New England Journal of Medicine – Original Research

Alzheimer's disease in retired elite collision sports athletes: cohort study

G. David Baty, PhD DSc (E. david.batty@ucl.ac.uk | ORCID: 0000-0003-1822-5753)
Department of Epidemiology and Public Health, University College London, London, UK

Urho M. Kujala, MD PhD (urho.m.kujala@fimnet.fi | 0000-0002-9262-1992)
Faculty of Sport and Health Sciences, University of Jyväskylä, Jyväskylä, Finland

Seppo J. Sarna, PhD (seppo.sarna@helsinki.fi | 0000-0003-3458-1627)
Department of Public Health, University of Helsinki, Helsinki, Finland

Carlos A. Valencia-Hernández, MD PhD (c.valencia-hernandez@imperial.ac.uk | 0000-0002-7596-4846)
National Heart & Lung Institute, Imperial College London, London, UK

Jaakko Kaprio, MD PhD (jaakko.kaprio@helsinki.fi | 0000-0002-3716-2455)
Institute for Molecular Medicine FIMM, University of Helsinki, Helsinki, Finland

Corresponding author: David Baty, Department of Epidemiology and Public Health, University College London, 1-19 Torrington Place, London, UK, WC1E 6BT. E. david.batty@ucl.ac.uk

Manuscript characteristics: 2678 words; 2 tables and 3 figures; 1 supplemental file

Contributions: GDB generated the idea for the paper, formulated the analytical plan, and drafted the manuscript. UMK and SJS designed data collection and edited the manuscript. CA V-H prepared the figures and edited the manuscript. JK designed data collection, formulated the analytical plan, conducted the data analyses, and edited the manuscript.

Conflict of interest: None to declare.

Acknowledgement: The preparation of this manuscript received no direct funding. GDB is supported by the UK Medical Research Council (MR/P023444/1) and the US National Institute on Aging (1R56AG052519-01; 1R01AG052519-01A1), and JK by the Academy of Finland Centre of Excellence in Complex Disease Genetics (336823).

NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.
Abstract

Background: Neuropathology consistent with chronic traumatic encephalopathy has been reported at autopsy in retired collision sports athletes, but whether these individuals also experience greater rates of dementia over their lifetime is uncertain.

Methods: Cohort study of 2005 male retired athletes who had competed internationally for Finland between 1920 and 1965, and 1386 male controls. At follow-up, data were captured via questionnaire administration and linkage to mortality, hospitalisation, and medication registries.

Results: A mean of 31 years of event surveillance (range 1-46) of a sample of 3391 men gave rise to 488 cases of neurodegenerative disease. In multiple-adjusted analyses, relative to the general population, boxing was associated with a quadrupling (4.10; 2.55, 6.61), and soccer (2.07; 1.23, 3.46) and wrestling (2.11; 1.28, 3.48) a doubling of the risk of Alzheimer’s disease. Boxers with extended careers had twice the risk of Alzheimer’s disease (2.07; 0.95, 4.51) relative to those who competed for shorter periods. For all collision sports, disease risk was most pronounced for those who competed after the second World War. Computation of competing risks and a series of sensitivity analyses did not appreciably alter these results.

Conclusions: In the present study, men with an elite-level background in soccer, wrestling, and boxing subsequently experienced poorer brain health than general population and non-collision sports controls.
Introduction

That former elite athletes have a longer life expectancy and a lower risk of cardiovascular disease relative to the general population is frequently used as evidence of the long-term health benefits of physical activity.\(^1^-^5\) More recently, however, there has been suggestions of an increased burden of neurodegenerative disorders in retired athletes, in particular in those with a background in collision sports.\(^1,^4^-^7\) This is consistent with autopsy evidence of neuropathology, including chronic traumatic encephalopathy, among some former ice hockey\(^8\) and American football\(^9\) players.

