Evaluating the Evidence Quality Supporting the Role of Acupuncture for Herpes Zoster Pain : An Umbrella Review of Systematic Reviews and Meta-analyses

Jianhong Li^{1,2#}, Kun Liu³, Wenjia Ruan³, Guohua Lin^{4#}

¹The First Clinical Medical College of Guangzhou University of Chinese Medicine, Guangzhou, China; ²Guangdong Provincial Sanatorium for Cadres, Guangzhou, China; ³The Second Traditional Chinese Medicine Hospital of Guangdong Province, Guangzhou, China; ⁴Rehabilitation Center of the First Affiliated Hospital of Guangzhou University of Chinese Medicine, Guangzhou, China

Contributions: (I) Conception and design: Jianhong Li, Kun Liu; (II) Administrative support: Guohua Lin; (III) Provision of study materials or patients: Jianhong Li, Wenjia Ruan; (IV) Collection and assembly of data: All authors; (V) Data analysis and interpretation: Jianhong Li.; (VI) Manuscript writing: Jianhong Li; (VII) Final approval of manuscript: All authors.

Correspondence to: Jianhong Li. The First Clinical Medical College of Guangzhou University of Traditional Chinese Medicine, No. 12 Airport Road, Guangzhou 510405, China. E-mail: jianhong-cindy@163.com. Guohua Lin. Rehabilitation Center of the First Affiliated Hospital of Guangzhou University of Traditional Chinese Medicine, No. 16 Airport Road, Guangzhou 510405, China. E-mail: 312728595@qq.com

Objective: Acupuncture is one of the most effective means to treat herpes zoster, especially during the acute stage. It can shorten the duration of pain, with a low incidence of residual neuralgia. The aim of this review

was to assess the methodological and evidence quality of systematic reviews and meta-analyses on acupuncture for herpes zoster pain and provide clinical suggestions.

Methods: Eight databases were searched from their inception to Feb 2022. Methodological quality was evaluated by using the Assessment of Multiple Systematic Reviews 2, and the Grading of Recommendations Assessment Development and Evaluation was applied to evaluate the quality of the evidence.

Results: Nineteen SRs/MAs were included according to the inclusion criteria. Assessment of Multiple Systematic Reviews 2 results showed that the methodological quality was low for 16 studies and very low for 3 studies. According to the Grading of Recommendations Assessment Development and Evaluation, 43 outcome indicators were evaluated in this review, and the results showed that the evidence quality was high in three, medium in twelve, low in twenty-three, and very low in five. Compared with drugs for herpes zoster, acupuncture can reduce pain and the incidence of postherpetic neuralgia. Acupuncture at Jia ji acupoint was generally one of the most effective methods.

Conclusions: Our study showed that fire needle, acupuncture at Jia ji, pricking collaterals and bloodletting are beneficial therapies for the clinical practice of herpes zoster. However, the methodological and evidence quality of the included studies were low. More rigorous design and comprehensive investigations by systematic reviews and meta-analyses are needed.

Strengths and limitations of this study: This study is a comprehensive review to assess the methodological and evidence quality of recent SRs/MAs on acupuncture for herpes zoster pain, we mainly focused on pain symptoms, for example VAS score, time for pain relief, incidence of PHN, with qualitative analysis of efficiency. Only systematic reviews published in Chinese and English were included, so the conclusions of this study may not be generalizable. Some gray documents may be omitted. Subjective factors could not be completely eliminated during screening and evaluation.

PROSPERO registration number CRD42022304247.

