The role of pre-existing chronic disease in cardiac complications from SARS-CoV-2 infection: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Jane E. Sinclair¹, Yanshan Zhu², Gang Xu³, Wei Ma³,⁴, Haiyan Shi⁵, Kun-Long Ma⁶, Chun-Feng Cao⁶, Ling-Xi Kong⁶, Ke-Qiang Wan⁶, Juan Liao⁶, Hai-Qiang Wang⁷, Matt Arentz⁸, Meredith Redd⁹, Linda A. Gallo¹⁰, & Kirsty R. Short¹,¹¹*

¹ School of Chemistry and Molecular Biosciences, The University of Queensland, Brisbane Australia

² Guangzhou First People’s Hospital, Guangzhou, Guangdong, China

³ Department of Geriatric Medicine, Guangzhou First People’s Hospital

⁴ School of Medicine, South China University of Technology, Guangzhou, Guangdong, China

⁵ Department of Respiratory Medicine, Guangzhou Eighth People’s Hospital, Guangzhou, Guangdong, China

⁶ Yongchuan Hospital of Chongqing Medical University, Yongchuan, Chongqing, China

⁷ Institute of Integrative Medicine, Shaanxi University of Chinese Medicine, Xi’an Shaanxi Province, China

⁸ Department of Global Health, University of Washington, Seattle, Washington, U.S.A.

⁹ Institute for Molecular Bioscience, The University of Queensland, Brisbane Australia

¹⁰ School of Biomedical Sciences, The University of Queensland, Brisbane Australia

¹¹ School of Public Health, The University of Queensland, Brisbane Australia

* Corresponding author

JES: Bachelors
YZ: Masters
GX: MD
WM: MD
HS: MD
K-LM: MD
C-FC: MD
L-XK: MD
K-QW: MD
JL: MD
H-QW: MD/PhD
MA: MD
MR: PhD
LAG: PhD
KRS: PhD

Word count: 1959
School of Chemistry and Molecular Biosciences, The University of Queensland, Brisbane Australia
Phone: +61 7 336 54226
Email: k.short@uq.edu.au
ABSTRACT

**Importance:** SARS-CoV-2 is associated with multiple direct and indirect effects to the heart. It is not yet well defined whether patient groups at increased risk of severe respiratory disease due to SARS-CoV-2 infection also experience a heightened incidence of cardiac complications.

**Objective:** We sought to analyse the role of pre-existing chronic disease (chronic respiratory illness, cardiovascular disease (CVD), hypertension and diabetes mellitus) in the development of cardiac complications from SARS-CoV-2.

**Data Sources:** We retrospectively investigated published (including pre-prints), publicly released, de-identified, data made available between Dec 1, 2019, and May 11, 2020. Information was accessed from PubMed, Embase, medRxiv and SSRN.

**Study Selection:** 379 full-text articles were reviewed and 321 excluded for lack of original research, irrelevance to outcome, inappropriate cohort, or small patient numbers (case reports of <10 patients). Data were extracted from two studies and the remaining 56 contacted to request appropriate data, to which three responded with data contributions. A final of five studies were included.

**Data Extraction and Synthesis:** This systematic review was conducted based on PRISMA and MOOSE statements. Included studies were critically appraised using Newcastle Ottawa Quality Assessment Scale (NOS). Data were extracted independently by multiple observers. A fixed-effects model was selected for the meta-analysis based on relatively low heterogeneity between the studies ($I^2<50\%$).
Main Outcome and Measures: Cardiac complications were determined via blood levels of cardiac biomarkers above the 99th percentile of the upper reference limit, abnormalities in electrocardiography, and/or abnormalities in echocardiography.

Results: SARS-CoV-2-infected patients who developed cardiac complications were, on average, 10 years older than those that did not. Pooled analyses showed the development of cardiac complications from SARS-CoV-2 was significantly increased in patients with underlying chronic respiratory illness (OR 2.88[1.45,5.71]), CVD (OR 5.12[3.09,8.48]), hypertension (OR 4.37[2.99,6.39]) and diabetes mellitus (OR 2.61[1.67,4.09]).