Although the occurrence of brain injury in collisions sports participants\(^10\) and the notion that this may lead to dementia in boxers was first mooted a century ago,\(^11\) there has been few epidemiological investigations of brain health in former athletes. American football is perhaps the most scrutinised sport in this context\(^1,^12^-^13\) but, strikingly, there is an absence of similar studies comparing rates of diagnosis in boxers or wrestlers relative to unexposed individuals. Moreover, for the most popular global collision sport, soccer, with one exception,\(^4\) existing reports universally focus on the risk of amyotrophic lateral sclerosis,\(^5,^14^-^16\) a rare neurodegenerative disorder relative to the more burdensome dementias. Most studies in this field are also too underpowered to detect a relationship should one exist, and the use of a modest range of covariate data complicates the attribution of poor brain health to the sport in question rather than other risk factors.

We were able to address this gap in knowledge by utilising data from a well-characterised cohort study of men drawn from an array of elite sporting backgrounds entering their 11th decade.\(^17^-^18\) Given that boxing and wrestling are known to have a higher incidence of head trauma relative to other activities such as soccer,\(^19^-^20\) in this cross-sport comparison with the general population and non-collision sports groups, we anticipated that the occurrence of neurodegenerative disease, including dementia, would be highest in the combat sports.
Methods

This is an exposure-based cohort study originally established to examine the relationship between elite sports performance and longevity.\textsuperscript{21,22} Established in 1978, the sample was generated from 2613 Finnish male former elite athletes (640 Olympians) who competed internationally between 1920 and 1965 (supplemental figure 1). Identified using a combination of sports yearbooks, association records, and periodicals, these athletes represent a diverse array of sporting backgrounds. Based on the occurrence of concussion-causing head injury,\textsuperscript{19,20,23} we denoted sports as collision (soccer, boxing, Greco-Roman/classic wrestling, ice hockey, and basketball) or non-collision (track and field, cross-country skiing, and weight-lifting), with the former group disaggregated as the numbers of neurodegenerative disorders at follow-up allowed.

For the purposes of the present analyses, participants in the non-collision sports represented the unexposed athletic control group. A general population-based comparison group comprising apparently healthy men was also generated using records from a population-wide medical examination routinely administered to all Finnish males at around 20 years of age as part of national service (N=1712). Data collection was approved by the ethics committee of the Hospital Districts of Helsinki and Uusimaa, and all participants provided informed consent. The present manuscript conforms to the Strengthening the Reporting of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (STROBE) Statement of guidelines for reporting observational studies.\textsuperscript{24}

Assessment of covariates

In 1985, surviving study members and population controls (N=2851; 66\% of the original cohort) were mailed a self-completion questionnaire (N=1917; response 67\%) (supplemental figure 1). In addition to enquiries regarding career duration, a series of covariate data were collected including smoking habit, alcohol intake (amount and pattern), marital status, sports participation in early adulthood, and height and weight from which body mass index was computed using the usual formulae (\text{weight[kg]}/[\text{height(m)}]^2).\textsuperscript{25}
Men also responded to questions about their occupation and, in combination with data extracted from the Finnish Central Population Registry, longest held job was used as our indicator of socioeconomic status (executives [highest status], clerical staff, skilled workers, unskilled workers; or farmers). Additionally, the presence of diabetes, hypertension, and coronary heart disease was derived from linkage of study members to the National Social Insurance Institution register which has records of individuals prescribed approved drug therapies for these and other conditions for the purposes of reimbursement.

