Context and health: a systematic review of natural experiments among migrant populations

Louise Biddle PhD a,b, Maren Hintermeier MSc a,b, Diogo Costa PhD a, Zahia Wasko MSc b, Kayvan Bozorgmehr Prof. a,b*

a Department of Population Medicine and Health Services Research, School of Public Health, Bielefeld University, Universitätsstraße 25, 33501 Bielefeld, Bielefeld, Germany

b Section Health Equity Studies & Migration, Department of General Practice and Health Services Research, University Hospital Heidelberg, Im Neuenheimer Feld 130.3, 69120 Heidelberg, Germany

* Corresponding author

Correspondence to:
Prof. Dr. med. Kayvan Bozorgmehr (MSc)
Department of Population Medicine and Health Services Research
School of Public Health
Bielefeld University
Universitätsstraße 25
33501 Bielefeld
Germany
kayvan.bozorgmehr@uni-bielefeld.de
SUMMARY
Background: Studies on contextual effects on health often suffer from compositional bias and selective migration into contexts. Natural experiments among migrants may allow for the causal effect of contexts in generating health inequalities to be examined. We synthesised the evidence on and health from natural experiments among migrant populations.

Methods: Systematic literature review searching the databases PubMed/MEDLINE, The Cochrane Library, Web of Science, CINAHL and Google Scholar for literature published until October 2022. 5870 studies were screened independently in duplicate using pre-defined criteria for inclusion: quantitative natural experiment methodology, migrant study population, context factor as treatment variable and health or healthcare outcome variable. Synthesis without meta-analysis was performed following data extraction and quality appraisal.

Findings: The 46 included natural experiment studies provide causal evidence for the negative effects of neighbourhood disadvantage on physical health and mortality, while finding mixed effects on mental health. Studies comparing migrants with those that stayed behind demonstrate the detrimental effects of migration and adverse post-migratory contexts on physical health and mortality, while demonstrating favourable effects for mental health and child health. Natural experiments of policy contexts indicate the negative impacts of restrictive migration and social policies on healthcare utilization, mental health and mortality as well as the positive health effects when restrictions are lifted.

Interpretation: Natural experiments can serve as powerful tools in reducing bias through self-selection. With careful consideration of causal pathways, results from migration contexts can serve as a magnifying glass for the effects of context for other population groups. Studies demonstrate the negative impacts for health which lie at the nexus of context and health. At the same time, they uncover the potential of health and welfare programs to counteract the disadvantages created by othering processes and promote healthy (post-migratory) contexts.

Funding: German Science Foundation (FOR: 2928/ GZ: BO5233/1-1).

Keywords: natural experiments; systematic review; contextual effects; neighbourhood effects; migration
Panel 1: research in context

Evidence before this study
We searched PubMed/MEDLINE to identify pre-existing reviews on contextual effects on health with the following search terms: ((review[Title/Abstract]) AND (((context[Title]) OR (neighbourhood[Title]) OR (small-area[Title]))) OR (health[Title])). Eight reviews existed and pointed to consistent, but small effects of neighbourhood disadvantage on physical and mental health outcomes, as well as on child and adolescent health. However, these reviews also point to the methodological shortcomings of most studies, which are unable to disentangle compositional from contextual effects. In order to improve causal inference, natural experiments are needed. Natural experiments have previously delivered crucial evidence on the causal effects of public health interventions including suicide prevention, air pollution control, public smoking bans and alcohol taxation.

Added value of this study
This review uses natural experiments among migrants to contribute to the existing evidence base by synthesising insights on the causal mechanism of contextual effects. It uses migration as an example to assess how contextual factors, ranging from policy environments to neighbourhood characteristics, generate or exacerbate inequalities among societies. We thereby circumvent and avoid limitations of other reviews on these topics, by exploiting five main sources of variation of contextual exposures: residential dispersal, arbitrary eligibility cut-offs, on-/off-timing of events, regional variation, and place of birth. Based on these, we identify three main types of natural experiments among migrant populations: 1) Studies “using” migration as an example to analyse contextual health effects or neighbourhoods in the post-migration phase; 2) Studies examining interactions between changes in environmental factors following migration processes as compared to those staying behind; and 3) Studies using natural experiments to study policy effects. The synthesised evidence confirms and provides causal evidence for the negative effects of neighbourhood disadvantage on physical health and mortality, while effects on mental health are mixed. The body of literature demonstrates that migration processes can unfold detrimental effects on physical health and mortality through adverse post-migratory contexts, while also demonstrating favourable effects for mental health and child health depending on the respective context. Our synthesis further provides causal evidence for the negative impacts of restrictive migration and social policies on healthcare utilization, mental health and mortality as well as the positive health effects when restrictions are lifted.

Implications of all available evidence
The evidence presented here demonstrates the health disadvantages faced by migrants in the immediate post-settlement phase, which are exacerbated by restrictive health, social and visa policies. More broadly, however, the evidence points to neighbourhood disadvantage as a crucial and causal mechanism underlying health inequities at a societal level. At the same time, studies uncover the potential of health and welfare programs to counteract the disadvantages created by othering processes and instead promote healthy contexts. Such evidence is valid beyond migrant populations and allows inference of the positive effects of inclusive health and welfare programs for other marginalized groups and the population as a whole.
INTRODUCTION

A long research tradition in public health and social epidemiology has shown important effects of contextual factors of the place of residence on diverse health outcomes, including mortality, chronic diseases and mental health. Such research has examined the influence and impact on health of socio-demographic (e.g. area-level poverty, inequality or deprivation), physical (e.g. green space, noise pollution or housing quality), or social attributes of neighbourhoods (e.g. social capital, safety and community participation). Furthermore, health and social policies also shape living contexts and thereby impact people’s health status. Adverse contextual conditions have been found to disproportionately affect vulnerable subgroups. However, studies on contextual effects are often limited in their ability to disentangle contextual from compositional effects. Because of self-selection of individuals into neighbourhoods, many studies suffer from compositional bias and are thus unable to draw causal inferences. Experiments allocating individuals to places of residence exist but are rare for ethical and practical reasons.

Natural experiments allow for the causal effect of contexts to be examined. They can be broadly defined as events where the allocation into exposed and unexposed groups are not under the control of the researcher and subject to a random (or quasi-random) process. The allocation may be the result of truly “natural” forces, such as extreme weather or geographical events, but also phenomena under human control, such as quasi-random policy introduction or administrative processes. Natural experiments minimise selection bias in the allocation process. This makes them particularly valuable for contextual health research, including the causal effects of public health policies or social and economic policies.

Natural experiments are scarce, but when they intersect with human migration they offer powerful opportunities to study the effects of changing environments and contexts, including the consequences of migration-specific, but also broader health and social policies. Human migration is a large-scale, global phenomenon involving highly diverse groups of individuals and circumstances. It takes place in a contested political space in which substantial variation exists with respect to exclusionary or inclusionary forces, which produce health inequalities through mechanisms linked to economic and social policies. Migration thus serves a lens function to learn lessons for public health about the generation and (re)production of inequalities in the population. We hence aimed to systematically review and synthesise the evidence on contextual effects on health and healthcare outcomes from research using natural experiments among migrant populations.

METHODOLOGY

We conducted a systematic literature review in line with the Preferred Reporting for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidelines. A protocol of the review strategy was registered in the International Prospective Register of Systematic Reviews (PROSPERO) on 28 April 2020 (CRD42020169236).

We searched the scientific databases PubMed/MEDLINE, The Cochrane Library, Web of Science/Knowledge (WoS) and CINAHL using English search terms within the search blocks migrants, natural experiments or dispersal programs, health outcome, and contextual effects (see Appendix Table S1) without limitations to the start or end date of publication. Additionally, we used the search engine Google Scholar to find further academic literature published since 2000 that might not be available in other databases. Results in all databases were restricted to English and German language articles. Searches were conducted on 4 February 2020, and updated (in PubMed/MEDLINE, WoS and CINAHL) on 13 October 2022 to capture the most recent publications. A total of 7150 items were identified in the search, with 5870 remaining for screening after deduplication (Figure 1).

