Early COVID-19 Pandemic Response in Western Visayas, Philippines

Zamora, Pia Regina Fatima\textsuperscript{1*}, Rico, Jonathan Adam\textsuperscript{1}, Bolinas, Dominic Karl\textsuperscript{2}, Sevilleja, Jesus Emmanuel\textsuperscript{3}, de Castro, Romulo\textsuperscript{1}

\textsuperscript{1}University of San Agustin Iloilo – Center for Informatics, Iloilo City, Iloilo, Philippines
\textsuperscript{2}University of the Philippines Manila – College of Medicine, Manila, Philippines
\textsuperscript{3}National Center for Mental Health, Mandaluyong City, Manila, Philippines

* Corresponding author
Email: prfzamora@usa.edu.ph (PRFZ)
Abstract

The COVID-19 pandemic has burdened the public health system in the Philippines since January 2020. In Western Visayas (Region 6), Philippines, issues have been raised on the limitations of the government’s response on testing, contact tracing, and augmentation of healthcare facilities. Using data from the Western Visayas - Regional Epidemiologic Surveillance Unit (WV - RESU) from March 20 – June 20, 2020, the following observations were made: 1) Of the 6 provinces, Iloilo had the highest % tests done per capita which may be linked to the presence of the only regional COVID-19 testing facility in the province at that time, 2) There were delays in the overall processing times for specimens from Antique and Negros Occidental which may be linked to transport logistics and/or laboratory processing, 3) Contact tracing and testing were de-linked – tracing was adequate (3,420/3,503, 97.63%), but less than 50% of these (1,668/3,420) were tested, 4) Hospital and quarantine facility capacities were still adequate, but their utilization rates needed to be monitored continuously for further augmentation, if needed. This data shows the challenges of establishing a pandemic response in one of the regions in the Philippines.

Introduction

Since its first confirmed case in Jan 30, 2020, the Philippines has gone through multisectoral changes to curb the spread of COVID-19. The government has implemented varying levels of quarantine measures all over the country to flatten the curve, i.e., prevent a surge in cases and deaths that could overwhelm healthcare capacity [1]. In addition to these measures, efforts were also focused on ramping up testing, intensifying contact tracing, and augmenting health facility capacity [2,3]. In the first 3 months, a series of lockdowns had already been imposed, but the country’s response to the pandemic was still impeded due to delays in case reporting, inefficient tracing of patient contacts, poor support for laboratory and hospital personnel, and inadequate testing among others [4,5]. All these are symptoms of an ailing and persistently
unprepared public health system, exposed wholly by emergency situations such as the COVID-19 pandemic [6].

The Western Visayas region (Region 6) has been implementing its preventive measures since its first reported case on March 20, 2020. The enhanced community quarantine (ECQ) was implemented starting March 20 through May 15, 2020 for Iloilo province, and April 30, 2020 for the other provinces in the region. As of June 20, 2020, the region had a total of 177 cases with the number of deaths pegged at 11 since June 6, 2020, and 109 recoveries which continued to grow in number daily (Fig 1) [7,8]. Despite the region’s control over the spread of COVID-19 in the first few months, it also encountered numerous issues in its response, similar to what was being observed nationwide. This study aims to provide an overview of the health scenario in Western Visayas at the start of the pandemic, and highlights aspects that need to be focused on to improve the region’s response in future epidemics or pandemics.

Fig 1. COVID-19 Data in Western Visayas: New and Cumulative Cases, Recoveries, and Deaths from March 20 - June 20, 2020 [8].