**Ascertainment of neurodegenerative disorders**

Study members were linked to three health registries to ascertain the occurrence of a neurodegenerative disorders during follow-up: death, including cause; hospitalisations, including cause; and the Finnish Drug Prescription Register for medications specifically used to treat Alzheimer's disease (the Anatomical Therapeutic Chemical code observed were: N06DA02, donepezil; N06DA03, rivastigmine; N06DA04, galantamine; and N06DX01, memantine). We then generated five neurodegenerative disease outcomes for use in the present analyses (for the International Classification of Disease codes (versions 8-10), see supplemental table 1): all neurodegenerative disease combined, all dementias, Alzheimer’s disease, non-Alzheimer’s dementia, and Parkinson’s disease. Deaths were based on any mention of a neurodegenerative disease on the death certificate. As demonstrated for other risk factors, and in the present analyses for collision sport participation, associations with neurodegenerative disorders were little-changed whether endpoint data were based on underlying cause only versus any mention on the death certificate (supplemental table 2), and whether we used deaths only (supplemental table 3) versus a combination of death, hospital admission, and drug treatment for Alzheimer’s disease (main analyses).

**Statistical analyses**

After exclusion of study members owing to record-linkage failure and death prior to the beginning of follow-up (supplemental figure 1), the analytical sample comprised 3,391 men (2005 former athletes, 1386 population controls). Born 1884-1949 (mean 1925), event surveillance was from 1st January 1970 until the occurrence of a neurodegenerative disease event or the end of surveillance (31st December, 2015)–
whichever came first. Having ascertained that the proportional hazards assumption had not been violated, we used Cox regression to compute hazard ratios with accompanying 95% confidence intervals to summarise the relationship of sport participation with the risk of neurodegenerative disorder. Age was used as the time covariate in statistical models that focused on former boxing, wrestling, and soccer athletes – there were insufficient degenerative disease endpoints in other sports to facilitate analyses. All analyses were computed using Stata 15 (StataCorp, College Station, TX).

**Results**

In general, relative to the general population, elite sports participants had somewhat more favourable baseline risk factor profiles (supplemental tables 4 and 5). These differentials were most consistently evident for socio-economic disadvantage and cigarette smoking. In contrast, heavy alcohol consumption was more common in the athletes. As anticipated, several of these baseline characteristics were related to an elevated rate of dementia (supplemental table 6), although statistical significance at conventional levels was not always apparent. Thus, there was around a 50% increase in the risk of future dementia if study members came from poor social circumstances (age-adjusted hazard ratio; 95% confidence interval: 1.70; 1.25, 2.31), had a physical morbidity such as diabetes (1.50; 1.15, 1.97) or hypertension (1.41; 1.15, 1.73), smoked cigarettes (1.41; 1.01, 1.98), or lost consciousness at least annually owing to heavy alcohol intake (1.69; 1.23, 2.33). There was, however, an absence of association for existing heart disease, being unmarried, and being overweight or obese.

Compared to the general population, individuals in the athlete groups typically had a lower risk of mortality from all-cause and cardiovascular disease (table 1). The only exception was for former boxers and we investigated this further by generating a mortality outcome that did not include neurodegenerative disease. In these analyses, boxing was also related to a lower risk of death, although statistical significance at conventional levels was not apparent for this combat sport as it was not for other athletic groups.
In the main analyses, a mean of 30.6 years of surveillance (range 1-46), corresponding to 103,768 person-years in the analytical sample of 3391 men, gave rise to 488 neurodegenerative disease events (265 ascribed to Alzheimer’s disease, 333 to non-Alzheimer’s disease, and 92 to Parkinson disease). Figures 1-3 (and supplemental tables 7-11) depict the occurrence of these outcomes in relation to collision sports participation. In age-adjusted analyses, boxers experienced three times the rate of neurodegenerative disorder combined relative to the general population (3.08; 2.31, 4.10) (supplemental table 7). While there was also a raised risk amongst soccer players (1.58; 1.15, 2.19) and a more modest relationship for wrestling (1.18; 0.84, 1.67), neurodegenerative disease was not convincingly related to participation in other collision sports. Adjusting for an array of potential explanatory factors which included socioeconomic status, comorbidity, and alcohol had modest impact on the point estimates for former boxers (3.11; 2.17, 4.45), soccer players (1.40; 0.93, 2.10), and wrestlers (1.28; 0.84, 1.95) (figure 1 and supplemental table 7).

