Is vitamin D deficiency associated with the COVID-19 epidemic in Europe?

Dimitra Rafailia Bakaloudi¹, Michail Chourdakis¹

¹ Laboratory of Hygiene, Social & Preventive Medicine and Medical Statistics, School of Medicine, Faculty of Health Sciences, Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Greece.

Corresponding Author: Michail Chourdakis, Department of Medicine, School of Health Sciences, Aristotle University, University Campus, 54124, Thessaloniki, Greece; Phone: +30 2310 999035, Fax: +30 2312 205270; Email: mhourd@gapps.auth.gr

Short title: Vitamin D and COVID-19 in Europe

Acknowledgements: We would like to most cordially thank Prof. Ranil Jayawardena and Dr. Dhanushya T Jeyakumar for their important contribution in all stages of the manuscript preparation.

Financial Support: This research received no specific grant from any funding agency, commercial or not-for-profit sectors.

Conflict of Interest: None.

Authorship: Conceptualization and methodology, data collection, validation and analysis, writing-Original draft, review and editing: DB, MC

NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.
Abstract

Objective: COVID-19 has emerged as a global pandemic, affecting nearly 80 million people from 218 countries as of December 2020. At the same time, vitamin D deficiency seems to be prevalent among COVID-19 patients. Hence, the association between the prevalence of vitamin D deficiency and COVID-19 infection and mortality among European countries was examined.

Design: A case series and recent literature review study

Settings: Information on prevalence of vitamin D deficiency in each country was retrieved through literature searching on PubMed® database. As of December, 23rd 2020, COVID-19 infections and mortalities per million population were extracted from the Worldometer website, whereas the latitude of each country was taken from the CSGNetwork website. The association between both vitamin D deficiency and COVID-19 infection and mortality were explored using correlation coefficients and scatterplots.

Participants: European Countries-Populations

Results: The range of prevalence of vitamin D deficiency among European countries was 6.9-75.1%, with most countries facing more than 50% of vitamin D deficiency among their population. Significant positive correlations were observed between COVID-19 infections (r=0.82; p<0.001) and mortalities (r=0.53; p=0.05) per million population with the prevalence of vitamin D deficiency. Most of the high latitude countries showed lower rates of COVID-19 infections and mortalities compared to middle latitude countries.

Conclusion: Prevalence of vitamin D deficiency was significantly associated with both infection and mortality rate of COVID-19 among European countries. Thus, it is an important parameter to be considered when implementing preventive measures to mitigate the mortality rate of COVID-19.

Keywords: Vitamin D, deficiency, COVID-19, infections, mortalities, Europe.
Introduction

COVID-19 has become a global public health emergency, affecting more than 80 million people from 218 countries and territories\(^1\) in less than a year since the very first outbreak in Wuhan, China\(^2\). As of December, 23rd 2020, the lowest and highest number of confirmed cases per one million (1M) population, were reported among Oceanic (1380/1M) and North American (36,276/1M) continents respectively\(^3\). This substantial variation in the number of infections and as well as the severity and mortality of the disease can be accredited to several factors both at the state level as well as at an individual level. “State level” parameters include diverse factors, such as a country’s preparedness, actions of the governments, health infrastructure, timing of lockdown, rapid border closures, implementation of social distancing and socioeconomic status\(^4\), while the “individual level” includes the sociodemographic factors and other determinants of health status such as sex, age, chronic diseases, obesity, and malnutrition\(^5,6\).

It is well known that malnutrition constitutes a risk factor for increased mortality and morbidity of several diseases\(^7\). Protein and energy malnutrition, and other specific micronutrient deficiencies have been shown to manifest adverse effects in immunity and thereby exhibit poor prognosis of viral infections\(^8\). Regarding micronutrients, the association between vitamin D (Vit D) deficiency and various diseases’ prevalence and/or severity, such as autoimmune disorders, diabetes and skeletal diseases have been adequately established in the past years\(^9\). However, there is limited evidence with regards to Vit D concentration and preventive and/or curative mechanisms of SARS-CoV-2 infection\(^10\). Recent studies have demonstrated the mechanisms for some possible interactions of serum vitamin D level with COVID-19 infections. Particularly, Vit D modulates the expression of angiotensin-converting enzyme 2 (ACE2), angiotensin (1-7) (Ang (1-7)) and mas receptor (MasR) axis and plays a crucial role in the protection against lung infection\(^11,12\). Thereby it acts as a renin-angiotensin system (RAS) inhibitor in treating COVID-19 patients with underlying comorbidities\(^13,14\), and can lead to a weakening of the cytokine storm and the Acute Respiratory Syndrome (ARS) risk among COVID-19 patients\(^15,16\). Moreover, Vit D is capable of exerting immunomodulatory function and improving mucosal defensive mechanisms and therefore an adequate serum concentration is more likely to be linked to a reduced mortality from respiratory diseases, such as COVID-19\(^17,18\).