Data and methods

We officially requested and obtained COVID-19 data for the period of March 20, 2020 – June 20, 2020 from the Western Visayas - Regional Epidemiology Surveillance Unit (RESU) (S5 Appendix). The data included the following:

1. Deidentified case profiles of confirmed cases in Western Visayas
2. Number of positive and negative results released by the Western Visayas Medical Center – Subnational Laboratory (WVMC-SNL) for COVID-19 testing
3. Capacity and Utilization of Hospital and Quarantine Facilities in Western Visayas
4. Contact tracing data for each confirmed case in Western Visayas
First, we looked into the distribution of COVID-19 testing capacities of the six (6) provinces of Western Visayas which are Aklan, Antique, Capiz, Guimaras, Iloilo, and Negros Occidental. Among the provinces, only Iloilo has a COVID-19 testing center from March 24, 2020 to June 1, 2020 [9] which serves as the testing center for the entire Western Visayas. Given the scenario, we examined the number of samples tested for COVID-19 from each province. We also looked at the distance and traveling time (estimated using Google Maps) between the COVID-19 collection centers in the five (5) provinces and the testing center which affects the processing time of releasing the results and compared them with the average processing time of tests in Iloilo. Second, we looked into the contact tracing capacity of each province in Western Visayas, in particular, comparing the number of contact tracers per province and examined the percentage of reported contacts that were tested. Lastly, we looked at the distribution of staffed hospital beds and the distribution of quarantine beds per 100,000 population among Western Visayas provinces.

Results and discussion

COVID-19 testing

The Western Visayas Medical Center – Subnational Laboratory (WVMC-SNL) for COVID-19 testing became operational last March 24, 2020 [10]. As of June 02, 2020, the WVMC-SNL has tested ~11,200 individuals [11]. In % tests per capita (number of individuals tested/total population, multiplied by 100) for each province, Iloilo had the highest percentage with 0.318%. Within the same period, the % tests per capita of the other provinces ranged from 0.021 – 0.098% (Fig 2). A similar trend has been seen in the available testing data in the previous weeks (S1 Appendix).

The higher % tests per capita in Iloilo indicates that a greater percentage of individuals are being tested in the province compared to the rest of the region. The presence of the COVID-19 testing facility in the
province of Iloilo may attribute to this. The proximity to the testing center places Iloilo at an advantage as its healthcare facilities can immediately transport samples to the facility for testing.

Fig 2. COVID-19 laboratory testing in Western Visayas: % tests per capita as of June 02, 2020 (S1 Appendix).

This finding is interesting in light of the tally of cases in the region per province (Fig 3). That the location of the testing center, in Iloilo City, coincides with the highest number of cases consistently since the epidemic began, even though the first case was registered in Negros Occidental, was impetus for us to investigate. This was fueled by the rough observation at the national level that the regional location of COVID-19 testing centers seems to always give the highest number of cases (Fig 4). This is the “streetlight effect” that we previously discussed [12].

Fig 3. Cumulative COVID-19 cases in Western Visayas, per province, as of June 20, 2020 [8].

Fig 4. COVID-19 cases by region as of June 20, 2020 [13].

It was worthwhile to look into the overall processing time of samples from collection to release of results. Among 103 confirmed cases (with data), the overall processing time of samples ranged from 2 to 12 days. On average, samples from Aklan, Capiz, and Guimaras had an overall processing time of ~3 days. This duration differed by at least 4 hours with that of Iloilo (3.2 days) where the WVMC-SNL is located. Samples from Antique and Negros Occidental had an overall processing time of ~5 days, which are 59.38% and 68.75% longer processing time with that of Iloilo (Table 1).
Table 1. Overall processing time (Iloilo vs other Western Visayas provinces) among COVID-19 positive individuals (N = 103) as of June 02, 2020 (S1 Appendix).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Number of specimen</th>
<th>Overall Processing Time (vs Iloilo)</th>
<th>Average (days)</th>
<th>% difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aklan</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>6.25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antique</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>59.38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capiz</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>-12.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guimaras</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-6.25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negros Occidental</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>68.75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iloilo (reference)</td>
<td>52</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The overall processing time was further subdivided into the following: 1) sample collection to laboratory receipt, and 2) laboratory receipt to release of results. The first component refers to the time it takes for the specimen to be sent to the laboratory after collection, and the second component refers to the duration from laboratory processing and results validation up to the release of results.

