875734/)
- 480 14. World Health Organization, United Nations Children's Fund. The Sisterhood Method for
481 Estimating Maternal Mortality: Guidance notes for potential users. 1997.
- 482 15. N. Rutenberg, J.M. Sullivan. Direct and indirect estimates of maternal mortality from the
483 sisterhood method. IRD/Macro International Incl. 1991.
- 484 16. Tesfaye G, Loxton D, Chojenta C, Assefa N, Smith R. Magnitude, trends and causes of maternal
485 mortality among reproductive aged women in Kersa health and demographic surveillance
486 system, eastern Ethiopia. BMC Women's Health. 2018; 18(198). doi: [10.1186/s12905-018-
487 0690-1](https://doi.org/10.1186/s12905-018-0690-1) PMID: [30518368](https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/30518368/)

- 488 17. Merdad L, Hill K, Graham W. Improving the measurement of maternal mortality: the sisterhood
489 method revisited. PLoS One. 2013; 8(4):e59834. doi: [10.1371/journal.pone.0059834](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0059834) PMID:
490 [23565171](https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/23565171/)
- 491 18. Limaso AA, Dangisso MH, Hibstu DT. Neonatal survival and determinants of mortality in Aroresa
492 district, Southern Ethiopia: a prospective cohort study. BMC Pediatr. 2020; 20(33). doi:
493 [10.1186/s12887-019-1907-7](https://doi.org/10.1186/s12887-019-1907-7) PMID: [31987037](https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/31987037/)
- 494 19. Srinivas Goli, Parul Puril, Pradeep S. Salve, Saseendran Pallikadavath, K.S. James. Estimates and
495 correlates of district-level maternal mortality ratio in India. PLOS GLOBAL PUBLIC HEALTH
496 2022;2(7). doi: [10.1371/journal.pgph.0000441](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pgph.0000441)
- 497 20. Cameron L, Contreras Suarez D, Cornwell K. Understanding the determinants of maternal
498 mortality: An observational study using the Indonesian Population Census. PLoS One. 2019;
499 14(6):e0217386. doi: [10.1371/journal.pone.0217386](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0217386) PMID: [31158243](https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/31158243/)

500