In Italy, COVID-19 patients admitted to a Respiratory Intermediate Care Unit (RICU) with severe Vit D deficiency (<10 ng/ml), showed a ten-fold mortality rate compared to those with a serum Vit D concentration >10 ng/ml (p<0.05)\(^15\). Similarly, in a prospective observational study of critically ill patients treated in a multidisciplinary Intensive Care Unit (ICU), it was revealed that all patients who died within 28 days, belonged to the low Vit D group\(^19\). Munshi et al. also found that
COVID-19 patients with poor prognosis had significantly lower serum concentrations of Vit D (p<0.001)\(^{(20)}\).

It is evident that Vit D deficiency could be associated with the severity and mortality of COVID-19. Hence, the aim of this study was to investigate the relationship between country-specific prevalence of Vit D deficiency with regards to infection and mortality rates of COVID-19 among European countries, given the fewer variations in terms of biological, social and economic factors, including health care facilities.

**Methods**

**Data sources and inclusion/exclusion criteria**

Information on COVID-19 infections and mortalities, were retrieved from the Worldometer website, which provides real time statistics\(^{(1)}\). This source contains data derived directly from official government reports of individual countries and/or indirectly through reliable local media resources. In addition, the latitude of each country was recorded from the CSGNetwork website, a reliable open source for the reference of close latitudes and longitudes of countries in the world\(^{(21)}\).

Data on the prevalence of Vit D deficiency among these countries were extracted by conducting a comprehensive electronic search in PubMed\(^{®}\) database. An advanced search was performed at the level of title/abstract by using keywords such as “Vitamin D” or “25-hydroxyvitamin D\(_3\)”, combined with “deficiency”, “prevalence” or “status” and the name of each European country. The final search string and additional information about the search strategy are presented in **Supplementary Table 1**. The search was limited to articles published in the last five years (up to December, 23\(^{rd}\) 2020) and included data only for adult population (>19 years). Following inclusion criteria were applied for the screening of found articles: a) Population-based studies; b) studies reporting non-institutional adults; c) studies defining Vit D deficiency as the serum concentration <20 ng/ml or <50 nmol/l; d) studies reporting Vit D deficiency as the prevalence of the sample population. In addition, conference proceedings, editorials, commentaries, book chapters/book reviews and studies confined to selective sample of community-dwelling people, such as pregnant women, elderly people, and patients with diagnosed illnesses were excluded. Finally, out of the screened articles for each country, the prevalence of Vit D deficiency data was retrieved from the most recently published study, including the most representative sample for each country.

**Data extraction**

For each European country, information on both COVID-19 infections and mortalities per 1M population as of December, 23\(^{rd}\) 2020, were extracted from the Worldometer website\(^{(1)}\) and the latitude was recorded from the CSGNetwork website\(^{(22)}\). From the selected articles reporting Vit D
deficiency among these countries, name of the first author, published year, sample size, age range of
the study population and prevalence of Vit D deficiency were retrieved. All data were extracted by
one reviewer (DB) using a standardized form and were checked for accuracy by a second reviewer
(MC). Discrepancies in the extracted data were resolved by consensus.

Data analysis

The relationship between the prevalence of Vit D deficiency and other dependent variables,
such as total number of COVID-19 infections and mortalities per 1M population were explored with
correlation coefficients. Scatter plots were used to visually represent the correlations and the
outcomes were evaluated by drawing a regression line. In the scatter plots, countries were
differentiated according to their latitude following as; high latitude countries (50°N - 65°N) and
middle latitude countries (35°N - 50°N). All countries were represented by a 3-letter country code
according to the ISO (International Organization for Standardization) 3166, as per the Terminology
Bulletin Country Names and the Country and Region Codes for Statistical Use maintained by the
United Nations Statistics Divisions\(^{(23)}\).