We conducted the screening process in two steps. In a first step, two members of the review team independently screened the title and abstract of each item, applying pre-defined inclusion/exclusion criteria (see Appendix Table S2). Studies were excluded if they did not cover a migrant population, did not use quantitative research methods, or did not report health outcomes and/or assess contextual factors. In a second step, we reviewed full-text articles using the same exclusion criteria and additionally excluded studies which did not exploit a natural experiment. We considered studies as natural experiments if they fulfilled the following criteria: allocation was not under the control of the research team, the source of the variation in exposure was (quasi-)random, participants were unable to self-select the exposure. Articles reporting a natural experiment design but not fulfilling these criteria were excluded (Appendix Table S3). Articles using other terminology (natural quasi-experiment, quasi natural-experiment) were included if fulfilling the above criteria. Each item was screened independently by two members of the review team, with discrepancies resolved through joint discussion. In cases where consent could not be reached, articles were discussed by all members of the research team before making a decision.
team. References of the included studies were additionally screened for further relevant articles using a snowballing methodology.

**Figure 1: PRISMA flow-chart**

Data on the following were extracted for all studies: bibliographic information, study characteristics (incl. research objectives, context and period of study, theoretical foundation and sampling), research design, analysis strategy, study population, contextual exposures, and health or healthcare outcome variables used, confounders, as well as findings and limitations as reported. Data for all items were extracted in duplicate and consensus reached through joint discussion. Quality Appraisal of the included studies was carried out independently by pairs of two reviewers using an adapted version of the “Quality Assessment Tool for Quantitative Studies” developed by the Effective Public Health Practice Project (EPHPP) 24. We adapted the following items to suit the natural experiment methodology of included articles (Appendix Table S4). Discrepancies in scoring were discussed in the team to reach consensus.

Results were analysed using a synthesis without meta-analysis (SWiM) methodology 25. In a first synthesis step, two researchers inductively created several groupings of the included articles based on type of contextual exposure, health outcome and the source of variation in exposure underlying the natural experiment (Panel 2). These groupings were further refined in joint discussions of the review team. Studies were assigned to one of the following four groups based on the context factor assessed: contextual factors of the place of residence in receiving countries, migration-context interactions, policy contexts and cultural factors as context. Health outcomes were grouped into physical health (including non-communicable diseases, mortality and self-rated health), mental health (including symptoms of mental illness, psychiatric hospital admissions and substance abuse), child health (including self-reported mental and physical health, anthropometric measures and birth outcomes) and healthcare utilisation (including healthcare visit and cost data). Using the groups as a guide, study methodologies and results were discussed in six repeated rounds of synthesis meetings. The main synthesis was based on the groupings by health or healthcare outcomes. Due to the high heterogeneity of the included studies meta-analysis was not possible.

**Role of the funding source**

This study was funded the German Science Foundation (DFG) in the scope of the NEXUS project as part of the PH-LENS Research Unit (FOR 2928 / GZ: BO 5233/1-1). The funder had no influence on the design of the study, analysis or decision to publish.

**Panel 2: Categorisation of the source of (random) variation in exposure underlying the natural experiments**

Besides considering the events which give rise to the possibility of a natural experiment design, it proved helpful to consider the source of the variation in exposure in order to further understand the success of the (quasi-)random allocation. We divided the natural experiments into five groups. These differ with respect to the unit of allocation (individual/community), the temporality and the underlying assumptions made. We briefly describe each group below:

1. **Residential dispersal**

   Studies using residential dispersal as the source of variation rely on some policy which disperses individuals into different geographical units based on, for example, administrative quota or a ballot. Here, allocation may occur on the individual or household level. The extent to which the process can be regarded as ‘random’ depends on the characteristics considered in the dispersal process. For example, Gibson et al. (2010) describe a migration ballot which is determined purely by chance, while some dispersal systems for refugees may be affected by family composition, health status and nationality and are thus only quasi-random (Wenner et al. 2020). These designs are strengthened by coexistent residential mobility restrictions, which reduce the possibility of selective secondary migration, e.g. in the case of many asylum processes where individuals are obliged to reside in the municipality or region where they first made their asylum claim for a given period of time. Residential dispersal allows for the use of contemporaneous comparison groups.

2. **Arbitrary eligibility cut-offs**

   These studies make use of a policy or programme with eligibility criteria that have some cut-off which can be considered to be set arbitrarily. Thus, individuals at either side of the cut-off can be said to be
comparable in all aspects except for their treatment status. Our review includes studies which use eligibility for welfare benefits after an arbitrary length of time (e.g. Bozorgmehr & Razum 2015) or an arbitrary age cut-off (e.g. Hainmueller et al. 2017) as well as a study which uses the arbitrary water-level rise following dam construction (e.g. Hwang et al. 2011). Arbitrary eligibility cut-offs allocate the exposure at an individual or household level, and allow for contemporaneous comparison groups.

3. **Timing of policy introduction/ event**

Several studies make use of the timing of a policy introduction or an event as the source of variation in the exposure. They make before/after comparisons and thus do not allow for the use of contemporaneous comparison groups. The rationale behind classifying these studies as natural experiments is that the timing can be considered to be to some extent arbitrary or unpredictable and the policy change usually applies to an entire country, thus minimising bias through self-selection into exposed and unexposed groups. The exposure is allocated at a community level. Examples of this variation in exposure include the introduction of a paternal leave policy (Honkaniemi et al. 2021), the restriction of healthcare access (Juanmarti Mestres et al. 2020) and the introduction of a repatriation policy (Fu & VanLandingham 2010). One study (Lopez et al. 2016) makes use of the unpredictable timing of an immigration raid as the source of variation in the exposure.

4. **Regional variation**

The studies making use of regional variation in the exposure utilise the uneven implementation of policies (e.g. Kaushal 2007, Ye & Rodriguez 2021) or the uneven effects of a natural disaster (Hori et al. 2021) as their source of exposure variation. Allocation necessarily occurs at the community level. Again, these are classified as natural experiments because of the arguably arbitrary pattern of policy introduction which can be considered to be unrelated to other characteristics of the region or its inhabitants or the outcome studies. These regional comparisons allow for the use of contemporaneous comparison groups, but bias through self-selection can often not be ruled out when utilising regional variation on its own.

5. **Place of birth**

Finally, some studies make use of the randomness of the place of birth as the source of variation in their exposure. The argument presented in these studies is that the comparison groups can be considered to be equal in all aspects except the context of birth, the effects of which they subsequently examine. This approach allows for contemporaneous comparison groups, with allocation at both individual and community levels possible. Black et al. (2015) analyse the proximity of the place of birth to a railroad in the Southern United States as an instrument for migration and examine its effect on mortality. Hajdu & Hajdu (2015) examine the effect of the overall subjective well-being in the country of birth on individual well-being after migration.

**RESULTS**

A total of 1003 items remained after abstract screening, with 37 items remaining after full-text screening (Figure 1). Nine items were identified by the snowballing method, resulting in a total of 46 studies included for analysis. Almost all were published after 2007, with only one included study from 1963. While studies assessing migrations/context interactions dominated in the 2010s, when assessing the so-called “healthy migrant effect” was a particular concern, studies looking at contextual factors of the place of residence and policy contexts have risen to prominence in more recent years (Figure 2a). 33 studies were conducted in countries receiving migrants (n=18), refugees (n=13) and resettlers (n=1). These were based in Europe (n=21) 26–46 and the United States of America (USA) (n=12) 47–58 (Table 1). Studies in China (n=3) 59–61 and the USA (n=2) 62,63 focused on internal migrants. Eight studies conducted research in both the country of destination and the country of origin, covering a natural experiment in Vietnam and the USA (n=3) 64–66 and one in Tonga and New Zealand (n=5) 67–71. 22 studies report only data on migrants 28–32,34–36,38,42–48,50,51,56,57,60,61, while the others include migrants as a subsample of a broader population, with migrants making up between 5-83% of the total sample (Appendix Table S6). Median of the total sample size is 10 347 (254 – 5 009 832), excluding two ecological studies which reported sample size in person-years 28 and person-quarters 45. A large majority of studies use a cohort analytic design (n=31), with others being cohort studies (n=1), cross-sectional studies (n=7), repeated cross-sectional studies (n=2), ecological studies (n=3) or combining both cross-sectional and cohort-analytic study designs (n=2) (Table 1).
With respect to the source of variation in exposure underlying the natural experiments (see Panel 2), 17 studies make use of residential dispersal, 27,29–31,34,36–40,43,46,61,67–71, 10 use regional variation in a policy implementation or natural event, 32,33,47–49,52,54,58,60,63, seven studies make use of the timing of a policy or event, 36,37,39,53,55,56,64 and two studies use the place of birth. 35,62 (Table 1). Nine studies combine two or more of these mechanisms in order to further strengthen the natural experiment design. For example, some studies 38,44,45 use a regional variation in exposure in combination with residential allocation mechanisms (e.g. in the context of a dispersed refugee population) in order to avoid bias through self-selection. Other studies 28,51,57 utilise quasi-random timing of policy implementation and an arbitrary eligibility cut-off to generate both contemporaneous and before/after comparison groups.