Key words: herpes zoster; acupuncture; meta-analysis; umbrella review

Introduction

Herpes zoster (HZ) is caused by varicella-zoster virus infection, which is a DNA virus with neurophilic characteristics (1,2). After the first infection, it is hidden in the sensory ganglion. When immunity decreases due to infectious diseases and long-term immunosuppressive treatment, the latent virus can reactivate, causing inflammation and necrosis of the affected ganglion. HZ can occur at any age but is most common in elderly people (3-5). The natural course is 2-3 weeks. It is characterized by a banded distribution of blisters along one side of the skin nerve, often accompanied by severe and lasting neuralgia, local lymph node pain and progressive aggravation. The average incidence of acute HZ is 3-5 million people per year. Acupuncture can relieve acute pain, prevent or alleviate acute or chronic complications such as post-herpetic neuralgia (PHN). Drug therapy is the first-line treatment at present, including antiviral drugs (recommended for HZ patients over the age of 50), neurotrophic drugs and painkillers such as lidocaine patches and topical capsaicin (6). Conventional drugs such as antiviral drugs can shorten the healing time, but long-term excessive use may lead to side effects such as hemolytic anemia, thrombocytopenia or renal insufficiency. In addition, there are many taboos related to the treatment of elderly and frail patients (7).

Acupuncture has been used to treat HZ in China for a long time, and acupuncture is an effective treatment in reduction in pain, especially HZ-related pain. Chinese medicine experts generally recommend acupuncture or acupuncture-based methods such as fire needle, electroacupuncture, local acupuncture, pricking and

bloodletting, cupping, moxibustion and other treatments (1) during the acute stage of HZ (8). Acupuncture treatment of HZ is listed as a grade I in the "Modern Acupuncture and moxibustion Disease Spectrum" (9). Systematic reviews and meta-analyses (SRs/MAs) on acupuncture treatment for HZ have appeared since 2007. However, these SRs/MAs have not been systematically evaluated, we conduct this umbrella review to assess these studies to provide recommendations for conducting high-quality SRs/MAs.

Methods

Data retrieval strategy

The following databases were searched from their inception to Feb 2022: Embase, PubMed, Embase, Cochrane Library, Chinese Biomedical Literature Database (CBM), Chinese Medical Current Content (CMCC), China Science and Technology Journal Database (VIP database), Wan-Fang Database, China National Knowledge Infrastructure (CNKI) and Citation Information by National Institute of Informatics (CiNii). The following keywords were used: acupuncture, acupoint, electroacupuncture, fire needle, spinous bloodletting, auricularpoint, herpes zoster, systematic review, meta-analysis, etc. Detailed retrieval strategies are shown in Table 1.

Table 1 Retrieval Strategy.

Inclusion and exclusion criteria

Types of studies

SRs/MAs based on randomized controlled trials (RCTs) and controlled clinical trials (CCTs).

Types of subjects

Patients with herpes zoster were enrolled in accordance with the consensus of Chinese experts (3),

regardless of sex, age, race, and region.

Types of interventions

The treatment group included patients receiving acupuncture, fire needle, puncture and cupping, skin acupuncture or other treatments in combination with the aforementioned treatments; the control group included patients receiving drug therapy (antiviral acyclovir or traditional Chinese medicine, etc.).

Types of outcome measurements

The outcome measurements were efficacy (refer to "Guiding Principles for Clinical Study of New Chinese Medicines"), pain evaluation (pain relief time, visual analogue scale VAS), and incidence of PHN. Studies were excluded according to the following criteria:
□ repeatedly published literature or review comments;
②non-SRs/MAs; ③clinical trials only for the study of postherpetic neuralgia; ④conference papers,
abstracts, dissertations, etc.; ⑤documents with incomplete content and unable to extract data.

Data extraction

Two trained researchers independently screened the literature, extracted and cross-checked the data. In cases of disagreement, the third reviewer was consulted to help judge and make up for the lack of data as much as possible. The data extraction table was generated in Excel, including the title, author, year of publication, number of studies, number of cases, interventions, outcome measurements. The consistency among evaluators was evaluated by the Kappa value.

Evaluation of the methodological quality of the included studies

Two evaluators used AMSTAR-2 (10) to evaluate the methodological quality of the included studies under the premise of hiding the author. The AMSTAR-2 contains 16 items in total, of which items 2, 4, 7, 9, 11, 13 and 15 were key items to evaluate the included studies. Each was evaluated as "yes", "no" or "partial yes" according to the evaluation criteria. According to the evaluated result, the quality was defined as high,

medium, low, or very low.

Evaluation of the quality of evidence of the included studies

Two evaluators focused on efficiency, VAS score and incidence of PHN and applied GRADE (11) to

evaluate the evidence quality from the following five aspects: research limitation, inconsistency, indirectness,

imprecision and publication bias. VAS scores were recombined and analyzed (12).