Results

A total of 14 European countries, satisfying the inclusion/exclusion criteria were selected for
the analysis\(^{(24-37)}\) (Table 1). The prevalence of Vit D deficiency ranged from 6.9-75.1% with the
lowest and highest rates reported in Finland and France respectively. In more than half of the
countries, the majority of the adult population was Vit D deficient (i.e. <20 ng/ml or <50 nmol/l). The
size of study population which was used to retrieve data for the prevalence of Vit D deficiency varied
from 222 (United Kingdom) to 74,235 subjects (Italy). As of December, 23\(^{rd}\) 2020, in regard to the
total number of COVID-19 infections per 1M of the total population, Finland reported the lowest
with 6,147/1M, while France had the highest with 38,350/1M infections. In regard to the COVID-19
mortalities per 1M population, the lowest number, was documented in Norway (77 deaths/1M),
whereas the highest number, was reported in Bosnia and Herzegovina (1,173 deaths/1M).

Cases of COVID-19 infections per 1M population displayed a significant, strong positive
correlation (r=0.82; p<0.001) with the prevalence of Vit D deficiency (Figure 1). Moreover, a 67%
of the variation (R\(^2\)=0.67) in total infections was attributed to the high prevalence of Vit D deficiency.
In addition, a sharp upward trend was observed by the regression line resulted from the correlation
analysis and most countries were scattered around the line, with Italy as the single outlier. The
correlation effect noticeably improved to 0.90 after removing the outlier (Italy) from the analysis
(r=0.90; p<0.001; R\(^2\)=0.81).
Among the included European countries, the bottom and the top ends of the regression line were occupied by Finland, a high latitude country (50°N - 65°N) and France, a middle latitude country (35°N - 50°N) respectively, corresponding to the lowest and highest values for both the prevalence of Vit D deficiency and the number of COVID-19 infections per 1M population. High latitude countries showed greater variation in the prevalence of Vit D deficiency as well as in the number of COVID-19 infections. Particularly, the lower end was surrounded mostly by high latitude countries such as Finland, Norway and Ireland, indicating low prevalence of Vit D deficiency and low infection rate. Furthermore, other high latitude countries such as Russia, Denmark and Germany were clustered below the upper middle of the regression line with moderate prevalence of Vit D deficiency and moderate infection rate (Figure 1). However, all the middle latitude countries, except Greece, were located around the top end of the regression line, with higher values for both prevalence of Vit D deficiency and number of COVID-19 infections. In contrast, only two out of six high latitude countries (United Kingdom and Poland) were positioned around the top end of the regression line.

As illustrated in Figure 2, COVID-19 mortality per 1M population was also significantly positively correlated with the prevalence of Vit D deficiency (r=0.53; p=0.05). Most of the countries were scattered around the regression line, indicating 28% variability (R²=0.28) among the mortalities being due to the high prevalence of Vit D deficiency. Similarly to Figure 1, Italy was positioned as the outlier, and the correlation was increased markedly when it was removed from the analysis (r=0.70; p<0.001; R²=0.48). All the high latitude countries except United Kingdom, Poland and Germany, were located below the midpoint of the regression line, indicating the lower prevalence of Vit D deficiency and COVID-19 mortalities. On the contrary, all middle latitude countries, except Greece and Denmark, were found to be clustered around the top end of the line, denoting higher levels for both variables. Notably, in countries such as Denmark and Germany, moderate levels of mortality were observed, despite the higher levels of Vit D deficiency.

Discussion

Our analysis concluded that the prevalence of Vit D deficiency among the European population can be a potential risk factor for both COVID-19 infection and mortality rates. These findings are compatible with the outcomes of prior research works. According to the outcomes of our study, in most of the European countries included in this analysis, more than 50% of the adult population was Vit D deficient, which constitutes an important factor to consider in the planning of public health preventive measures. One of the main reasons for the high prevalence of Vit D deficiency could be the urban lifestyle of the people residing in these countries. Additionally, the fluctuations of sunlight exposure among seasons could also impact the proportion of Vit D deficient population. Especially the negligible amount of sunlight during
winter and cloud covers during summer could potentially reduce the cutaneous synthesis of Vit D in some less south located countries\(^{(41, 43)}\). Furthermore, dietary sources of Vit D are limited and the obesity epidemic in the Europe, which is also related to poorer dietary choices, has worsened its deficiency\(^{(44)}\).

The results of our analysis showed that most of the high latitude European countries (50°N - 65°N) had lower levels of infection and mortality rates, comparatively to the middle latitude ones (35°N - 50°N). This indicates that the latitude of these countries does not impact the prevalence of Vit D deficiency among their population. This result is in accordance with the findings of a study conducted in Honolulu, Hawaii (latitude of 21°N), where 51% of the population reported lower serum concentrations of Vit D, despite the theoretically sufficient UV exposure\(^{(45)}\). Consequently, dietary intake of Vit D is considered to be the crucial factor related to the prevalence of Vit D deficiency among these European countries\(^{(46)}\). However, adequate serum concentrations of Vit D cannot be easily reached only by dietary sources\(^{(47)}\). Therefore, Vit D concentration improvement among the population of these countries should be targeted for as per the food fortification guidelines by the European Calcified Tissue Society (ECTS); at the same time enough attention should be paid to the monitoring of quality assurance in order to prevent intoxication\(^{(48)}\).