Looking into the first component, it was observed that majority of the specimen from Guimaras, Capiz and Iloilo were transported to the WVMC-SNL within 24 hours after collection, while those from Aklan, Antique, and Negros Occidental were transported within 24 - 48 hours after collection. Taking into consideration the proximity of the different specimen collection sites (i.e. hospitals, municipal health centers) to the WVMC-SNL, the estimated travel time from provinces within the Panay island to the laboratory ranges from < 1 hr up to 4 hours. For the provinces outside Panay Island (Guimaras and Negros Occidental), the modes of transport include both land and sea travel. The estimated travel time from Guimaras and Negros Occidental to the laboratory ranges from 1-2 hours and 2-5 hours, respectively (Table 2). The travel time from Negros Occidental and Antique to the laboratory may have contributed to the longer overall processing time. It is possible that there are logistical preparations that need to be made before
transporting the specimens which may have led to the processing delay. The transport delays for Antique, however, needs to be further investigated as it does not seem to be observed in Aklan and Capiz which are also located in Panay island.

Table 2. Duration from collection to laboratory receipt of specimens (N = 103) as of June 02, 2020 and the estimated travel time from collection sites to the WVMC-SNL (S1 Appendix).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>≤ 24 hours</th>
<th>24 - 48 hours</th>
<th>&gt;48 hours</th>
<th>Estimated travel time to WVMC-SNL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aklan</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antique</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>27.78%</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>66.67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capiz</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guimaras</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negros</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occidental</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iloilo</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>94.23%</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.85%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


In the second time component which includes laboratory processing and results validation, a notable difference was found between the average laboratory processing times between Iloilo and Antique (Table 2). Such a difference requires further examination since it was not found between Iloilo and the other 4 provinces. Presumably, processing all happens within the testing center so it is peculiar that there seems to be a disparity against samples from Antique.

Table 3. Duration of laboratory processing to release of results (Iloilo vs other Western Visayas provinces) among COVID-19 positive individuals (N = 103) as of June 02, 2020 (S1 Appendix).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Laboratory receipt to results release (vs Iloilo)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Average (days)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aklan</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antique</td>
<td>4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capiz</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guimaras</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negros Occidental</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iloilo (reference)</td>
<td>3.12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall, the delays in the overall processing time for specimens from Negros Occidental may be linked to transport logistics, while those from Antique may be linked with both transport logistics, and laboratory processing/results validation (or, the 47.44% longer time from receipt to release of results). Interestingly, despite the testing center being in Iloilo City only, no processing disparity occurs against Aklan, Capiz, and Guimaras, demonstrating that processing can certainly improve with Antique and Negros Occidental.

In the last 2 years, several laboratories have already been setup in Western Visayas. As of March 23, 2022, there are already 19 licensed COVID-19 testing centers in the region - 7 in Iloilo, 7 in Negros
Occidental, 2 in Aklan, 2 in Capiz, 1 in Antique [14]. The daily testing capacity for the entire region is approximately 2100 tests / day [13]. Last February 2022, the daily testing capacity at the provincial level are as follows: Iloilo (including samples from Guimaras) – ~1321 tests, Negros Occidental - ~586 tests, Aklan - ~53 tests, Capiz - ~67 tests, Antique - ~73 tests.

Increasing the number of laboratories will surely address the streetlight effect which initially seem to focus only in the province of Iloilo. To further optimize the testing capacity, however, other factors such as the transit time of samples (sample collection to receipt in laboratory) and the processing time in the laboratories need to be investigated.