Evaluation of the curative effect

The quantitative analysis results included in the systematic evaluation outcome measurements are summarized in the form of relative risk (RR), odds ratio (OR), standardized mean difference (SMD), mean difference (MD), 95% confidence interval (CI) and efficiency.

Results

Results of the literature search and selection process

According to the retrieval strategy, a total of 77 related articles were selected, 36 duplicates were removed, 3 studies were excluded after record screening, and 19 studies were included (13-31). The entire process and results are shown in Figure 1.

Figure 1 Flow chart of the literature selection process.

Description of the included reviews

All included studies were published from 2007 to 2022, including 5 English articles, and the rest were in Chinese. The 318 included studies involved 13490 cases. Among them, 3 articles (14-16) included RCTs and CCTs, and 16 articles (13,17-31) were RCTs. Thirteen articles (13,15,18,19,21-23,25-31) used the bias risk assessment tool recommended by Cochrane. Sixteen articles (13-22, 24-26) described two evaluators for

data extraction and analysis. The basic characteristics of the included studies are shown in Table 2.

Table 2 Basic characteristics of the included studies.

Evaluation results of the AMSTAR-2 and GRADE studies

Methodological quality of the included SRs/MAs

In the included SRs/MAs, 3 (13,24,25) were rated as medium quality, and 16 (14-23,26-31) were rated as low quality. Only item 1 was evaluated in 19 studies, and item 10 was evaluated in 19 studies; item 16 was unevaluated in 18 studies. The results are shown in Table 3.

Table 3 Results of AMSTAR-2 evaluation.

Quality of the evidence from the included SRs/MAs

In the included SRs/MAs, 43 outcome indicators were evaluated in this review, and quality of the evidence was high in three, medium in eleven, low in twenty-three and very low in five. Research limitations was the most commonly degraded item, followed by imprecision, inconsistency, publication bias and indirectness. Detailed information is shown in Table 4.

Table 4 Results of the GRADE evaluation.

Main outcome indicators and levels of evidence

Efficacy of acupuncture for the treatment of herpes zoster

Referring to "Guiding Principles for Clinical Study of New Chinese Medicines", efficacy rate was defined as partial regression of skin lesions, improvement in clinical symptoms, and 70% > syndrome score reduction \geq 50%. Twelve systematic reviews (13-14, 16, 19, 21, 23, 26) evaluated the efficacy rate. The

curative effect of the experimental group was better than the control group, and the results are shown in Table 3.

The rate of acupuncture efficacy for attenuating pathological changes and improving pain was more than 30% compared with conventional drugs (13), and the curative effect of the experimental group was better than that of the control group (14). There was a significant difference between the Jia ji acupoint and control groups, RR=1.07, 95% CI (0.98~1.16) (16).

The effect of the treatment group was better than that of the control group, and the difference was significant (21). The overall effect of fire needles on the treatment of herpes zoster was better than medicine (23). In the study of Geng (27), all 17 studies reported that the efficacy of the blood puncture and cupping group was better than that medicine group, and the difference was statistically significant.

Regarding the definition of efficacy, Coyle ME (13), Fu (15), Wang (20), Lin (21), Shi (22), and Li Dong (23) did not specifically describe the efficacy rate.

Secondary outcome indicators and evidence levels

Pain relief time

Six systematic reviews (13,14,18,19,22,25) evaluated the time of relieving pain. There were significant differences in pain relief between acupuncture and valaciclovir combined with vitamin B1 and saline application; the pain in the acupuncture group disappeared 6.59 days earlier than that in the oral and local use of acyclovir group (13); the electroacupuncture group could relieve pain 13 days earlier (14); the analgesic effect of the treatment group was better than the control group (18); and fire needle could relieve pain 3 days earlier (19). Pain relief time in the fire needle group was significantly shortened (22). In the experimental group, pain relief time was significantly shorter than that in the control group (25).