We found four types of contextual effects which were examined across studies: contextual factors of the place of residence in receiving countries (n=15) 27,29–31,34,36–40,43,46,60,61, policy contexts (n=20), 26,28,33,37–39,44,45,47,48,50,58,64, as well as cultural factors as context (n=1) 35, the latter being an outlier in this set. Studies related to “contextual factors of the place of residence” examined specific regional characteristics such as regional deprivation, income inequality, neighbourhood disadvantage or migrant density among migrants in the resettlement phase. Studies focusing on “migration-context interactions” set out to examine the effect of migration on different health outcomes, but not by considering the process of migration itself, but rather by comparing outcomes among those who moved in comparison with a comparable group which did not migrate thus examining contextual characteristics of the new vs. old place of living. Finally, studies on policy contexts utilise a quasi-random uneven implementation of a policy, across time and/or space, to assess the effect of a given policy on health outcomes.

Just under half of studies (n=22) 28,30–36,38,40–44,46,49,53,55,63–66 use regression adjustment as their statistical analysis approach (Appendix Table S6). Other popular approaches include difference-in-difference analyses (n=10) 39,47,50,60,62,67–71, instrumental variables (n=8) 27,50,62,67–71 and regression discontinuity (n=3) 26,50,55. 17 studies 39,47,48,50,52,54,62 use the natural experiment as “intention to treat”, e.g. by program eligibility, rather than measuring actual treatment assignment. Given the potential of natural experiments to elucidate causal effects, all studies offer potential theoretical mechanisms through which this effect could occur. Less than half of studies (n=17) empirically assess such potential mediating pathways (Appendix Table S6).

Figure 2: Overview of included studies by year of publication, main context factor groups and health outcome assessed

2a: Included studies by year of publication and main context factor group
2b: Included studies by main context factor group and health outcome assessed (totals surpass the total number of included studies as some studies assess multiple health outcomes)

Table 1: List of included studies and main study characteristics

Natural experiments on physical health provide strong evidence of a negative effect of contextual factors such as regional deprivation and neighbourhood disadvantage on diabetes, 36,46, heart disease and mortality. 42 An exception is the study by Grönqvist et al. (2012), which finds no effect of income inequality on mortality, days of sick leave or hospitalisation. 34 Living in an urban environment and increased social integration have moderate evidence of the effect of the benefits of high migrant density and weak evidence of the negative effects of terrorist attacks on the mental health of migrants. Studies considering contextual factors of

Further studies find moderate evidence of the effect of the benefits of high migrant density and weak evidence of the negative effects of terrorist attacks on the mental health of migrants. Studies considering contextual factors of

With respect to mental health, the evidence on the effects of contextual factors of the place of residence is mixed (Figure 2). While some studies provide strong evidence of negative effects of regional deprivation and socioeconomic disadvantage on mental health, other high-quality studies find no such relationship. 34,41 Further studies find moderate evidence of the effect of the benefits of high migrant density and weak evidence of the negative effects of terrorist attacks on the mental health of migrants. Studies considering contextual factors of
the place of residence on child health are also mixed, but one strong study demonstrates the negative effect of
neighbourhood socioeconomic disadvantage on child mental health30. Another strong natural experiment
looking at the composition of school classes shows a positive effect of increased proportions of foreign-born co-
students on migrant mental health and health-risk behaviour, although this effect does not last into adulthood49.
Studie assessing the effect of policy contexts on adult and child mental health find moderate but consistent
evidence of the positive impacts of inclusionary migration, health and social policies37,38,47,50,57. The evidence on
the mental health impacts of restrictive policies such as strengthened migration enforcement51, repatriation64 or
reduced unemployment benefits56 is mixed. Natural experiments comparing migrants with individuals in the
country of origin who did not migrate also provide mixed results with respect to mental health. While evidence
from Tongan migrants in New Zealand70,71 and Vietnamese refugees in the US66 show positive or mixed results,
natural experiments looking at the effects of displacement due to infrastructure projects59 or natural disasters63
show negative effects on mental health. One weak quality study found a positive effect of the life satisfaction in
the country of origin on migrants life satisfaction after migration55.

Turning to healthcare utilisation, there is weak to moderate evidence for improvements when healthcare
entitlements44,45,54,58 and access to social benefits are increased48. At the same time, there is evidence for
decreases in timely utilisation when healthcare entitlements are restricted18 and migration enforcement is
strengthened55. One moderate quality study found no effect of health sector characteristics on refugee healthcare
expenditures43, while another weak quality study had mixed results regarding the healthcare accessibility of
persons displaced by Hurricanes Katrina and Rita63.

Migrant groups can act as a lens for the effects of context and health. All studies presented here include migrant
groups as part of their analysis, but not all are migrant-specific. Based on their analytical perspective of
migrants as a study population, we identified three groups of studies: 1) those that address a migrant-specific
research question, 2) those who use natural experiments among migrants to address broader research questions
on health and social environments, and 3) those who use migrants as a subgroup of a broader study population
to test effect moderation of a given exposure among a marginalised group. Studies addressing migrant-specific
research questions (n=29)44,45,49–51,53–57,59–71 can be found among the migration/context interaction and
policy contexts papers (Appendix Table S6). They address issues which are unique to the migration experience,
such as the health effect of being removed from a known social and economic context into an unknown one
(migration/ context interactions), or evaluate the health implications of migration and healthcare entitlement
policies (policy contexts). As some of the studies point out, however, results are salient for other populations
which are subject to similar restrictions on entitlements or benefits. 12 studies, nine of which consider
contextual factors of the place of residence29,32,36,40–42,46 and three of which consider social policies47,48,52, use
the (quasi-)random dispersal of migrants as an opportunity to answer broader questions of societal relevance on
context and health, thereby extrapolating results beyond the migrant population. Finally, five studies26,27,33,37,58
use migrant subgroups to examine the moderation of context effects among a well-defined, marginalised
population group.

Figure 3: Evidence map illustrating results and quality of studies in the “contextual factors of the place of
residence” and “migration/context interactions” groups

Figure 4: Evidence map illustrating results and quality of studies in the “policy contexts” and “culture as
context” groups

DISCUSSION
The evidence from the natural experiments included in this review confirms the negative effects of contextual
factors such as socio-economic deprivation and neighbourhood disadvantage on physical health and mortality1,
while finding mixed effects of these neighbourhood attributes on mental health outcomes, suggesting that
associations observed in the existing literature may be due to selection effects. Natural experiments comparing
migrants with those that stayed behind are able to circumvent selective “healthy migrant effects”, and
demonstrate the often detrimental effects of migration and post-migratory contexts on physical health and
mortality. However, these studies also show that migrating to new social and economic contexts can be
favourable for mental health and child health. Analyses of policy contexts indicate the negative impacts of
restrictive migration and social policies on healthcare utilization, mental health and mortality as well as the
positive effects when restrictions are lifted. These add to the emerging evidence base surrounding the effects of
non-health targeted policies on migrant health10 and the conflicting goals of migration and health policies21.