The association of participation in boxing and soccer with neurodegenerative disease was largely generated by the link with dementias (supplemental table 8) and, of these, effects were strongest for Alzheimer’s disease (figure 2 and supplemental table 9) relative to other subtypes (supplemental table 10). That is, in minimally-adjusted analyses, boxing was related to a more than quadrupling in the risk of later Alzheimer’s disease (4.45; 3.07, 6.45), whereas the disease rates in wrestlers (1.90; 1.24, 2.90) and soccer players (2.43; 1.62, 3.64) was around double that of general population controls. When we took into account explanatory factors additional to age, the pattern of association was essentially unchanged (figure 2). That the association of collision sports with neurodegenerative disease were lower than that apparent for the dementias was due to the absence of association between any of the individual collision sports and Parkinson’s disease (supplemental table 11).

We further explored the effects for specific collision sports and Alzheimer’s disease. In analyses of career duration, there was a suggestion that boxers who fought competitively for 15 years or more had twice the rate of this disorder (2.07; 0.95, 4.51) relative to those with shorter exposures; no such differential was apparent for wrestling or soccer, however (supplemental table 12). We also investigated era-specific
changes to rules or equipment designed to protect the players might have an impact on the sports—
Alzheimer’s disease relation. We in fact found a markedly stronger relation with Alzheimer’s disease for 
athletes who participated in each of the collision sports post-world war II relative to earlier (table 2). For 
instance, soccer players active 1948-1965 experienced around three times the risk of Alzheimer’s disease 
(2.96; 1.82, 4.82), whereas for those who competed earlier the corresponding risk was lower (1.43; 0.66, 
3.12).

We also conducted some sensitivity analyses. First, owing to missing data, the more complex statistical 
models comprise fewer study members. We therefore recomputed the main effects in a non-missing 
dataset and results were essentially unchanged (supplemental table 13). Second, given the amateur era in 
which study members competed internationally (1920-1965), it is plausible that, if sufficiently skilled, they 
would have participated at elite level in more than one of the sports linked to neurodegenerative disorder 
in our analyses. Mutual control for each of the three sports associated with neurodegenerative disease did 
not, however, impact upon the existing pattern of association (supplemental table 14). Third, given the 
maturity of this cohort, we subjected the outcome of Alzheimer’s disease to a competing-risks analysis 
whereby the existence of the most common cause of death and hospitalisation herein (cardiovascular 
disease) precludes the occurrence of the primary event of interest (Alzheimer’s disease). There was no 
suggestion that this was the case (supplemental table 15). Lastly, it is plausible that the general population 
controls contained some elite sports people, although this misclassification would have had the impact of 
diminishing the risk of neurodegenerative disease in the elite sports groups. A total of 66 of the 765 men in 
the control group who returned a questionnaire in 1985 indicated they participated as young adults in one 
of three collision sports associated with neurodegenerative disease in the present study, but when they 
were excluded from the control group (supplemental table 16) there was again no impact on the results.

Discussion

Our main finding was that, relative to control groups comprising either non-collision sports participants or 
the general population, former elite-level collision athletes had a subsequently raised risk of
neurodegenerative disorders. This was particularly evident for Alzheimer’s disease where boxers experienced a post-retirement quadrupling of risk and soccer players and wrestlers a doubling. These post-retirement elevated disease rates were found despite the contrasting head impact profiles of these activities.\textsuperscript{19,20} That is, concussions are more common in boxing and wrestling\textsuperscript{19,20} and result largely from person-on-person contact, whereas in soccer, the insult is more likely to be sub-concussive and attributable to contact with equipment—the ball—when attempting to redirect it using the head.