VAS score

Eight systematic reviews (14-16, 17, 22, 24-26) evaluated VAS scores. The VAS score in the experimental group was lower than that in the control group (14, 25, 26); the electroacupuncture score was mostly lower than that medicine group (15), and the difference in VAS score between Jiaji acupoint treatment and carbamazepine, acyclovir and routine acupuncture control groups was statistically significant (16). The differences in VAS score in the acupuncture group was higher than that in medicine group (17). Compared with medicine, fire needle was not exact in relieving the pain of herpes zoster, 1²=93% (23). VAS scores after treatment mainly by puncture and cupping were lower than those in the antiviral group (31). Lower VAS scores were observed in the fire needle group (27). Acupuncture combined with puncture and cupping is more advantageous in reducing VAS score (33). Acupuncture can alleviate pain significantly (24). The fire needle group was superior to medicine group (30). There was no significant difference between the treatment group and the control group (29). In this study, 30 clinical studies involved in 8 systematic reviews of VAS scores (32-60) were reanalyzed by Revam5.3 software. The results are shown in Figure 2.

Figure 2 Forest map of the VAS score after acupuncture-based treatment for herpes zoster

Incidence of PHN

Fourteen systematic reviews (13,14,19,20-27,29-31) evaluated the incidence of PHN. The results are shown in Table 4. One month after the disappearance of the rash, there was a statistically significant difference in the incidence of PHN, but there was no significant difference, 3 months after the disappearance of the rash, RR=0.29, 95%CI (0.16, 0.53), $I^2=0\%$ (13). The differences in the incidence of PHN was significant 30 days after treatment, RR=0.23, 95%CI (0.11,0.51), P=0.0002, and 60 days after treatment, RR=0.33, 95%CI (0.12, 0.91), RR=0.33, 95%CI, 0.03 (22). In addition, at 30 days after treatment, there was a significant difference in the incidence, RR=0.23, which was lower in the fire needle group than in medicine group (19).

Safety of acupuncture treatment for herpes zoster

Six systematic reviews (13,17,19,20,28,29) evaluated adverse events, and Coyle ME (13) reported subcutaneous hematoma and hemorrhage in the experimental group. Zhao (17) did not mention whether there were side effects. Wang (20) discussed the adverse reactions of fire needles, including dizziness and fatigue and a mild decrease in white blood cells. Wang (19) also reported 1 case of skin erythema with pruritus, 3 cases of gastrointestinal reaction and 3 cases of diarrhea in the group of fiery needle combined with red light. Only one of the 23 RCTs included in Yin (28) reported adverse reactions to electroacupuncture at the Jiaji acupoint.

Discussion

Summary of the evidence

The clinical effect of acupuncture for HZ pain is certain. The AMSTAR-2 results showed that the methodological quality was low for 16 studies and very low for 3 studies. According to GRADE, 43 outcome indicators were evaluated in this review, and the evidence quality was high in three, medium in twelve, low in twenty-three, and very low in five. The methodological and evidence quality of Coyle ME is the highest (13). Three papers included both RCT and CCT studies, which affected the strength of evidence (15-17).

Defects in study design and implementation, such as a lack of registration, relaxed research criteria, and potential risk of bias, such as repeated publication and inclusion, may affect the authenticity and reliability of the results (12). The downgrading of inaccuracy for GRADE, for example the hidden research distribution scheme, lack of blind method, withdrawal consent situation, less than 400 total cases, wide confidence interval, invalid values, and small sample size (16,23). Mixed intervention methods, publication 10

bias, and less overlap of confidence intervals, the value of I^2 was large may impact on clinical significance (18). A preliminary plan, register on the PROSPERO platform or Cochrane website, funding information report, describe the method of data extraction and the process of obtaining or confirming the data from the author are recommended. Conduct the application of AMSTAR-2, GRADE and other evaluation tools (12) to objectively improve the reporting and quality of SAs/MAs (66).