Due to the nature of our research question and our search process, many of the included studies had migrant
issues at the centre of their research objectives. They offered important insights into the detrimental effects of
migration policies currently being broadly discussed and implemented, such the restriction of benefits for migrants and refugees, the restriction of visa programmes and the increased enforcement of migration policies. Such policies emerge against the backdrop of wider social, political and economic developments which may be broadly described as “othering” processes. “Othering” refers to a discursive practice, in which an out-group is created which is marked as being different to reinforce and normalise the privileges of the antithetical “normal” in-group, disempowering and marginalising those considered to be on the “outside” in the process. Othering affects not just migrants, but also other marginalised populations, and may be conceptualised as the root of many pervasive health inequities. The benefit of specifically studying the effects of policies on migration is that they often make these underlying processes visible. However, the detrimental effects of benefit restrictions, tightened police control and accessibility hurdles described by the studies examined here can be applied to other marginalised populations for which these processes are less visible. While the research questions of these studies and the policies examined are migration-specific, policy developments such as benefit restrictions and immigration raids emerge against a particular social and political backdrop which is not exclusive to migrants.

Some studies also specifically use natural experiments among migrants to answer questions about the effect of contexts on the population more broadly. Given the diversity of refugee populations, and, increasingly, of so-called “host” populations in an era of super-diversity, there is no good reason to believe that the effects of context would operate any differently on migrant and non-migrant groups give careful consideration of causal models and mechanisms. We may, therefore, be able to use these studies as a lens and state that the identified negative effects of neighbourhood disadvantage and deprivation on physical health, mortality and child health as well as the absence of effects of income inequality apply to other human beings exposed to these contextual effects. This applies equally to other studies using natural experiments among migrants to study the effects of policy changes such as food stamp restrictions.

As described above, natural experiments among migrants can be powerful tools to yield insights on questions of contextual effects on health. The studies included in this review make use of a widely varying set of natural experiments, but this list is by no means exhaustive. Future research should continue to utilise the opportunities presented by natural experiments among migrants. This is sensible not just from a methodological standpoint, but also keeping the ethical use of research resources in mind. However, the included studies were highly heterogeneous in terms of not only the context factors and health outcomes considered, but also the methodological quality and detail of reporting. Given the “real life” complexity involved in the allocation to exposure, a highly detailed account of the nature of the natural experiments and the potential sources of bias is required, but was only provided by some studies. This also requires a more in-depth consideration of the sources of variation in exposure (see Panel 2) and to what extent these can be considered “successful” in terms of achieving random or quasi-random allocation. Of the mechanisms utilised in the studies included in this review, residential dispersal can be considered a particularly strong natural experiment because mechanisms of the dispersal are usually explicit and the true “randomness” of the allocation can be easily assessed. For all other sources of variation in exposure, the random nature of the allocation may be more implicit and requires the examination of a number of assumptions of the event or policy giving rise to the natural experiment. This requires in-depth knowledge of the political and institutional contexts in which the study takes place. Sources of variation in exposure which utilise allocation at a community level are further limited by the fact that these are often “intention to treat” studies. While the policy may apply at a community level, it is frequently not known whether individuals utilise/are affected by the policy in question. Future research utilising natural experiment approaches should be more explicit in the mechanisms underlying the experiment, and may benefit from using our classification of the sources of variation in exposure (Panel 2).

Another methodological challenge is the consistent use of causal models to link exposure and outcome, as well as the deliberate use of mediation analyses to explore potential causal pathways. Very few studies provided details on potential causal mechanisms underlying the observed effects, so that these remain a black box. While many studies included covariates both at the individual and group/contextual level, the use of covariates was rarely justified and there was little recognition for the potential problems of introducing individual and group-level covariates in the same model. The use of directed acyclic graphs and multi-level modelling approaches should be considered to strengthen the quality of natural experiment approaches. Overall, methodological guidelines for natural experiments exist, but their application is not yet common practice. As research using natural experiments becomes increasingly popular, the use of such guidelines should be adopted by researchers and encouraged by funders and publishers. The scope and applicability of these guidelines may need to be revised for a more diverse set of research objectives, including research on contextual effects.
This study benefitted from a systematic review process, a search without a time limit in multiple databases, an additional snowballing search and an extensive data extraction process. The criterion of the natural experiment was applied at the full-text stage, meaning that we were able to select studies based on the full description of the methodology rather than relying on abstracts. The review was further enriched by the application of a rigorous quality appraisal tool which was adapted for use with natural experiments. A limitation was the use of “natural/quasi experiment” as an explicit search term, which may have excluded studies which used a natural experiment methodology but did not describe these as such. Finally, the review included a number of studies which applied econometric methodological approaches, but we did not have a researcher with an economic background as part of the research team.

Natural experiments can serve as powerful tools in disentangling the effect of context on health and reduce bias through self-selection. Results demonstrate the negative impacts for health brought about by neighbourhood disadvantage and restrictive policies. At the same time, studies uncover the potential of health and welfare programs to counteract the disadvantages created by othering processes and instead promote healthy (post-migratory) contexts. With careful consideration of causal pathways, results from migration contexts can serve as a useful magnifying glass for the effects of context for other population groups.

Contributors
LB: Conceptualization, Methodology, Investigation, Formal analysis, Writing – Original Draft, Visualization, Project administration
MH: Methodology, Investigation, Formal analysis, Data curation, Writing – Review & Editing, Visualization, Project administration
DC: Investigation, Formal analysis
ZW: Investigation, Formal analysis
KB: Conceived the study, Conceptualization, Methodology, Formal analysis, Writing – Review & Editing, Supervision, Funding acquisition

All authors had full access to all data in the study and had final responsibility for the decision to submit for publication.

Declarations of interest
We declare no competing interests

Data sharing
A full list of studies identified in the search as well as the full data extracted from included studies are available for academic research projects by request to the corresponding author: Kayvan.bozorgmehr@uni-bielefeld.de

Acknowledgments
This study was funded the German Science Foundation (DFG) in the scope of the NEXUS project, a part of the PH-LENS research consortium (FOR 2928 / GZ: BO 5233/1-1). We thank Judith Wenner for her support in the early stages of the screening process.

REFERENCES


19 WHO Commission on Social Determinants of Health.


Records identified from first search:
Databases (n = 4954)
Records identified from top-up search:
Databases (n=2196)

Records screened (n = 5870)

Reports sought for retrieval (n = 1003)

Reports assessed for eligibility (n = 670)

Reports excluded:
No natural experiment (n = 455)
No migrant population (n = 81)
No health outcomes (n = 66)
No contextual factors (n = 27)
Language (n = 1)
Duplicate (n = 3)

Records excluded:
(n = 0)

Studies included from screening (n = 37)
Total number of studies included in the review (n = 46)

Records identified from:
Snowball-method (n = 9)

Records not retrieved (n = 0)

Records excluded before screening:
Duplicate records removed (n = 947) (first search)
Duplicate records removed (n = 331) (top-up search)

Records not retrieved (n = 333)

Records sought for retrieval (n = 9)

Records identified from:
Databases (n = 2196)

Records identified from:
Data from first search (n = 4954)

Records identified from:
Top-up search (n = 2196)

Records excluded:
(n = 4867)

Records removed before screening:
(n = 947) (first search)
(n = 331) (top-up search)

Records included:
(n = 37)
Total number of studies included in the review (n = 46)

Figure 2a

Figure 2b

- **Policy contexts**
- **Migration/context interactions**
- **Contextual factors of place of residence**