That boxers with extended careers had around twice the risk of Alzheimer’s disease relative to those who competed for shorter periods may signal the additional harms of accumulated exposure, although the same was not apparent for former soccer players and wrestlers. We also found that, for all these sports, the risk of Alzheimer’s disease was particularly pronounced in those men taking part post-war. Improved diagnosis of Alzheimer’s disease will have led to more cases being identified in younger study members, although this would need to be differential with respect to the exposure for it to influence our associations. If the greater risk of collision sports post-war is not artefactual, it could be ascribed to a more intensive regime of training and competition in the modern era, with a concomitant increase in the occurrence of head injury. Another possibility is risk compensation whereby an athlete engages in more damaging behaviour in response to a perception of improved protection from, for instance, the introduction of head gear in boxing.\textsuperscript{30,31}

That we were able to recapitulate several known risk factor–dementia relationships in this cohort for low socioeconomic status, comorbidities, and smoking\textsuperscript{32} gives us some confidence in these novel results for collision sports. Our findings are also supported by results from cohorts of people exposed to head injury of greater severity where an increased future burden of dementia has been reported in people with a history of hospitalised for traumatic brain injury typically due to vehicular accidents or falls.\textsuperscript{33–36} In the sporting realm, most empirical evidence comes from two groups: studies of former American football players and the occurrence of neurodegenerative disease, including dementia, with mixed results;\textsuperscript{1,12,13} and
amyotrophic lateral sclerosis in retired soccer players where disease risk seems to be consistently elevated.\textsuperscript{5,14,15}

In mechanistically-orientated research that may be brought to bear on our observational data, autopsy studies reveal chronic traumatic encephalopathy-type neuropathological change in former soccer players.\textsuperscript{37} There is also evidence that heading produces an acute if temporary lowering of cognitive function,\textsuperscript{38} while potentially more permanent structural changes to the brain are evident upon imaging.\textsuperscript{39}

Our study is not without its limitations. Our sample exclusively comprises men, and although we can think of no reason for the present results not applying to women given that other risk factors predict dementia equally well in sex-specific analyses,\textsuperscript{40,41} this clearly requires empirical testing. If the expected relationship does exist, the population impact may in fact be greater given the apparent higher prevalence of head injury, including concussion, in female athletes relative to males in the same sports.\textsuperscript{42} Whether a background in collision sports such as rugby union or league, lacrosse, basketball, and mixed martial arts, is also related to dementia risk is currently unknown – where we had some such participants in the present study, there was an insufficiently high number of disease events to facilitate analyses. There are reasons to anticipate that pre adult exposure to head injury may be compensated by a greater degree of neurological plasticity;\textsuperscript{43} equally it could be argued that the impact on brain health could be more damaging owing programming effects. We did not, however, have data on head injury in childhood or adolescence with which is test these propositions.

Participants in boxing represent a miniscule proportion of the population and, while dementia is a pernicious condition, the population impact of greater safety legislation in that sport will therefore be low despite the high dementia risk found herein. By contrast, wrestling is relative common at high school and collegiate level in selected countries, most notably the USA\textsuperscript{44} and, with around a quarter of a billion participants, soccer is the most popular global sport\textsuperscript{45} – the same order as the estimated number of people with a diagnosis of diabetes worldwide,\textsuperscript{46} a recognised risk factor for dementia.\textsuperscript{32}
In conclusion, in the present study, a history of elite level engagement in soccer, wrestling, and boxing was related to later risk of Alzheimer’s disease independently of many recognised risk factors. The global burden of soccer participation for brain health may be considerable.
References


31. Thompson DC, Thompson RS, Rivara FP. Risk compensation theory should be subject to systematic reviews of the scientific evidence. Inj Prev 2001;7(2):86-8. DOI: 10.1136/ip.7.2.86.