Implications for practice and research

Acupuncture has broad prospects in the treatment of pain-related diseases, including HZ. For the form of acupuncture, acupuncture methods at Jia ji point may be superior and safe compared with Western medicine (15,28). Pricking collaterals, bloodletting and fire needles (13-14, 16, 19, 21, 23, 24, 25) can shorten the time to pain relief and reduce the incidence of PHN earlier (27-29). The A shi (tender point around the rashes), EX-B2 (Jia ji), and SJ6 (Zhi gou) acupoints are commonly adopted in dermatology clinic. Electroacupuncture at the Jiaji acupoint can shorten the herpes healing time and relieve pain (64). Acupuncture combined with cupping bloodletting puncture is superior to conventional medicine in improving the total efficacy rate, reducing VAS score, shortening the scab time and reducing the incidence of PHN (21,30,31,33). Fire needle therapy is suggested as one of the routine treatments for herpes zoster (21,23,27).

Limitations

Only systematic reviews published in Chinese and English were included, so the conclusions of this study may not be generalizable. Some gray documents may be omitted. Subjective factors could not be completely eliminated during screening and evaluation.

Conclusion

This study showed that acupuncture could be a beneficial therapy for herpes zoster pain, but there is limited credibility due to the low methodological and evidence quality of the included studies. More rigorous design and comprehensive investigations by SRs/MAs are needed to provide strong evidence for convincing conclusions.

Acknowledgments

Funding: Project of National Natural Science Foundation of China: 81574061; Scientific Research Project of Guangdong Bureau of Traditional Chinese Medicine: 20181085; Project of "Innovation and Strong Institute" of the First Affiliated Hospital of Guangzhou University of Traditional Chinese Medicine: 2019QN23.

References

1.Werner RN, Nikkels AF, Marinović B, et al. European consensus-based (S2k) Guideline on the Management of Herpes Zoster - guided by the European Dermatology Forum (EDF) in cooperation with the European Academy of Dermatology and Venereology (EADV), Part 2: Treatment. J *Eur Acad Dermatol Venereol.* 2017;31(1):20-29.

2.Lewis DJ, Schlichte MJ, Dao H. Atypical disseminated herpes zoster: management guidelines in immunocompromised patients. *Cutis.* 2017;100(5):321-324.

 Herpes Zoster expert consensus working Group of Dermatologists Branch of Chinese Medical Association. Consensus of Chinese experts on herpes zoster *Chinese Journal of Dermatology*, 2018. 51(6): 403-408.

4.Wang Guanqing, Li Xiaoxia. Clinical Epidemiology and Prevention of Herpes Zoster. *Chinese Journal of* 12 Dermatology and venereology, 2018 (11): 1325-1330

5. Failla V, Nickels AF. Ustekinumab and herpes zoster. *Dermatology*. 2011;222(2):119-122.

6.Phuc L, Michael R. Herpes zoster infection. BMJ. 2019;364: k5095.

7.Yu S, Wan Y, Wan Q, et al. Chinese expert consensus on diagnosis and treatment of postherpetic neuralgia (Chinese). *Chin J Pain Med* 2016; 22:161–7.

8.Ursini, T., Tontodonati, M., Manzoli, L., et al. Acupuncture for the treatment of severe acute pain in herpes zoster: results of a nested, open-label, randomized trial in the VZV Pain Study. *BMC Complementary and Alternative Medicine*, (2011)11, 46.

9. Du Yuanhao. Modern acupuncture disease spectrum Beijing: people's Health Publishing House, 2008.

10. Tao Huan, Yang Letian, Ping an, et al. Interpretation of AMSTAR-2, a quality evaluation tool for systematic evaluation of random or non-random preventive studies. *Chinese Journal of evidence-based Medicine*, 2018.18 (01): 101-108.

11. Howard Balshem, Mark Helfanda, Holger J.Schunemann, et al. GRADE guidelines: III evidence quality classification. *Chinese Journal of evidence-based Medicine*, 2011.11 (4): 451-455.

12. Yuan Jinqiu, Liu Yali, Yang Kehu, et al. Systematic evaluation and reevaluation were included in the investigation of the quality evaluation methods of the study. *Chinese Journal of evidence-based Medicine*, 2012.12 (02): 238-242.

13. Coyle ME, Liang H, Wang K, et al. Acupuncture plus moxibustion for herpes zoster: A systematic review and Meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. *Dermatologic Therapy*,2017,30 (4): e12468.