- **Child health**
- **Health care utilisation**
- **Mental health**
- **Physical health**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Context Factor of the Place of Residence</th>
<th>Physical Health</th>
<th></th>
<th>Mental Health</th>
<th></th>
<th>Child Health</th>
<th></th>
<th>Healthcare Utilization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increased income inequality</td>
<td>strong</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>strong</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>mixed</td>
<td>↓</td>
<td>weak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased neighborhood disadvantage</td>
<td>strong</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>strong</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>strong</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>weak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased neighborhood disadvantage</td>
<td>mixed</td>
<td>↓</td>
<td>increased regional deprivation</td>
<td>mixed</td>
<td>strong</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased regional deprivation</td>
<td>mixed</td>
<td>↓</td>
<td>increased regional deprivation</td>
<td>mixed</td>
<td>strong</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban vs. rural environment</td>
<td>weak</td>
<td>↓</td>
<td>neighborhood type</td>
<td>weak</td>
<td>weak</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>weak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disability</td>
<td>weak</td>
<td>↓</td>
<td>socioeconomic disadvantages</td>
<td>weak</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>→</td>
<td>moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High migrant density</td>
<td>weak</td>
<td>↓</td>
<td>proportion of foreign born school peers</td>
<td>weak</td>
<td>strong</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>weak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living in US vs. Vietnam</td>
<td>weak</td>
<td>↓</td>
<td>proportion of foreign born school peers</td>
<td>weak</td>
<td>strong</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>weak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proximity of birthplace to railroad</td>
<td>weak</td>
<td>↓</td>
<td>proportion of foreign born school peers</td>
<td>weak</td>
<td>strong</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>weak</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Abbreviations: NZ: New Zealand, QA: Quality Appraisal, USA: United States of America, vs.: versus
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Context Factor</th>
<th>Effect</th>
<th>QA</th>
<th>Context Factor</th>
<th>Effect</th>
<th>QA</th>
<th>Context Factor</th>
<th>Effect</th>
<th>QA</th>
<th>Context Factor</th>
<th>Effect</th>
<th>QA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increased healthcare access</td>
<td>positive effect</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>Increased healthcare access</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>Increased healthcare access</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>Increased healthcare access</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased visa access</td>
<td>positive effect</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>Increased visa access</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>Increased visa access</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>Increased visa access</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased access to food stamps</td>
<td>positive effect</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>Increased access to food stamps</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>Increased access to food stamps</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>Increased access to food stamps</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased parental leave</td>
<td>positive effect</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>Increased parental leave</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>Increased parental leave</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>Increased parental leave</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased unemployment benefits</td>
<td>positive effect</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>Increased unemployment benefits</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>Increased unemployment benefits</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>Increased unemployment benefits</td>
<td>moderate</td>
<td>moderate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Abreviations:** NZ: New Zealand, QA: Quality Appraisal, USA: United States of America, vs.: versus
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author &amp; Year of publication</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Country of study</th>
<th>Total sample size</th>
<th>Type of study</th>
<th>Data source</th>
<th>Migrant category*</th>
<th>Contextual exposure</th>
<th>Source of variation in exposure (unit of allocation)**</th>
<th>Health outcome</th>
<th>Results (indicator-level)</th>
<th>Main results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Almquist &amp; Miething 2022</td>
<td>The impact of an unemployment insurance reform on incidence rates of hospitalisation due to alcohol-related disorders: a quasi-experimental study of heterogeneous effects across ethnic background, educational level, employment status, and sex in Sweden</td>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>500983</td>
<td>repeated cross-sectional</td>
<td>international migrants</td>
<td>policy (unemployment insurance reform)</td>
<td>timing of implementation (community)</td>
<td>Regression discontinuity (coef, pre- vs. post-reform, total population): hospitalisation due to alcohol related disorders: -0.49 (p&lt;0.001) Regression discontinuity (coef, pre- vs. post-reform, Non-European foreignborn): hospitalisation due to alcohol related disorders: -0.62 (p&lt;0.001)</td>
<td>mental health</td>
<td>Regression discontinuity (coef, pre- vs. post-reform, Swedish-born with foreign-born parents): hospitalisation due to alcohol related disorders: 1.41 (p&lt;0.001)</td>
<td>No adverse effect of the reform in the total study population, but clear indication of rising incidence of alcohol use for unemployed individuals around the time of the reform, especially for those who were Swedish-born.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black et al. 2015</td>
<td>The Impact of the Great Migration on Mortality of African Americans: Evidence from the Deep South</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>828179</td>
<td>cohort analytic</td>
<td>Secondary (Administrative data from the Medicare Part B program, US Vital Statistics registry)</td>
<td>Internal migrants migration/context interactions (proximity of birthplace to railroads)</td>
<td>place of birth (individual)</td>
<td>physical health</td>
<td>Linear regression, LATE (born close to railroads vs. not born close to railroads): survival to age 70: -0.058 (SE: 0.017) survival to age 75: -0.0102 (SE: 0.026)</td>
<td>Migration out of the Deep South decreased life expectancy for African Americans, with results somewhat attenuated for women.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boje-Kovacs et al. 2022</td>
<td>Neighborhoods and mental health—evidence from a natural experiment in the public social housing sector</td>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>8175</td>
<td>cohort analytic</td>
<td>secondary (PSH system, administrative registries)</td>
<td>international migrants contextual factors of place of residence (regional deprivation)</td>
<td>residential dispersal (individual)</td>
<td>mental health</td>
<td>Ordinary least squares regression (coef., deprived vs. non-deprived neighborhood, Non-Western immigrants): treated with psychiatric medication: 0.046 (SE: 0.025; p&lt;0.10) Two stage least squares regression (coef., deprived vs. non-deprived neighborhood): treated with psychiatric medication: 0.052 (SE: 0.026; p&lt;0.05)</td>
<td>Exposure to the most deprived neighborhoods significantly increases the use of psychiatric medication among the population, effect larger for foreign-born and men.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bozorgmehr &amp; Razum 2015</td>
<td>Effect of Restricting Access to Health Care on Health Expenditures among Asylum-Seekers and Refugees: A Quasi-Experimental Study in Germany, 1994–2013</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>568882</td>
<td>ecological cohort analytic</td>
<td>refugee</td>
<td>policy (healthcare access policy)</td>
<td>residential dispersal, timing of policy introduction/event, arbitrary eligibility cut-offs (community)</td>
<td>healthcare utilisation</td>
<td>Incidence rate difference (restricted vs. regular access) Incident health expenditure: 375-89 Euros (95%CI: 375-77; 375-89) Incidence rate ratio (restricted vs. regular access) Incident health expenditure: 1.39 (95%CI: 1.3902; 1.3904)</td>
<td>Restricting access to healthcare services increases incident health expenditures compared with granting regular access.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East &amp; Friedson 2020</td>
<td>An Apple a Day? Adult food stamp eligibility and health care utilization among immigrants</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>11674</td>
<td>cohort analytic</td>
<td>international migrants</td>
<td>policy (social policy)</td>
<td>regional variation (community)</td>
<td>mental health physical health healthcare utilisation</td>
<td>Linear regression, coefficient (effect of full year of food stamp eligibility): Any Office Visits: -0.022 (SE: 0.058) 2+ Office Visits: -0.144 (SE: 0.051) 4+ Office Visits: -0.048 (SE: 0.057) Any Overnight Hospitalization: -0.015 (SE: 0.017) Any ED visits: -0.015 (SE: 0.039) Overall Health: 0.064 (SE: 0.066) Excellent/Very Good Health: 0.026 (SE: 0.033) Overweight/Obe: 0.081 (SE: 0.051) Mental Health Index: 0.020 (SE: 0.060)</td>
<td>One year of Food Stamp eligibility decreases the likelihood of multiple physician office visits within a year among low-educated immigrants. Suggestive negative effects on other measures of healthcare utilization—emergency admissions, outpatient visits, mortality.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Study Title</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Cohort</td>
<td>Study Type</td>
<td>Setting</td>
<td>Policy (social policy)</td>
<td>Regional variation (community)</td>