Conclusions and Relevance: Older age and pre-existing chronic respiratory illness, CVD, hypertension, and diabetes mellitus may represent prognostic factors for the development of additional cardiac complications in COVID-19, highlighting the need for a multidisciplinary approach to chronic disease patient management and providing justification for a larger scale observational study.
INTRODUCTION

SARS-CoV-2 causes a broad range of respiratory symptoms, ranging from subclinical disease to viral pneumonia. However, it is increasingly apparent that SARS-CoV-2 also causes a variety of extra-respiratory complications. Specifically, SARS-CoV-2 infection has been associated with acute myocardial injury, myocarditis, arrhythmias, venous thromboembolism and other de novo cardiac complications. The development of these complications is likely enhanced by experimental testing of antimalarial and antiviral drugs, which have known cardiovascular side effects. Although prevalence estimates vary, data from China suggests that approximately 7% of patients infected with SARS-CoV-2 develop cardiac injury (defined as elevated high-sensitivity cardiac troponin I or new echocardiographic; ECG abnormalities). This prevalence increases to 22% in patients who required ICU care. However, at present, the role of pre-existing chronic disease in the cardiac complications of COVID-19 remains to be elucidated.

Pre-existing chronic respiratory disease, CVD, hypertension and diabetes mellitus have each been associated with increased rates of hospitalization, ICU admission, and death from the respiratory complications of SARS-CoV-2. It is not yet well defined whether these patient groups are also at an increased risk of SARS-CoV-2 associated cardiac injury. Some small studies have shown that patients with pre-existing CVD are at a higher risk of myocarditis and/or myocardial infarction from SARS-CoV-2. A retrospective, single-centre case series of 187 patients with COVID-19 also found that pre-existing CVD increased the risk of cardiac injury (as defined by troponin elevation) (54.5% vs 13.2%) and mortality compared with patients without CVD. Similarly, a meta-analysis of 28 observational studies found SARS-CoV-2 associated cardiac injury biomarkers to be related to a history of hypertension but not diabetes mellitus. In contrast, Zhu and colleagues found that individuals with type 2
diabetes mellitus had a greater occurrence of acute heart injury (7.3% versus 3.0%) than individuals without diabetes.\textsuperscript{30} There is a clear need to better understand the role of patient host factors in the extra-respiratory complications of SARS-CoV-2 infection. Here, we analysed the currently available literature on the role of pre-existing chronic respiratory illnesses, CVD, hypertension and diabetes mellitus in the prevalence of SARS-CoV-2 associated cardiac injury.
METHODS

Study selection

We retrospectively investigated published and pre-printed, publicly released and de-identified data made available between Dec 1, 2019, and May 11, 2020. Information was accessed from four databases (PubMed, Embase, medRxiv and SSRN) using the following search terms: (“covid-19”[All Fields]) OR (“SARS-CoV-2”[All Fields]) OR (“novel coronavirus” [All Fields]) AND (“cardi*”[All Fields] OR "diabetes"[All Fields]). A total of 1124 articles were retrieved after duplicates were removed (available in either English or Chinese), following which 745 records were removed after screening by title and abstract. 379 full-text articles were reviewed. Of these, 321 articles were excluded because i) they did not include original research, ii) they were not relevant to the outcome, iii) they described an inappropriate patient population and/or iv) they described case reports of <10 patients. Of the remaining 58 studies that were deemed eligible, due to their containing data on patient pre-existing disease and cardiac complications as an outcome, two contained the required data format and these were extracted. The authors of the remaining 56 studies were contacted to request appropriate data (as they presented only aggregate data that did not specify the cross-over between pre-existing chronic disease and outcome), to which three groups responded with data contributions. Thus, a final of five studies were included in the meta-analysis (31-35). The selection process is shown in Figure 1.

Data extraction and analysis

Extracted variables were aggregate data of median age, sex, underlying chronic disease (chronic respiratory illness, CVD, hypertension and diabetes mellitus) and the occurrence of cardiac complications as an outcome. Patients with co-morbidities were included in all
applicable categories. For cases in which the data source reported more than one type of co-morbid CVD separately (such as prevalence of both chronic heart failure and coronary heart disease within their cohort), only the group with the most cases was included to avoid patient double up and overrepresentation of co-morbid CVD. Median data for age were analysed individually using a Mann-Whitney U test. R version 4.0.0 software was used to analyse sex distribution as well as pre-existing chronic disease and cardiac outcomes through meta-analysis. Heterogeneity among studies was assessed by using the Q statistic with a P value <.05, indicating the presence of significant heterogeneity, and quantified by using the $I^2$ statistic. A fixed-effects model was used as for all parameters $I^2 < 50\%$.