14.Chen Lizhi, Xie Wei, Fan Li, et al. Systematic evaluation of randomized controlled trials of electroacupuncture in the treatment of herpes zoster. *Hebei traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2013.35 (4): 593-596.

15. Fu Ling, Gao Cen. Meta analysis of clinical controlled studies on Jiaji acupoint in the treatment of herpes zoster. *Chinese Journal of Dermatology and venereology of Integrated traditional Chinese and Western Medicine*, 2009 8 (2): 112-117.

16. Han Zhengjun, Ren Chaozhan, du Xiaozheng. Meta Analysis of Randomized controlled Clinical Trials of Acupuncture and moxibustion in the treatment of Acute Herpes Zoster. *Research of traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2013.26 (2): 56-59.

17. Zhao Ting, Wang Yinghui. Systematic Review of Randomized controlled Trials of Acupuncture and moxibustion in the treatment of Herpes Zoster. *Shanghai Journal of Acupuncture and moxibustion*, 2007: 26
(6): 30-33.

18. Yu Xianmin, Zhu Guomiao, Chen Yuelai, et al. Systematic Review of domestic Literature on Acupuncture treatment of Herpes Zoster. *Chinese Acupuncture and moxibustion*, 2007. 27 (7): 536-540.

19. Wang Jinghua, Chen Hongpei, Chen Jia. Systematic Review of Randomized controlled Trials of Fire Needle in the treatment of Herpes Zoster. *Journal of Clinical Acupuncture and moxibustion*, 2009. 25 (6): 16-18.

20. Wang Wenxiu, Rong Liyang, Lin Guohua, et al. Meta Analysis of Randomized controlled trial of Fire Needle in the treatment of Herpes Zoster. *Journal of Guangzhou University of traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2019.7.36 (01): 64-69.

21. Lin Li, Yan Xiaoning, Li Wenbin, et al. Meta Analysis of Randomized controlled Trials of Blood-letting puncture and bloodletting in the treatment of Herpes Zoster *Hainan Medical College News*: 1-9 2020-06-09.

22. Shi Qiaoyun, Ding Dingming. Meta Analysis of Randomized controlled Trials of Fire Needle in the treatment of Herpes Zoster *Guangxi traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2019, 42 (06): 63-67.

23. Li Dong, Mo ZM, Zhang RW, et al. Is fire needle superior to Western medication for herpes zoster? A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Acupuncture Tuina Sci*,2019,17 (5): 312-320.

24.Cui Y, Wang F, Li H, etc. Efficacy of Acupuncture for Herpes Zoster: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *Complement Med Res.* 2021;28(5):463-472.

25.Qi T, Lan H, Zhong C, etc. Systematic review and meta-analysis: the effectiveness and safety of acupuncture in the treatment of herpes zoster. *Ann Palliat Med.* 2022 Feb;11(2):756-765.

26. Zhao N Q, Lai L, Wang X, et al. Fire needling for herpes zoster: A systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized clinical trials *Advances in Integrative Medicine*, 2019, 6: S150.

27. Geng Le, Feng Guiyu, Wang Shan, Wang Peng. Systematic evaluation and Meta analysis of the efficacy and safety of collateral puncture and cupping in the treatment of acute herpes zoster *Journal of Guangzhou University of traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2021. 38 (11): 2447-2455.

28. Yin Zihan, Zhang Qiongyue, Xu Guixing, et al. Systematic evaluation of the efficacy and safety of electroacupuncture at Jiaji acupoint and simple western medicine in the treatment of herpes zoster J. *Nursing Research*, 2020, 34 (16): 2809-2819.

29. Lin Shaoxia, Lu Chunjian, Yuan Jinyun, et al. Meta Analysis and GRADE Evaluation of Acupuncture combined with Cupping in the treatment of Herpes Zoster *Journal of Guangzhou University of traditional* 15

Chinese Medicine, 2022.39 (1): 136-142.

30. Han Songjie, Zhong Changming, Shang Hongcai, etc. Meta analysis of clinical efficacy and safety of acupuncture in the treatment of herpes zoster *World Science and Technology-Modernization of traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2020.22 (9): 3374-3383.