<td>Child Health</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East 2020</td>
<td>The Effect of Food Stamps on Children’s Health - Evidence from Immigrants’ Changing Eligibility</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>5949</td>
<td>cohort analytic</td>
<td>secondary (National Health Interview Survey, March Current Population Survey)</td>
<td>international migrants</td>
<td>policy (social policy)</td>
<td>Linear regression, coefficient (additional year of parental food stamp access): Overall health: -0.036 [95%CI: -0.060, -0.013], p=0.00 Poor/Fair/Good Health: -0.017 [95%CI: -0.027, -0.007], p=0.00 Physical Health Index: -0.003 [95%CI: -0.034, 0.029], p=0.83 Developmental Health Index: -0.013 [95%CI: -0.050, 0.024], p=0.52 Overnight hospitalizations: -0.002 [95%CI: -0.006, 0.002], p=0.39 Number of school days missed: -0.032 [95%CI: -0.204, 0.140], p=0.71 Number of doctor visits in past 12 months: 0.003 [95%CI: -0.020, 0.027], p=0.95</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erdmann et al. 2021</td>
<td>Using independent cross-sectional survey data to predict post-migration health trajectories among refugees by estimating transition probabilities and their variances</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>560</td>
<td>repeated cross-sectional</td>
<td>primary</td>
<td>refugees</td>
<td>contextual factors of place of residence (urban/rural)</td>
<td>Transition probabilities, propensity-score matching approach (urban-urban): Healthy-healthy: 0.61 Sick-healthy: 0.55 Sick-sick: 0.18 Transition probabilities, propensity-score matching approach (rural-rural): Healthy-healthy: 0.19 Sick-healthy: 0.03 Sick-sick: 0.04</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fletcher</td>
<td>The Effects of Foreign-Born Peers in US High Schools and Middle Schools</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>78546</td>
<td>cross-sectional study, cohort analytic</td>
<td>secondary (National Longitudinal Study of Adolescent Health)</td>
<td>international migrants</td>
<td>contextual factors of place of residence (% foreign-born in school cohort)</td>
<td>Linear regression model (coef., effect of % of peers foreign born): Mental health (short-term): -0.206 (SE: 0.167) Mental health (long-term): 0.183 (SE: 0.379) Health risk behaviour (short-term): 0.134 (SE: 0.261) Health risk behaviour (long-term): 0.058 (SE: 0.127) Linear regression model (coef., effect of % of peers foreign born [interacted with] student foreign-born): Mental health (short-term): 0.236 (SE: 0.086, p&lt;0.01) Mental health (long-term): 0.085 (SE: 0.127) Health risk behaviour (short-term): -0.533 (SE:0.215, p&lt;0.05) Health risk behaviour (long-term): -0.533 (SE:0.215, p&lt;0.05) Cox proportional hazards models (Hazard ratio; low vs. high disadvantage neighbourhood): Any psychiatric diagnosis: HR: 1:13 (95%CI: 1:04-1:25, p&lt;0.01) Any psychiatric medication: HR: 1:05 (95%CI: 1:00-1:11, p&lt;0.05) OLS models (coef.; low vs. high disadvantage) Resettling in a socioeconomically disadvantaged neighbourhood was associated with an increased long-term risk of being diagnosed with</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foverskov et al. 2022a</td>
<td>Neighbourhood socioeconomic disadvantage and psychiatric disorders among refugees: a population-based, secondary (population registers, medical registries) study</td>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>42067</td>
<td>cohort analytic</td>
<td>secondary (population registers, medical registries)</td>
<td>refugees</td>
<td>contextual factors of place of residence (socioeconomic disadvantage)</td>
<td>Mental health</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Design/Methodology</td>
<td>Sample</td>
<td>Analytic Unit</td>
<td>Follow-up</td>
<td>Main Exposure</td>
<td>Main Outcome</td>
<td>Study Findings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foverskov et al. 2022b</td>
<td>Risk of Psychiatric Disorders Among Refugee Children and Adolescents Living in Disadvantaged Neighborhoods</td>
<td>Cohort analytic</td>
<td>18709 cohort</td>
<td>Refugee</td>
<td>Residential dispersal (individual)</td>
<td>Child health</td>
<td>Cox proportional hazard models (Hazard ratio)</td>
<td>Any psychiatric diagnosis: 1.82 (95% CI: 0.61-3.30; p&lt;0.01) Any psychiatric medication: 2.18 (95% CI: 0.52-3.84; p&lt;0.05) Quasi-random assignment to a disadvantaged neighborhood was associated with increased risk of psychiatric disorders (per 1 SD, increase of 11% risk increase).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frey</td>
<td>Getting under the Skin: The Impact of Terrorist Attacks on Native and Immigrant Sentinel</td>
<td>Cross-sectional study</td>
<td>1033</td>
<td>Refugee</td>
<td>Regional variation (community)</td>
<td>Mental health</td>
<td>Linear regression model (coeff. effect of experiencing terrorist attack)</td>
<td>Mental distress (PHQ4): 0.04 (SE: 0.03) Mental health (SF12): -0.05 (SE: 0.03, p&lt;0.1) Terrorist attacks have a severe but only temporary effect on mental health.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fu &amp; VanLandingham 2012a</td>
<td>Mental Health Consequences of International Migration for Vietnamese Americans and the Mediating Effects of Physical Health and Social Networks: Results From a Natural Experiment Approach</td>
<td>Cohort analytic</td>
<td>703</td>
<td>Refugee</td>
<td>Residential dispersal, timing of policy introduction (individual)</td>
<td>Physical health</td>
<td>Logistic regression, odds ratio (migrants vs. never-leavers):</td>
<td>Disadvantages in body fat and weight distribution for migrants compared to never-leavers and returnees. High acculturation and disengagement from host society both associated with poorer outcomes.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fu &amp; VanLandingham 2012b</td>
<td>Disentangling the Effects of Migration, Selection and Acculturation on Weight and Body Fat Distribution: Results from a Natural Experiment involving Vietnamese Americans, Returnees, and Never-leavers</td>
<td>Cohort analytic</td>
<td>709</td>
<td>Refugee</td>
<td>Residential dispersal, timing of policy introduction/eve nt (individual)</td>
<td>Mental health</td>
<td>Linear regression, coefficient (migrants vs. never-leavers):</td>
<td>Migrants show worse vitality, energy and fatigue compared to never-leavers and returnees. Better social networks and physical health reduced the negative direct effect of migration on mental health.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fu &amp; VanLandingham 2010</td>
<td>Mental and Physical Health Consequences of Repatriation for Vietnamese Returnees: A Natural Experiment Approach</td>
<td>Cohort analytic</td>
<td>709</td>
<td>Refugee</td>
<td>Policy (repatriation)</td>
<td>Multivariate regression, coefficient (returnees vs. migrants):</td>
<td>Multivariate regression, coefficient (returnees vs. migrants): SF-36 General health: -13.76 (p&lt;0.001) Vietnamese depression scale: -0.42 Positive affect: 0.66 (p&lt;0.001) Blood pressure: -3.87 (p&lt;0.01) Multivariate regression, coefficient (returnees vs. migrants): SF-36 General health: -13.76 (p&lt;0.001) Vietnamese depression scale: 1.29 (p=0.5) Positive affect: -1.33 (p=0.001) Blood pressure: 6.66 (p=0.001) Disadvantages for repatriated refugees compared to both migrants and never-leavers in general health, depression, positive affect and blood pressure.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Cohort Size</td>
<td>Study Type</td>
<td>Intervention</td>
<td>Outcome</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>Findings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Giacco et al. 2018</td>
<td>The same or different psychiatrists for in- and out-patient treatment? A multi-country natural experiment</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>Belgium, England, Germany, Italy and Poland</td>
<td>6369 cohort</td>
<td>analytic</td>
<td>primary &amp; secondary (medical records)</td>
<td>international migrants</td>
<td>policy (healthcare organisation)</td>
<td>Logistic regression model: OR (personal continuity vs. policy (healthcare organisation)) Regional variation (organisation) Healthcare utilisation No difference between patients treated the same or different psychiatrists across in- and outpatient treatment.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gibson et al. 2010</td>
<td>What happens to diet and child health when migration splits households? Evidence from a migration lottery program</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>New Zealand, Tonga</td>
<td>669 cohort</td>
<td>analytic</td>
<td>primary &amp; secondary (PAC ballot register)</td>
<td>International migrants</td>
<td>migration/context interactions (moving to New Zealand vs. staying behind) Residential dispersal (individual) Child health</td>
<td>Linear IV regression, coefficient (Successful PAC applicants vs. Unsuccessful PAC applicants): BMI for age: 0.156 (SE: 0.200) Height for age: 0.118 (SE: 0.205) Weight for age: 0.311 (SE: 0.215) Impact of migration on child health mixed, but improvements in height-for-age owing to improved diet definite health improvement.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grönqvist et al. 2012</td>
<td>Income inequality and health: Lessons from a refugee residential assignment program</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>6595 cohort</td>
<td>analytic</td>
<td>secondary (population registers, hospital records)</td>
<td>Refugees</td>
<td>Contextual factors of place of residence (income inequality) Residential dispersal (individual) Mental health Physical health</td>
<td>Linear regression coefficient (Gini-Index): Probability of being hospitalised 5 years after arrival: 0.221 (SE: 0.245) Probability of dying 5 years after arrival: 0.009 (SE: 0.048) Probability of taking long-term sick leave 5 years after arrival: 0.060 (SE: 0.153) Average number of days hospitalised: -16.53 (22.71) No overall effects of income inequality on health found. Small adverse effect for old individuals is not sensitive to measure of health used.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hainmueller et al. 2017</td>
<td>Protecting unauthorized immigrant mothers improves their children’s mental health</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>5653 cohort</td>
<td>analytic</td>
<td>secondary (Medicaid claims data)</td>
<td>International migrants (undocumented migrants)</td>
<td>Policy (visa programme) Arbitrary eligibility cutoffs (individual) Child health</td>