Contact tracing

In the three-pronged approach to curb COVID-19 spread- testing, contact tracing, augmenting health facilities - of the Department of Health, contact tracing seems to be the most limited. In May 2020, the number of trained contact tracers, only 35 per 100,000 population [6,15], was still considered inadequate. This hampered the capacity of the country to locate and monitor all patient contacts, especially with the number of cases still continuously growing. At present, some local government units (LGUs) opt for a 1 contact tracer to 5000 barangay residents ratio to ensure that there is adequate monitoring of cases on the ground [16].

In Western Visayas, 3,503 patient contacts of the 104 confirmed cases have already been identified as of May 18, 2020. Of these, 3,420 (97.63%) contacts have been traced. The untraced contacts were likely encountered in the community, workplace, and during travel. Of the 3,420 contacts traced, less than 50% (1,668) were tested (S2 Appendix).

Although contact tracing in Western Visayas seems to have high coverage, it seems de-linked from testing. Thus, the guidelines for testing patient contacts may need to be reviewed, revised, and enforced among all contacts [7].
In March 2021, all local government units (LGUs) were mandated by the Department of Interior and Local Government (DILG) to use only the StaySafe app as their contact tracing tool. However, since its implementation, this app has only served as a log of individuals who visited establishments. As of August 2021, it has not been fully utilized yet for tracking patient contacts. Several leaders have already stated that contact tracing remains to be the “weakest link” in the government’s response with the use of Staysafe app having “almost no impact” [17].

Health facilities

Hospitals

As of June 19, 2020, the region had 586 COVID-19-dedicated beds: 82 COVID ward beds, 55 intensive care unit (ICU) beds, and 449 isolation beds. These beds were allotted for severe and critical cases. More than 70% of the beds are in Iloilo (39.9%) and Negros Occidental (34.8%) (Fig 5). With respect to each province’s population (per 100,000 population), Aklan and Iloilo have ~10 beds each, Capiz and Negros Occidental have ~7 beds each, Antique has ~6 beds, and Guimaras has only ~1 bed (Fig 6). On average the bed capacity of the region per 100,000 population is in the range of only 1-10, a grossly inadequate figure considering the number of COVID-19 cases observed per 100,000 tested nationwide is 6,656 [13].

Daily hospital utilization for the entire region has been below 60% since April 20, 2020 (Fig 7) – which indicates that the overwhelming majority of cases are either mild or asymptomatic requiring no hospitalization, plus many who may get sick but are not hospitalized because they cannot afford it. We have not actually entered an unhampered post-quarantine period, thus, we think that our facilities still need to be augmented for a potential surge according to our results in simulating the hospital resources needed for Iloilo province using FluSurge [18].
**Quarantine facility**

As of June 20, 2020, the region had 281 quarantine facilities housing 10,810 quarantine beds. These beds were allotted for patient contacts and, mild and asymptomatic cases that need to be isolated [19]. Similar to the distribution of hospital beds, majority of the quarantine beds in the region are in Negros Occidental (35.5%) and Iloilo (35.4%) (Fig 8). With respect to each province’s population (per 100,000 population), Antique actually has the highest number of allotted quarantine beds with ~313, followed by Iloilo (~167 beds), Negros Occidental (~121 beds), Capiz (~86 beds), Aklan (~54 beds), and Guimaras (~6 beds) (Fig 9). Overall, the daily utilization rates of quarantine facilities in Aklan, Antique, Capiz, and Guimaras have not yet exceeded ~60% capacity. On the other hand, the trends for Iloilo and Negros Occidental have risen to more than ~70% starting June 15, 2020 (Fig 10). The respective local government units (LGUs) of these provinces must prepare contingencies (e.g. add quarantine beds, etc) in case their capacities are exceeded. The provinces must also be prepared as locally-stranded individuals (LSIs) and overseas Filipino worker (OFW) repatriates are expected to be flown in weekly into the region beginning on June 20, 2020 [20]. These individuals will be housed in quarantine facilities for at least 14 days before they are allowed to go back to their respective communities [21]. As with hospital facilities, the utilization rate of quarantine facilities needs to be continuously monitored for a possible surge in cases.
Conclusion