31. Xie Huan, Peng Yongjun, Wu Kerui, et al. Meta Analysis and systematic Evaluation of Therapeutic effect and analgesic effect of Acupuncture on Herpes Zoster *Journal of Hainan Medical College*, 2021.27 (18): 1416-1425.

32. Zou Fei. 32 cases of herpes zoster were treated by electroacupuncture combined with ear tip bloodletting *Jiangxi traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2006 (09): 52.

33. Li Lixia, Chen Chuyun, Lin Guohua, et al. Clinical observation on 27 cases of acute herpes zoster treated by electroacupuncture *New traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2011, 43 (03): 103-105.

34. Yang Jiashun, Sun Yuanzheng, Meng Qinghui, etc. A comparative study of electroacupuncture combined with percussion acupuncture in the treatment of herpes zoster *Journal of Liaoning University of traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2009.11 (05): 148-149.

35. Li Xuan, Zhang Hongxing, Huang Guofu, et al. Randomized controlled observation on the efficacy of electroacupuncture Jiaji combined with surrounding acupuncture in the treatment of herpes zoster *Acupuncture Research*, 2009. 34 (02): 125-127. 135.

36. Li Lili, Mao Liya. Clinical observation on 33 cases of middle-aged and senile herpes zoster treated by filiform fire needle combined with peripheral acupuncture *Journal of Gansu University of traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2016.33 (05): 54-57.

37. Huang Zhengde, Fan Hua. Observation on the efficacy of fire acupuncture combined with Qingdai Powder in the treatment of 30 cases of acute herpes zoster *Yunnan Journal of traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2013.34 (07): 52-53.

38. Jiang Fuqiong, Wang Xiaoqiong, Wang Yanmei, et al. Observation on the efficacy of fire needle combined with red light in the treatment of 29 cases of herpes zoster *Yunnan Journal of traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2015.36 (11): 51-53.

39. Zeng Li. Clinical observation of Fire Needle combined with Flash Cupping in the treatment of Herpes Zoster *Journal of practical Hospital Clinical*, 2015.12 (01): 149-150.

40. Zhang Xiao, Wang Qiangqiang. 50 cases of acute herpes zoster were treated by fire acupuncture and electroacupuncture combined with acupuncture. *Zhejiang Journal of Integrated traditional Chinese and Western Medicine*, 2016.26 (02): 138-140.

41. Yang Qingyu, Chen Yunxi. Evaluation of clinical effect of fire needle combined with pricking and cupping in the treatment of herpes zoster *Modern diagnosis and treatment*, 2016.27 (07): 1201-1202.

42. Yuan Hui. Clinical observation on 34 cases of Herpes Zoster treated by puncture and Cupping combined with mild moxibustion. *Jiangsu traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2015. 47 (11): 51-52.

43. Zhu Jiong, Wu Yifeng. Observation on the efficacy of collateral puncture and cupping combined with suspended moxibustion in the treatment of herpes zoster *Shanghai Journal of Acupuncture and moxibustion*, 2007 (11): 22-24.

44. Yu Mei, Li Ling. Clinical analysis of 34 cases of herpes zoster treated by blood-letting puncture and cupping *Chinese Journal of Modern Medicine*, 2014 .16 (11): 63-64.

45. Ren Yule, Zhu Hongmei. Clinical observation on 40 cases of herpes zoster treated by collateral puncture and cupping *Clinical Research of traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2014. 6 (11): 37-38.

46. Xing Yukui, Pan Jiajia, Liu Junwei. Clinical observation on 56 cases of herpes zoster treated by collateral puncture and cupping *Food and Medicine in the Capital*, 2017, 24 (12): 112-113.

47. Jiang Guilin, Zhu Jiexuan, Wu Changzheng. Effect of puncture and cupping on pain and anxiety of acute herpes zoster *Journal of Clinical Chinese Medicine*, 2019, 31 (8): 1574-1576.

48. Hong Feng, Yang Huan. Observation on the efficacy of longan acupoint bloodletting combined with local acupuncture in the treatment of herpes zoster *Journal of practical traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2014.30 (7): 645-646.