<td>Linear regression model (coef.: DACA eligible vs. DACA ineligible mothers post-DACA period): Adjustment and anxiety disorders: -4.3 (SE: 1.87) (p = 0.023) Adjustment disorders: -4.4 (SE: 1.75) (p = 0.013) Anxiety disorders: -1.7 (SE: 1.22) (p = 0.153) Protecting unauthorized immigrants from deportation led to immediate and sizable improvements in the mental health of their U.S. citizen children.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hajdu &amp; Hajdu 2015</td>
<td>The Impact of Culture on Well-Being: Evidence from a Natural Experiment</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>34 European countries</td>
<td>12085 cross-sectional study</td>
<td>secondary (2002-2010 European Social Survey)</td>
<td>International migrants</td>
<td>Culture</td>
<td>Place of birth (individual) Mental health</td>
<td>OLS models; coefficient (migrants from countries with higher life satisfaction vs. migrants from countries with lower levels of life satisfaction); satisfaction in the birth country (without post-communist birth countries): 0.357 (SE: 0.069; p &lt; 0.01) Migrants from countries of origin with a high average life satisfaction report a higher life satisfaction in their destination country than migrants from countries with low average life satisfaction.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamad et al. 2020</td>
<td>Association of Neighborhood Disadvantage With Cardiovascular Risk Factors and Events Among Refugees in Denmark</td>
<td>2020</td>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>49305 cohort</td>
<td>analytic</td>
<td>secondary (Danish national registers)</td>
<td>Refugees</td>
<td>Contextual factors of place of residence (neighborhood disadvantage) Residential dispersal (individual) Physical health</td>
<td>Linear regression model; coefficients (people living in low-disadvantage neighborhood vs. high-disadvantage neighborhoods): Hypertension: 0.71 (95% CI: 0.50; 0.93) Hyperlipidemia: 0.44 (95% CI: 0.06; 0.83) Diabetes: 0.45 (95% CI: 0.09; 0.81) MI: 0.14 (95% CI: 0.03; 0.25) Stroke: 0.01 (95% CI: -0.16; 0.17) Refugees assigned to more disadvantaged neighborhoods more likely to develop hypertension, hyperlipidemia, diabetes, and MI in subsequent decades. No association with risk of stroke.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table: Study Details and Findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study Details</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hamilton et al. 2021</td>
<td>DACA’s Association With Birth Outcomes Among Mexican-Origin Mothers in the United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>72613 cohort analytic secondary (vital statistics) international migrants (undocumented migrants) policy (visa programme) timing of policy introduction/eve nt, arbitrary eligibility cut-offs (individual) child health Linear regression model (coef. DACA eligible vs. DACA ineligible high-school educated mexican-origin mothers) Low birthweight: -0.008 (SE: 0.002) <em><strong>(p&lt;0.01) Very low birthweight: -0.002 (SE:0.001) Birthweight in grams: 7.2 (SE: 9.7) Preterm: -0.009 (SE:0.003)</strong></em>(p&lt;0.01) Weeks gestation: 0-11 (SE:0.02) ***(p&lt;0.01) Small for gestational age: -0.003 (0.003) DACA was not associated with birth outcomes for births in utero at time of the policy announcement, but was associated with improvements to some outcomes for births conceived after DACA was announced.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honkanemi et al. 2021</td>
<td>Psychiatric consequences of a father’s leave policy by nativity: a quasiexperimental study in Sweden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>198589 cohort analytic secondary (population and patient registers) international migrants policy (parental leave policy) timing of policy introduction/eve nt (community) mental health Segmented negative binomial regression model, incidence rate ratio (Swedish fathers pre-reform vs. Swedish fathers post-reform) Psychiatric hospitalisation rates: 0.85 (95%CI: 0.59:1.24) Segmented negative binomial regression model, incidence rate ratio (migrant fathers pre-reform vs. migrant fathers post-reform) Psychiatric hospitalisation rates: 0.64 (95%CI: 0.47:0.86) Four years of increased psychiatric hospitalisation rates among migrant but not native fathers from before to after the 1995 Father’s quota.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hori &amp; Schafer 2010</td>
<td>Social costs of displacement in Louisiana after Hurricanes Katrina and Rita</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>10347 cross-sectional study secondary (2006 Louisiana Health and Population Survey) Internal migrants migration/ context interactions (being displaced vs. not being displaced) regional variation (community) mental health Logistic regression, log odds (displaced vs. Non-displaced): Access to primary care: 0.243 (p&lt;0.01) Uninsured: 0.908 (NS) Serious mental illness: 2.240 (p&lt;0.1) Positive association of displacement with severe mental illness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hwang et al. 2011</td>
<td>The Short-Term Impact of Involuntary Migration in China’s Three Gorges: A Prospective Study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>770 cohort analytic primary Internal migrants migration/ context interactions (being displaced vs. not being displaced) residential dispersal, arbitrary eligibility cut-off (individual) mental health physical health Linear regression model, coefficient (not eligible for EHC vs. EHC via policy change): CES-D (depression): 3.39 (p&lt;0.01) Subjective health status: -0.22 (p=0.01) Saw doctor last week: 5.59 (NS) Took medicine last week: 2.15 (NS) Injuy or serious illness last year: 4.29 (NS) Displaced show increase in depression and decline in self-rated health compared to those not displaced.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jaschke &amp; Kovyakova 2021</td>
<td>Does facilitated and Early Access to the Healthcare System Improve Refugees’ Health Outcomes? Evidence from a Natural Experiment in Germany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German y</td>
<td>5922 cross-sectional study; cohort analytic secondary (LAB-SOEP-BAMF Panel) refugees policy (healthcare access policy) regional variation (community) mental health physical health Linear regression model, coefficient (not eligible for EHC vs. EHC via policy change): Depression and anxiety: -0.036 (SE: 0.040) Mental well-being: -0.041 (SE: 0.020); p: &lt;0.05 Physical well-being: 0.001 (SE:0.015) Health satisfaction: 0.250 (SE:0.165) Self-rated health: -0.107 (SE: 0.070) Granting immediate and unbureaucratic access to health care for refugees through an electronic health card improved mental health but had no impact on physical health.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juanmarti Mestres et al. 2020</td>
<td>The deadly effects of losing health insurance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>not reported ecological cohort analytic secondary (death registers) international migrants (undocumented migrants) policy (restriction of healthcare access) timing of policy introduction/eve nt (community) Physical health Linear regression, coefficient (nationalities with undocumented migrants vs. Nationalities without undocumented migrants): Difference in mortality pre &amp; post reform: 0.018 (SE:0.008) Difference in amenable mortality pre &amp; post reform: 0.0226 (SE:0.00656) Difference in non-amenable mortality pre &amp; post reform: 0.00348 (SE:0.00390) Healthcare restrictions increased the monthly mortality rate of undocumented immigrants by 0.31 deaths per 100,000 persons during its first four years of implementation. Effects higher for deaths amenable to healthcare.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaushal 2007</td>
<td>Do food stamps cause obesity? Evidence from</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>489266 cohort analytic secondary (National Health Interview) international migrants policy (food stamp access policy) regional variation (community) physical health Difference-in-difference estimates (migrant women vs. native women): log(BMI): -0.004 (SE: 0.008) Participation in food stamps programme unrelated to changes in physical health.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lopez et al. 2016</td>
<td>Health Implications of an Immigration Raid: Findings from a Latino Community in the Midwestern United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La et al. 2022</td>
<td>Heterogeneous Impact of Social Integration on the Health of Rural-to-Urban Migrants in China</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raphael et al. 2020</td>
<td>Neighborhood Deprivation and Mental Health Among Immigrants to Sweden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reiss et al. 2012</td>
<td>Assessing the effect of regional deprivation on mortality avoiding compositional bias: A natural experiment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schober &amp; Zocher 2022</td>
<td>Health Care Utilization of Refugees: Evidence from Austria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stillman et al. 2015</td>
<td>Miserable Migrants? Natural Experiment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stillman et al. 2009</td>
<td>Migration and mental health: Evidence from a natural experiment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Stillman et al. 2012                      | The impact of immigration on child health: experimental evidence from a migration lottery program | New Zealand, Tonga | Cohort analytic          | Primary & secondary (PAC ballot register)        | IV Estimates regression model. Linear IV (control variables) (ballot winners vs. ballot losers):
  * Children 0-2 yr old
  ** Very Good Parent-rated Health: 0·011 (SE: 1·181) Standardized Hight for Age: 1·855 (SE: 0·787, p<0·01) Stunted Height for Age <= 5th percentile: -0·424 (SE: 3·147, p<0·001)
  * Children 3-5 yr old
  ** Very Good Parent-rated Health: 0·069 (SE: 0·117) Standardized Hight for Age: -0·052 (SE: 0·453) Stunted Height for Age <= 5th percentile: 0·077 (SE: 0·089)
  * Children 6-12 yr old
  ** Very Good Parent-rated Health: 0·275 (SE: 0·098, p<0·001) Standardized Hight for Age: 0·666 (SE: 0·388, p<0·05) Stunted Height for Age <= 5th percentile: -0·046 (SE: 0·083)
  * Children 13-18 yr old
  ** Very Good Parent-rated Health: 0·330 (SE: 0·089, p<0·001) Standardized Hight for Age: 0·186 (SE: 0·285) Stunted Height for Age <= 5th percentile: 0·090 (SE: 0·089)