**Definition of cardiac complications**

Cardiac complications were defined as one or more of the following: blood levels of cardiac biomarkers (TNI or CK-MB) above the 99th percentile upper reference limit, and/or abnormalities observed in clinical assessments of the patients’ heart function, including electrocardiography (ECG) or echocardiography.

**Quality assessment and data synthesis**

The included studies were critically appraised using Newcastle Ottawa Quality Assessment Scale (NOS). High-quality studies were defined as studies fulfilling NOS score of minimum 7. Data were synthesised from five different and high-quality studies. This systematic review was conducted based on the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis (PRISMA) and Meta-analysis of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (MOOSE) statements.
RESULTS

We identified 1124 articles that described pre-existing chronic disease and cardiac complications of SARS-CoV-2, rejected 1066 articles due to a lack of sufficient and/or appropriate data and derived a total of 58 articles. Five of these studies were subsequently used in a meta-analysis (Fig. 1), all of which were high quality (Table 1). Baseline characteristics of the patient populations as well as other relevant data are listed in Table 2. The definition of cardiac complications varied between studies, ranging from acute cardiac injury to fulminant myocarditis. Four of the studies measured cardiac outcomes on the day of admission, while one did not specify the time of assessment. The studies were conducted in two geographical locations (People’s Republic of China and Washington, U.S.A.) with a total of 179 COVID-19 patients developing de novo cardiac complications and 874 COVID-19 patients without de novo cardiac complications. Patients who presented with SARS-CoV-2 associated cardiac complications were, on average, 10 years older than in those who did not (Table 2).

Males were equally represented amongst patients with and without SARS-CoV-2 cardiac complications, both in an individual analysis of the five studies (Table 2) and in a meta-analysis of the pooled data (Fig. 2). In contrast, in a pooled analysis, chronic respiratory illness (OR: 2.88, 95% CI [1.45,5.71]), CVD (OR: 5.12, 95% CI [3.09,8.48]), hypertension (OR: 4.37, 95% CI [2.99,6.39]) and diabetes mellitus (OR: 2.61, 95% CI [1.67,4.09]) were each associated with a higher incidence of SARS-CoV-2 cardiac complications.
DISCUSSION

This meta-analysis shows that older age, and pre-existing chronic respiratory disease, CVD, hypertension and diabetes mellitus are all risk factors for the development of cardiac complications associated with SARS-CoV-2 infection.

A pooled analysis of five studies identified a significant association between pre-existing CVD and the risk of SARS-CoV-2 cardiac complications. This is consistent with previous observations that 30% of patients with SARS-CoV-2 cardiac injury had a history of coronary heart disease. The reason for this association remains unclear. These data may be the result of pre-existing CVD leading to a functionally impaired immune system, excessive cytokine release, endothelial dysfunction, increased procoagulant blood activity, rupturing of coronary atherosclerotic plaques, and the formation of an occlusive thrombi. Furthermore, an acute inflammatory response to SARS-CoV-2 can lead to ischemia in the presence of pre-existing CVD. Thus, SARS-CoV-2 infection may either precipitate a type 1 myocardial infarction, increase myocardial demand leading to worsening ischemia and necrosis (type 2 myocardial infarction), or increase metabolic demand that leads to heart failure and death. An alternative explanation is the elevated levels of myocardial angiotensin-converting enzyme (ACE)-2 in these patients, both as a result of heart failure, post-myocardial infarction, and/or as a consequence of long-term treatment with ACE inhibitors/angiotensin II receptor blockers (ARBs), permitting increased viral entry directly to cardiomyocytes and perivascular pericytes. However, the role of ACE2 in this process remains controversial and requires experimental validation.
The meta-analysis performed herein also found that chronic respiratory illness significantly increased the incidence of SARS-CoV-2 cardiac complications. It is possible that these data reflect the established indirect association between severe respiratory disease and both subsequent acute cardiovascular event and longer-term cardiovascular disease.\textsuperscript{55-59} Specifically, pulmonary damage in individuals with chronic respiratory disease may predispose them to increased hypoxemia upon acute infection, which can then manifest into ischemic heart damage,\textsuperscript{55,58} alteration of right ventricle structure and function,\textsuperscript{58} heart failure,\textsuperscript{56,59} atrial fibrillation,\textsuperscript{59} peripheral vascular disease,\textsuperscript{59} and coronary heart disease.\textsuperscript{56}

However, chronic lung disease has not been consistently associated with SARS-CoV-2 acute respiratory distress syndrome (ARDS) and hypoxemia,\textsuperscript{60} and thus this is unlikely to be the sole explanation for the increased risk of cardiac complications in patients with chronic respiratory illness in the present analysis.