An analysis of the COVID-19 situation in Western Visayas for the period March 20 - June 20, showed that the region’s capacity for testing & contact tracing were lacking. The experience with the COVID-19 pandemic should prompt government leaders to already invest in Biosafety Level 2/3 laboratories that can handle pathogens with the potential to cause outbreaks, epidemics or pandemics. There should also be an adequate and ready pool of clinical laboratory personnel who are adept at performing high-level molecular techniques (i.e. PCR, "Omics" etc). In addition, the use of rapid test kits should also be incorporated in the efforts. This will expand the limited testing capacity, which was the case at the beginning of the pandemic. On contact tracing, the StaySafe app should now be fully utilized as a unified system that incorporates physician check-up, identified cases, and their contacts, not only for COVID-19 but for other infectious diseases as well. Contact tracers should be regularly trained on the use of the platform, which is foreseen to help them efficiently trace patient contacts in a timely manner. Healthcare capacity should also be increased alongside efficient testing and contact tracing. At the outset of a disease outbreak of epidemic or pandemic potential, the ultimate goal is to strengthen testing and contact tracing mechanisms to prevent case surges that overwhelm healthcare capacity in the region.

Acknowledgments

The authors would like to thank the Department of Science and Technology – Science Education Institute Career Incentive Program (DOST-SEI CIP) for making this research possible.
References


2. Esguerra DJ. Philippines now has 26 COVID-19 testing centers -- DOH | Inquirer News [Internet]. [cited 2022 Mar 5]. Available from: https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/1272710/philippines-now-has-26-covid-19-testing-centers-doh#ixzz6M43WUW5K


15. de Vera B, Yee J. Gov’t to hire 136,000 contact tracers, says Neda chief | Inquirer News [Internet]. [cited 2022 Mar 5]. Available from: https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/1278493/govt-to-hire-136000-contact-tracers-says-neda-chief


Supplemental information

S1 Appendix. Western Visayas – RESU 2020 June 02 COVID-19 Testing by the WVMC-SNL.

S2 Appendix. Western Visayas – RESU 2020 May 19 Contact Tracing.

S3 Appendix. Western Visayas – RESU 2020 June 19 Hospital Capacity and Utilization.

S4 Appendix. Western Visayas – RESU 2020 June 20 COVID-19 Health Facility Capacity.

S5 Appendix. Western Visayas – CHD Freedom of Information Approval Letter.
Figure 1
Figure 2

Percentage of tests per capita by province over different dates:
- Aklan: May 10 (0.049%), May 18 (0.054%), Jun 02 (0.067%)
- Antique: May 10 (0.071%), May 18 (0.078%), Jun 02 (0.098%)
- Capiz: May 10 (0.030%), May 18 (0.034%), Jun 02 (0.063%)
- Guimaras: May 10 (0.007%), May 18 (0.013%), Jun 02 (0.021%)
- Iloilo: May 10 (0.147%), May 18 (0.208%), Jun 02 (0.318%)
- Negros Occidental: May 10 (0.028%), May 18 (0.038%), Jun 02 (0.049%)

Dates and sample sizes:
- May 10: N=5714
- May 18: N=7535
- Jun 02: N=11244
Figure 5

- Negros Occidental: 34.8%
- Iloilo: 39.9%
- Capiz: 9.6%
- Antique: 5.3%
- Guimaras: 0.3%
- Aklan: 10.1%
Figure 6
Figure 8

- Negros Occidental: 35.5%
- Antique: 19.3%
- Capiz: 6.8%
- Guimaras: 0.1%
- Iloilo: 35.4%
- Aklan: 3.0%
Figure 9

Beds per 100,000 population

- Aklan: 54
- Antique: 313
- Capiz: 86
- Guimaras: 5 (marked as a small value)
- Iloilo: 166
- Negros Occidental: 121