49. Pan Dong. Clinical observation on 32 cases of acute herpes zoster treated by blood-letting puncture and cupping *Medical Information*, 2013, (18): 107108.

50. Li Yangfan, Lin Hai. Observation on the efficacy of pricking blood and cupping in the treatment of acute pain in patients with herpes zoster *Global traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2019. 12 (8): 1278-1280.

51. Zheng Zhi, Wei Wen, Wen Sheng. Clinical observation of bloodletting therapy combined with cupping in the treatment of herpes zoster *Shanghai Journal of Acupuncture and moxibustion*, 2014.

52. Chen Wei, Liu Guizhen, Yao Qiuhong. Clinical observation of venipuncture and cupping in the treatment of acute herpes zoster *Shanghai Journal of Acupuncture and moxibustion*, 2014: 1132-1134.

53. Liu Fengnian. Effect of filiform fire needle combined with flash cupping in the treatment of herpes zoster *Skin Diseases and venereal Diseases*, 2019, 41 (3): 382-383.

54. Sun Jia. Clinical observation of filiform fire needle combined with collateral puncture therapy in the treatment of herpes zoster *Inner Mongolia traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2019, 38 (3): 66-67.

55. Wang Wenda. 40 cases of acute herpes zoster treated with filiform fire needle *Zhejiang Journal of traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2017. 52 (12): 907.

56. Huang Hongyao, Xiao Wenxin, Lin Qingxia, et al. Observation on the efficacy of fiery needle combined with bloodletting therapy in the treatment of acute herpes zoster *Clinical Research of traditional Chinese Medicine*, 2017, 9 (12): 99-101.

57. Mao Liya. Observation on the Therapeutic effect of Fire Needle combined with Peripheral Acupuncture in the treatment of Middle-aged and senile Herpes Zoster C. / 2016 Annual meeting of Gansu Acupuncture Society and training course on the Design of Scientific Research ideas of Acupuncture and Massage Zheng's training course on Clinical Application of Acupuncture.

58. Ma Jie. Clinical study of Fire Needle combined with Cupping in the treatment of Acute Herpes Zoster D. Urumqi: *Xinjiang Medical University*, 2017

59.Kong MJ. Clinical Study on the Therapy of Fire Needle Treating Acute Herpes Zoster Based on the Theory of Removing the Stagnation of Fire. *Guangzhou: Master Thesis of Guangzhou University of Chinese Medicine*, 2012

60.Dong F. Clinical Curative Effect Study on the Therapy of Fire Needle Treating Acute Herpes Zoster Based on the Theory of Removing the Stagnation of Fire. *Guangzhou: Master Thesis of Guangzhou University of Chinese Medicine*, 2013.

61.Corvaisier M ,Delneste Y ,Jeanvoine H ,et a1. IL-26 is over-expressed in rheumatoid arthritis and induces

proinflammatory cytokine production and Th17 cell generation. Plos Biology, 2012, 10(9):e1001395.

62.Ji-Sheng Han. Acupuncture: neuropeptide release produced by electrical stimulation of different frequencies *Trends in neurosciences*, 2003, 26(1):17-22.

63.Li Qian, Lin Shiyu, Lu Liming, et al. Study on acupoint selection of Professor Lin Guohua in the treatment of herpes zoster based on cluster analysis *Hainan Medicine*, 2018. 29 (9): 1228-1230.

64.Lin Guohua, Kong Meijun, Zhong Zhenmin, et al. Relationship between duration effect and analgesic effect of different acupuncture methods in the treatment of herpes zoster *Chinese Journal of traditional Chinese Medicine Information*, 2012pi 19 (11): 7-10.+.

65.Li Tingqian, Liu Xuemei, Zhang Mingming, et al. Investigation on the current situation of systematic review / Meta analysis of traditional Chinese medicine published in Chinese journals *Chinese Journal of evidence-based Medicine*, 2007. 7 (3): 180-188.

66.Ni Ping, Shi Jingpu. Update and prospect of systematic review and Meta analysis re-evaluation methods *Chinese Journal of evidence-based Cardiovascular Medicine*, 2018. 10 (10): 1170-1174.