Another mechanism by which chronic respiratory disease may lead to SARS-CoV-2 cardiac complications, by which hypertension and diabetes mellitus may also operate, is endothelial dysfunction whereby alterations at the glycocalyx, intercellular junctions, and vascular endothelial cells promote enhanced leucocyte adhesion and extravasation and induce a procoagulant and antifibrinolytic state.\textsuperscript{61} Furthermore, the endothelium also plays a vital role in cytokine and chemokine release in response to infection, which may be further enhanced in diabetes and hypertension, leading to cardiac complications via the induction of microcirculation disorders and/or myocardial injury.\textsuperscript{62}

The association between underlying diabetes mellitus and cardiac complications from SARS-CoV-2 may be attributable to a multitude of other effects induced by abnormal circulating substrates, including hyperglycaemia, and/or the co-existence and complex interactions with
other, even subclinical, conditions in this patient group. In response to changes in substrate availability, for example, the diabetic heart becomes increasingly dependent on fatty acids as a fuel source, which decreases work efficiency, and dysregulates responses to hypoxia. These metabolic changes may predispose individuals with diabetes to an increased risk of ischemic cardiac injury upon SARS-CoV-2 infection. The contribution of underlying diabetes mellitus to the risk of SARS-CoV-2 cardiac complications, however, depends largely on the duration of pre-existing disease.

There are several limitations in our study. Firstly, the limited number of studies that met the selection criteria meant that it was not possible to correct for other variables that may confound these results. For example, it is possible that our observations were confounded by the strong effect that age has on cardiovascular health. Similarly, we cannot exclude the possibility that the associations observed herein are due, at least in part, to treatments for severe COVID-19 that may damage the heart. Indeed, the experimental therapeutic hydroxychloroquine has been associated with QT interval prolongation, cardiomyopathy and heart failure. This is likewise the case for treatments for underlying conditions, such as ACE inhibitors and ARBs which, while not known to damage the heart, may interfere with how the immune system targets the virus. Information regarding which, if any, therapeutics used in these cohorts of patients was not consistently available. We anticipate that as more data on the cardiac complications become available it will be possible for future analyses to correct for these and other confounders.

A second important limitation of the present analysis is the limited geographical range of the included studies. To encompass important regional and national variations in patient
populations and disease severity it will be necessary to validate these data in other locations as the data becomes available.

Despite the above limitations, these data have important implications for patient care. Patients with one or more underlying medical conditions should be closely monitored for both severe respiratory and extra-respiratory COVID-19 complications. Furthermore, the exploratory use of medications that are independently associated with cardiac complications should be considered with caution in these patient groups and perhaps bypassed in favour of lower-risk treatment options. There is thus a clear need for a multidisciplinary, collaborative team to manage the complexity of COVID-19 illness observed in patients with one or more underlying chronic disease.
**FUNDING**

KRS was supported by the Australian Research Council [DE180100512]. Collection of data contributed by Xu et al. was supported by the Guangzhou Health Research Project, the Guangzhou Health Committee (NO.20191A010014). The sponsors of this study had no role in the study design, collection, analysis, and interpretation of data, report writing, or the decision to submit for publication.

**DECLARATION OF COMPETING INTEREST**

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

**AUTHOR CONTRIBUTION**

Idea and study design: KRS; Data collection and analysis: JES, YZ, GX, WM, HS, K-LM, C-FC, L-XK, K-QW, JL, MA, KRS; Writing the article: JES, KRS; Draft revision: JES, GX, WM, HS, K-LM, C-FC, L-XK, K-QW, JL, MA, MR, LAG, KRS; All authors have read the manuscript and have approved this submission.
REFERENCES