Moreover, a similar pattern regarding the positions of the countries in the scatter plots of both COVID-19 infection and mortality rates against the prevalence of Vit D deficiency was observed. Italy was the single outlier in both scatter plots. This could be possible since it was one of the highly affected countries with serious clusters, soon after the breakout of COVID-19 pandemic\(^{(49)}\), but later on both infection and mortality rates were reduced due to new treatment modalities\(^{(50)}\). In addition, the position of Greece on the scatter plots was below the middle of the regression line, representing the moderate rates of COVID-19 infection and mortality, although the prevalence of Vit D deficiency was similar to Italy. The Greek government tried to confront the pandemic by acting at early stages through implementing a strict lockdown and also via effective communication with the public, especially in the context of the predominance of an elderly population and despite the fragile economy\(^{(51)}\).

Differences between the plots were observed only for two countries, in particular Germany and Denmark. These two countries were found to have a relatively lower number of COVID-19 mortalities, despite of the moderate infection rates and the fact that more than 50% of their population presented Vit D deficiency. This outcome could be explained by several factors, such as advanced preventive and curative health policies, strict border closures, swift actions of the government and more importantly, by the early and adequate screening of COVID-19 among their population\(^{(52)}\). Especially in Denmark up to 1,692,090 PCR tests/1M were performed, as of December, 23rd 2020\(^{(1)}\).
Although only 14 European countries satisfied our inclusion criteria, the analysis included nearly 64% of the entire European population\(^3\). Therefore, the results of our study can be generalized to most of the excluded European countries as well. Moreover, along with the majority of high income countries, upper-middle income countries, such as Russia and Bosnia and Herzegovina were also included in the analysis\(^5\), reflecting the effect of economic status in the outcomes. However, most of the data on prevalence of Vit D deficiency among these countries were not generated from national level surveys. Therefore, the very recently published studies with most representative sample of each country population were carefully selected for the analysis. The screened studies were limited to adults (>19 years), as the severity of COVID-19 infections among children was mild\(^5\), but one study included population of 16 years old as well\(^3\). Furthermore, the overall prevalence of Vit D deficiency of the adult population was considered, even though there were considerable variations in the prevalence among different age groups. Similarly, the mean prevalence of Vit D deficiency was considered when different prevalence values were reported among various seasons. In addition, obesity constitutes a confounder of Vit D deficiency, COVID-19 infections and as well as mortalities, but in the outcomes of our study the effects of obesity in both variables were not reflected\(^5\).

Governments should implement proper preventive measures to increase awareness among the populations on the risk of Vit D deficiency and on its role in severity and mortality of the COVID-19 pandemic. People should be encouraged to increase their dietary intake of Vit D, in addition to achieving adequate sunlight exposure. A preferred strategy could be Vit D fortification of foods with the intention to reduce the prevalence of Vit D deficiency. In addition, Vit D supplementation should be advised for those belonging to a high risk group of deficiency, such as new-borns, toddlers, pregnant women, elderly as well as non-Western immigrants\(^4\). Moreover, regular country-wise assessment of Vit D status with standardized 25 (OH)D questionnaires should be encouraged as they can provide insights into future intervention therapies of diseases, such as COVID-19\(^5\).

**Conclusions**

Significant positive correlations were detected between the total number of COVID-19 infections per 1M population \((r=0.82; \ p<0.001)\) and mortality per 1M population \((r=0.53; \ p=0.05)\) with respect to country-specific prevalence of Vit D deficiency among 14 European countries. Most of the high latitude European countries showed less values for both COVID-19 infection and mortality rates, while most of middle latitude countries showed higher values for both variables. Germany and Denmark had lower mortality rates despite moderate levels of COVID-19 infections and prevalence of Vit D deficiency, due to swift government actions, strict border closures and high level of testing.
Abbreviations

1M: One million; 25(OH)D: 25-hydroxyvitamin D₃; ACE2: Angiotensin-Converting Enzyme 2; Ang (1-7): Angiotensin (1-7); ARS: Acute Respiratory Syndrome; COVID-19: Coronavirus disease 2019; ECTS: European Calcified Tissue Society; ICU: Intensive Care Unit; ISO: International Organization for Standardization; MasR: Mas Receptor; PCR: Polymerase Chain Reaction; RAS: Renin-Angiotensin System; RICU: Respiratory Intermediate Care Unit; SARS-CoV-2: Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus; UV: Ultraviolet; UVB: Ultraviolet B; Vit D: Vitamin D.
References


22. Ulmer HE, Knapp WH Scharer K (1975) EXERCISE TESTS AND ECHOCARDIOGRAPHY IN CHILDREN WITH CHRONIC RENAL-FAILURE -CRF. Pediatric Research 9, 855.