Improved child health due to increased food intake following migration: infants and toddlers show less stunting, 3- to 5-year olds gain weight and older children have better parent-reported health. |
  No. Of supervision visits (count): 8·02 (95%CI: 7·01-9·03) Expanding access to prenatal care considerably increased both utilization of and... |
Infant Health

Toomey et al. 2014 Impact of Arizona’s SB 1070 Immigration Law on Utilization of Health Care and Public Assistance Among Mexican-Origin Adolescent Mothers and Their Mother Figures USA 279 cohort study primary international migrants policy (migration enforcement) timing of policy introduction/eve nt (community) healthcar e utilisation general estimating equations, coefficient (before vs. after enactment of SB1070): 
- Received Public Assistance (Adolescents): 0.11 (SE: 0.08) 
- Received Public Assistance (Mother figures): -1.22 (SE: 0.59; p: <0.05)
utilized medical care for Self (Adolescents): -0.46 
utilized medical care for Child (Adolescents): 0.03 (SE: 0.10)
Enactment of strengthened immigration enforcement was associated with decreases in the utilisation of routine medical care.

Torres et al. 2022 The Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals program and birth outcomes in California: a quasi-experimental study USA 57476 cohort analytic secondary (birth record data) international migrants (undocumented migrants) policy (visa programme) timing of policy introduction (community) Child health Difference-in-differences linear regression model (coef.; DACA-eligible vs. DACA-ineligible Mexican-born mothers with Medicaid)
- Pre-term-births: 0.0007 (-0.016;0.017)
- low-birth-weight: 0.001 (-0.015;0.013)
- small-for-gestational-age: -0.018 (-0.035;0.002) p<0.05
- birth weight: 45.77 (11.87;79.68) p<0.01
- Term birth weight: 44.32 (15.20;73.45) p<0.01
DACA was associated with weak to modest improvements in birthweight outcomes among births to Mexican born individuals whose births were billed to Medicaid. Estimates were consistent but of smaller magnitude for other subgroups.

Venkataramani et al. 2017 Health consequences of the US Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) immigration programme: a quasi-experimental study USA 14973 cohort analytic secondary (US National Health Interview Survey) international migrants (undocumented migrants) policy (visa programme) timing of policy introduction/eve nt, arbitrary eligibility cut-offs (individual) mental health self-reported overall health Least squares regression, coefficient (DACA eligible vs. DACA ineligible):
- Self-reported health: 0.056 (95%CI: -0.024;0.04)
- Logistic regression, adjusted odds ratio (DACA eligible vs. DACA ineligible):
- Poor or fair health: 0.98 (95%CI: 0.66;1.44)
- Moderate or worse psychological distress (K6): 0.62 (95% CI: 0.41;0.93)
Exposure to DACA programme led to reduction in symptoms of psychological distress but no improvements in self-reported overall health.
| Wenner et al. 2020 | Differences in realized access to healthcare among newly arrived refugees in Germany: results from a natural quasi-experiment | German y | 55452 person-quarters | ecological cohort analytic | secondary | refugees | policy (healthcare access policy) | regional variation, residential dispersal (individual) | heathcare utilisation | Standardised incidence ratios (eHC vs. standard healthcare utilisatio n) | In municipalities with HeV, utilisation of specialist and emergency services were significantly higher than expected rates of the standard population. In municipalities with eHC, SIRs for these two outcomes converged with the expected rates. | Standardised incidence ratios (eHC vs. standard population) | Logistic regression model, odds ratio (HV vs. regular access) | Poisson regression, adjusted incidence rate ratio (DACA eligible vs. DACA ineligible): K6 score: 0.78 (95%CI: 0.56-0.95) |
|-------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------|----------------------|------------------------|-----------|----------|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------|---------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
| Ye & Rodriguez 2021 | Highly vulnerable communities and the Affordable Care Act: Health insurance coverage effects, 2010–2018 | USA | 29274 | cohort analytic | secondary (American Community Survey) | international migrants | policy (healthcare access policy) | regional variation (community) | healthcare utilisation | Difference-in-Difference parameter estimates, odds ratio (expansion vs. non-expansion states): insurance coverage: 1.59 (SE: 0.11; 95%CI: 1.39-1.82; p < 0.01) | Differential increase in insurance coverage of 59% (7.84 pp) in states with ACA Medicaid expansions. |

Abbreviations: ACA: Affordable Care Act; BMI: Body Mass Index; CES-D: Center for Epidemiological Studies Depression Scale; CI: Confidence Interval; DACA: Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals; DEGS: German health interview and examination survey for adults; ED: Emergency department; eHc: Electronic Health Card; GP: General practitioner; HcV/HV: healthcare voucher; KIGGS: German Health Interview and Examination Survey for Children and Adolescents; LATE: local average treatment effect; log: logarithm; MHI-5: Mental Health Inventory-5; MI: Myocardial Infarction; NS: not significant; OLS: ordinary least squares; PAC: Pacific Access Category; pp: percentage points; SE: standard error; SF-36: 36-item short form survey to measure health-related quality of life; SHI: statutory health insurance; USA: United States of America; vs.: versus; WHR: Waist-Hip ratio.

*The category “refugees” includes those who have applied for a refugee status (frequently referred to as “asylum seekers”, those with a successful application outcome, as well as those resettled under a humanitarian resettlement scheme (e.g. UNHCR refugees)

**For a definition of categories used, please refer to Panel 2