43. Ito T, Akamatsu K, Ukimura A, et al. The prevalence and findings of subclinical


Table 1. Quality assessment of the included studies using the Newcastle Ottawa Scale.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Selection</th>
<th>Comparability</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Xu et al., 2020</td>
<td>****</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ma et al., 2020</td>
<td>****</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liu et al., 2020</td>
<td>****</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shi et al., 2020</td>
<td>****</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arentz et al., 2020</td>
<td>****</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study</td>
<td>Population</td>
<td>Sample size (males)</td>
<td>Age (years)</td>
<td>CC description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xu et al., 2020(^{31})</td>
<td>Adult patients with COVID-19 in Guangzhou, China</td>
<td>12 (6) 253 (116)</td>
<td>62.6±14.5</td>
<td>48.1±15.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ma et al., 2020(^{32})</td>
<td>Adult patients hospitalised with COVID-19 in Yongchuan, Chongqing, China</td>
<td>45 (27) 39 (21)</td>
<td>51 (45.5-63.5)</td>
<td>45 (39-53)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liu et al., 2020(^{33})</td>
<td>COVID-19 patients from Shenzhen Third People’s Hospital in Shenzhen, China</td>
<td>1 (1) 11 (7)</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>62 (36-65)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shi et al., 2020(^{34})</td>
<td>Consecutive severe COVID-19 inpatients of Renmin Hospital, Wuhan University, China</td>
<td>106 (58) 565 (264)</td>
<td>73 (66-80)</td>
<td>57 (43-70)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arentz et al., 2020(^{35})</td>
<td>Critically ill COVID-19 patients admitted to Evergreen Hospital ICU, Washington State</td>
<td>15 (8) 6(3)</td>
<td>74 (61-82)</td>
<td>69.5 (66-73)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CC: cardiac complications. ICU: intensive care unit.
Figure 1. The Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-analyses (PRISMA) flowchart of study selection.
### Figure 2. Forest plots of risk factors in COVID-19 patients with cardiac complications. Fixed effect models apply when $I^2 < 50\%$.

#### A. Male sex

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Experimental Events</th>
<th>Control Events</th>
<th>Odds Ratio</th>
<th>OR 95%-CI (random)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Xu 2020</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>1.18</td>
<td>[0.37; 3.76]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ma 2020</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>1.29</td>
<td>[0.54; 3.06]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liu 2020</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td>[0.06; 54.33]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shi 2020</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>322</td>
<td>1.38</td>
<td>[0.91; 2.09]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arenz 2020</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>[0.17; 7.60]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Fixed effect model**

511

**Random effects model**

542

Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 0\%, \chi^2 = 0.13$ ($p = 1.00$)

#### B. Chronic respiratory illness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Experimental Events</th>
<th>Control Events</th>
<th>Odds Ratio</th>
<th>OR 95%-CI (random)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Xu 2020</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4.51</td>
<td>[0.48; 41.95]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ma 2020</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.32</td>
<td>[0.21; 8.35]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liu 2020</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>68.06</td>
<td>[39.56; 495.16]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shi 2020</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>4.42</td>
<td>[1.89; 10.37]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arenz 2020</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0.67</td>
<td>[0.10; 4.48]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Fixed effect model**

44

**Random effects model**

1009

Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 36\%, \chi^2 = 6.21$ ($p = 0.18$)

#### C. Cardiovascular disease

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Experimental Events</th>
<th>Control Events</th>
<th>Odds Ratio</th>
<th>OR 95%-CI (random)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Xu 2020</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2.21</td>
<td>[0.26; 18.82]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ma 2020</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.32</td>
<td>[0.21; 8.35]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liu 2020</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>[0.02; 16.77]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shi 2020</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>6.49</td>
<td>[3.71; 11.36]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arenz 2020</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>24.82</td>
<td>[1.17; 527.12]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Fixed effect model**

90

**Random effects model**

963

Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 35\%, \chi^2 = 6.01$ ($p = 0.20$)

#### D. Hypertension

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Experimental Events</th>
<th>Control Events</th>
<th>Odds Ratio</th>
<th>OR 95%-CI (random)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Xu 2020</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>2.97</td>
<td>[0.91; 9.77]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ma 2020</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>[0.75; 12.00]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liu 2020</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>[0.03; 25.10]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shi 2020</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>4.62</td>
<td>[3.03; 7.13]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arenz 2020</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>24.00</td>
<td>[2.04; 282.67]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Fixed effect model**

281

**Random effects model**

773

Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 33\%, \chi^2 = 6.01$ ($p = 0.20$)

#### E. Diabetes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Experimental Events</th>
<th>Control Events</th>
<th>Odds Ratio</th>
<th>OR 95%-CI (random)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Xu 2020</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>2.78</td>
<td>[0.56; 13.70]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ma 2020</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9.50</td>
<td>[1.15; 78.80]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liu 2020</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.27</td>
<td>[0.04; 41.56]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shi 2020</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>2.11</td>
<td>[1.27; 3.53]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arenz 2020</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11.47</td>
<td>[0.55; 239.86]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Fixed effect model**

135

**Random effects model**

918

Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 0\%, \chi^2 = 3.17$ ($p = 0.53$)