Table 1. Association of participation in collision sports with mortality

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Number of total deaths / Number at risk</th>
<th>All-causes</th>
<th>Non-neurodegenerative disorders</th>
<th>Cardiovascular disease</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Hazard ratios</td>
<td>Hazard ratios</td>
<td>Hazard ratios</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(95% CI)</td>
<td>(95% CI)</td>
<td>(95% CI)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boxing</td>
<td>188/230</td>
<td>1.14 (0.97, 1.33)</td>
<td>0.93 (0.78, 1.11)</td>
<td>1.11 (0.88, 1.39)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wrestling</td>
<td>188/247</td>
<td>0.87 (0.74, 1.02)</td>
<td>0.86 (0.73, 1.02)</td>
<td>0.98 (0.79, 1.22)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soccer</td>
<td>175/248</td>
<td>0.87 (0.74, 1.03)</td>
<td>0.78 (0.65, 0.93)</td>
<td>0.86 (0.68, 1.09)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other collision sports</td>
<td>117/236</td>
<td>0.58 (0.48, 0.70)</td>
<td>0.57 (0.46, 0.70)</td>
<td>0.56 (0.42, 0.75)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-collision sports</td>
<td>756/1044</td>
<td>0.75 (0.66, 0.82)</td>
<td>0.74 (0.66, 0.82)</td>
<td>0.77 (0.67, 0.89)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General population (controls)</td>
<td>1005/1386</td>
<td>1.0 (ref)</td>
<td>1.0 (ref)</td>
<td>1.0 (ref)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Hazard ratios are age-adjusted. CI, confidence interval.
Table 2. Association of participation in collision sports with Alzheimer’s disease according to era of competition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Hazard ratios (95% CI)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1909-1947</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of events / Number at risk</td>
<td>82/1417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boxing</td>
<td>2.72 (1.42, 5.20)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wrestling</td>
<td>1.05 (0.46, 2.38)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soccer</td>
<td>1.43 (0.66, 3.12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other collision sports</td>
<td>0.33 (0.04, 2.40)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-collision sports</td>
<td>0.74 (0.43, 1.28)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General population (controls)</td>
<td>1.0 (ref)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Hazard ratios are age-adjusted. CI, confidence interval
Hazard ratios (HR) are adjusted for age, socioeconomic status, co-morbidities (diabetes, hypertension, and coronary heart disease), and lifestyle factors (alcohol intake, passing out due to alcohol, body mass index, and smoking status). Analytical sample is based on study members with questionnaire data and follow-up starting 1986.
Figure 2. Association of participation in collision sports with Alzheimer's disease

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sport</th>
<th>N events/N at risk</th>
<th>HR</th>
<th>95% CI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boxing</td>
<td>29/131</td>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>2.55-6.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wrestling</td>
<td>24/132</td>
<td>2.11</td>
<td>1.28-3.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soccer</td>
<td>23/148</td>
<td>2.07</td>
<td>1.23-3.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other collision sports</td>
<td>10/170</td>
<td>0.80</td>
<td>0.39-1.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-collision sports</td>
<td>51/612</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>0.55-1.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General population (controls)</td>
<td>51/724</td>
<td>1.00 (ref.)</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Hazard ratios (HR) are adjusted for age, socioeconomic status, co-morbidities (diabetes, hypertension, and coronary heart disease), and lifestyle factors (alcohol intake, passing out due to alcohol, body mass index, and smoking status). Analytical sample is based on study members with questionnaire data and follow-up starting 1986.
Figure 3. Association of participation in collision sports with non-Alzheimer's dementia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>N events/N at risk</th>
<th>HR</th>
<th>95% CI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boxing</td>
<td>30/131</td>
<td>2.62</td>
<td>1.68-4.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wrestling</td>
<td>20/131</td>
<td>1.22</td>
<td>0.73-2.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soccer</td>
<td>20/148</td>
<td>1.23</td>
<td>0.74-2.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other collision sports</td>
<td>14/170</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.47-1.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-collision sports</td>
<td>71/612</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.54-1.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General population (controls)</td>
<td>72/724</td>
<td>1.00 (ref.)</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Hazard ratios (HR) are adjusted for age, socioeconomic status, co-morbidities (diabetes, hypertension, and coronary heart disease), and lifestyle factors (alcohol intake, passing out due to alcohol, body mass index, and smoking status). Analytical sample is based on study members with questionnaire data and follow-up starting 1986.