**Figure Legends**

**Figure 1:** Scatter diagram of the prevalence of vitamin D deficiency against COVID-19 infections, as of December, 23rd 2020.

**Figure 2:** Scatter diagram of the prevalence of vitamin D deficiency against COVID-19 mortalities, as of December, 23rd 2020.
Table 1: The prevalence of vitamin D deficiency among 14 European countries.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Author, Year</th>
<th>Sample size (M/F)</th>
<th>Age (years)</th>
<th>Prevalence of vitamin D deficiency* (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bosnia and Herzegovina(24)</td>
<td>Sokolovic et al., 2016</td>
<td>2483 (603/1880)</td>
<td>&gt;18</td>
<td>58.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark(25)</td>
<td>Hansen et al., 2018</td>
<td>2565 (1048/1517)</td>
<td>18-69</td>
<td>51.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland(26)</td>
<td>Adebayo et al., 2020</td>
<td>798 (NA)</td>
<td>30-64</td>
<td>6.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France(27)</td>
<td>Deplanque et al., 2017</td>
<td>297 (NA)</td>
<td>18-65</td>
<td>75.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany(28)</td>
<td>Rabenberg et al., 2018</td>
<td>6995 (3360/3635)</td>
<td>18-79</td>
<td>61.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece(29)</td>
<td>Dimakopoulos et al., 2019</td>
<td>1084 (410/674)</td>
<td>≥18</td>
<td>32.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland(30)</td>
<td>Griffin et al., 2020</td>
<td>17590 (NA)</td>
<td>&gt;18</td>
<td>19.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy(31)</td>
<td>Giuliani et al., 2018</td>
<td>74235 (18811/55424)</td>
<td>&gt;18</td>
<td>33.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway(32)</td>
<td>Petrenya et al., 2020</td>
<td>4465 (2041/2424)</td>
<td>40-69</td>
<td>24.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland(33)</td>
<td>Pludowski et al., 2016</td>
<td>5775 (1311/4464)</td>
<td>16-90</td>
<td>65.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal(34)</td>
<td>Duarte et al., 2020</td>
<td>3092 (1907/1995)</td>
<td>≥18</td>
<td>66.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania(35)</td>
<td>Niculescu et al., 2017</td>
<td>812 (NA)</td>
<td>&gt;21</td>
<td>56.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russia(36)</td>
<td>Karonova et al., 2016</td>
<td>1544 (205/1294)</td>
<td>18-75</td>
<td>45.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom(37)</td>
<td>Jolliffe et al., 2016</td>
<td>222 (89/133)</td>
<td>48-94</td>
<td>64.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

F, female; M, male; NA, not available, *Serum 25-hydroxyvitamin D<sub>3</sub> concentration <20 ng/ml or <50 nmol/l.
Figure 1: Scatter diagram of the prevalence of vitamin D deficiency against COVID-19 infections, as of December 23rd 2020.

BIH: Bosnia and Herzegovina; DEU: Germany; DNK: Denmark; FIN: Finland; FRA: France; GBR: United Kingdom; GRC: Greece; IRE: Ireland; ITA: Italy; NOR: Norway; POL: Poland; PRT: Portugal; ROU: Romania; RUS: Russia.

- High latitude countries (50°N - 65°N);
- Middle latitude countries (35°N - 50°N).
Figure 1: Scatter diagram of the prevalence of vitamin D deficiency against COVID-19 mortalities, as of December, 23rd 2020.

BIH: Bosnia and Herzegovina; DEU: Germany; DNK: Denmark; FIN: Finland; FRA: France; GBR: United Kingdom; GRC: Greece; IRE: Ireland; ITA: Italy; NOR: Norway; POL: Poland; PRT: Portugal; ROU: Romania; RUS: Russia.

△ - High latitude countries (50°N - 65°N); ● - Middle latitude countries (35°N - 50°N).

$r=0.53; p=0.05$